Jordan University College

THE REFLECTION MEDIUM

AFRICA TOMORROW

Inculturation is a difficult and delicate task, since it raises the question of the Church's fidelity to the Gospel and the Apostolic Tradition amidst the constant evolution of cultures.

Ecclesia in Africa, 62

Vol. 16 / No. 2 / December 2014

SALVATORIANUM

Published by: SALVATORIANUM
Jordan University College
P.O. Box 1878
Morogoro, TANZANIA

Tel.: +255 23 2604854
E-mail: salvatorianum@juco.ac.tz
info@juco.ac.tz
Web: www.juco.ac.tz

Cover designed by Fr. Stanislaw Golus, SDS
ISSN 1821-8083

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Editorial

Dear Readers,

This issue focuses on living the truth with love and joy. Who does not wish to be loved? Who is not willing to love especially when one has been receiving thoughtful attention and tender affection from a person happy to be his/her lover?

We do not hesitate to ask the more fragile question: Is the love real? If I feel loved, is the other's love for me authentic – is it really founded on the truth? Or do we not have to wonder sometimes whether a particular individual's love is a charade, a mirage, a subtle cover-up of a vapid, stifling self-centredness?

Father Bednarz reminds us that what the Salvatorian Sisters did in China was bear witness to the love of Jesus Christ among a population of people who lived sometimes in an atmosphere of fear, suspicion, and outright hostility. There seemed to be Chinese leaders intent on ignoring the purity and devotion that invigorated the Sisters' service of love and compassion to the needy. Leaders seemed irritated when they perceived effective energy at work within a religious community, a community united charismatically in mind and heart, living daily according to the ethic of generosity and self-sacrifice.

Even within this anxiety-provoking atmosphere the Salvatorian Sisters brought food, clothing and shelter to the orphan children and others who lacked it; health to the physically ill; mental and emotional stability to the mentally and emotionally distraught; a rigorous ethical code actualized according to the divine principles of the Gospel to those suffering ethical confusion; and a spirit of love and joy to those who yearned to know and live the truth.

The tender love that imbued the hearts of the Sisters and created an oasis of joy within a dark, very fear-provoking atmosphere is a love that expressed itself in a generosity without limits. The Sisters did not impose borders or frontiers on their love: their love was a lavish dissemination of Jesus' charismatic gifts to all the people they served especially the voiceless and the most vulnerable. This is a generosity, rooted in the Holy Spirit, that God himself advocates as desirable human behaviour. This is what Father Bernard Witek, the Principal of Jordan University College, illustrates in very precise, rigorous fashion in his exegesis and interpretation of a cluster of verses from the Book of Proverbs. He also points out that by means of these verses God himself is giving a message to the greedy person: he or she will inspire hatred in the ones he or she is harming, and the divine Lord indicates that He will respond with wrath to such wicked behaviour.

The Spirit is given to us as love that forever pours itself out (Rom 5:5) so that we may be witnesses to God's own love in the world even to the point when we may have to die in order to ignite that love as a purifying energy/dynamic in the world (cf., Acts 7:55-60). Father Mukadi explains how Pope Francis speaks with joy about this love, about the love that so invigorates the Church that she comes to a new birth beautifully identifiable as the Family of God.

Indeed the Pope's insistence that Africans (even if they may not be explicitly Catholic) be teachers and models for the world so that the world may come to know that the Church is God's Family, and that God intends to include everyone in that family – this insistence itself is coming from the Holy Spirit. This is why Father Mukadi reminds us that Pope Francis is not just repeating formulae or recalling images in order to give us ideas – no. Pope Francis is communicating to us precisely those images and convictions that give him personal joy. It is joy in the Holy Spirit, the Holy Spirit whose eternal intention is to cradle us lovingly in the truth and to breathe eternal joy into our lives as we find ourselves so cradled.

This is the joy of Amazement Ndungane and Daniel Tholley whom Father Gibson presents as two convincing examples of African youth who have submitted themselves humbly and thoughtfully to the imperatives of divine wisdom and love. Their way of making personal choices suggests that one cannot be a loving, compassionate witness to the truth if one relies on one's own cognitive processes as starting points.

Amazement and Daniel prove to be a foil to such rationalist philosophers as Kant and Hegel who embed the development of the human person in the capabilities of autonomous rational consciousness positioned at a distance from any ecclesial, political or even divine authority. Gibson presents two studies from social psychology that at first seem to verify the moral problems that ensue when one surrenders one's autonomy to conform to authority's directives. Yet a closer examination of these studies and a penetrating gaze at a historical situation that actually gave rise to the studies seem to obviate the inference that authority itself should be the issue of concern.

The real issue rather is the refusal to rely on divine authority, and the consequent reliance on an authority that presumes to be independent of divine wisdom – this includes relying on the authority of one's own intelligent reasoning. Kazimierz Mazur draws out the disastrous implications of this reliance on one's own mindset and ideology independent of divine authority when the topic of concern is sexual identity and gender manipulation.

Mazur perceives a reason for hope in the choice to be attentive to those who hold the privilege and the responsibility of communicating divine truth to the human family. He bases his recommendations on authoritative pronouncements of the Polish Bishops' Conference and the Holy See. Father Gibson borrows specifically from the experience and insights of Mother Teresa, Edith Stein, Paul Ricœur, Bernard Lonergan, and Tailay Mkuna (an alumna of JUCO) to highlight the advisability of reliance on divine authority.

Divine authority is the source of the joy that presents Pope Francis, Amazement, Tholley, Mother Teresa and Jesus himself as quite emotionally intelligent. How emotions interweave with cognitive processes – either to stabilize them, facilitate them, confuse them, or scramble them – this is the very enlightening topic of Father Abraham's compact but instructive article.

And now, esteemed reader, I bring this short editorial to a close by recommending the article that opens this issue. Having produced a very timely article indeed, our esteemed authors Job Wilson Mwakapina and Abdulkarim Shaban Mhandeni of Sokoine University of Agriculture speak of avenues for augmenting the joy of Tanzanian students at all levels. How might they augment this joy? By taking advantage of every academic tool that their instructors, principals, supervisors and caregivers provide for them. A principal tool for achieving intellectual, moral and psychosocial integrity is that of language.

The authors focus on proficiency in English. It is not difficult for any of us to realize that they could be speaking about Kiswahili or any other language. French, for example, comes to mind… but so does the language of the tribe to which a Tanzanian woman, man or child may belong. Proficiency in more than one language proves useful in professions, careers, positions of service to one's family, one's community, one's region, one's country and one's world.

As Father Mukadi and Pope Francis have insisted, we are all one family: to be able to communicate with each other by methods and means that reflect a great versatility in language usage and a great love for the people with whom one is communicating – nurturing such an ability brings joy to the hearts of all of us… has this joy reached your heart yet, brother, sister?

The Editor

PHILOSOPHY & HUMAN SCIENCE

The Influence of Language of Instruction on Students' Academic Outcomes: The Experience of Secondary Schools in Morogoro, Tanzania

Job Wilson Mwakapina & Abdulkarim Shaban Mhandeni

Faculty of Social Sciences
Sokoine University of Agriculture, Morogoro, Tanzania

Abstract

Many have ascribed the poor performance that secondary school students in Tanzania have suffered in various school subjects in the national examinations to the students' weakness in English, the Language of Instruction (LoI). This brief paper seeks to determine the influence of LoI on students' academic success in secondary schools. An English Language Proficiency Test (ELPT) and students' academic archival reports provided the data and a Statistical Package for Software System (SPSS) facilitated data analysis. Analysis brought to light the finding that proficiency in LoI affects performance only to a slight extent. Non-ELP factors exert a stronger influence on performance in subjects other than English while – not surprisingly – English proficiency does indeed exercise much influence on English achievement. The study concludes that academic performance is a function of several variables and that ELP plays a role in performance but not the major role. The study recommends that the government (1) emphasize the improvement of ELP, since the greater the improvement, the more a positive influence may be anticipated; and (2) consider using ELP as an additional eligibility criterion for admission into higher education.

1. Introduction

Tanzania, like several other countries, requires students to enter the university with a basic level of competence in four distinct English language skills: reading, speaking, writing and listening. To enter universities on other continents, students coming from non-English speaking countries must provide evidence of proficiency in the English language before being admitted (Dooey and Oliver, 2002). The two most popular tests for this purpose are the Test of English as a Foreign Language (TOEFL) and the International English Language Testing System (IELTS). The ELP of prospective and incoming university students is therefore a critical determinant in predicting their success in graduate studies. The only differences between Tanzanian universities and universities on other continents where proficiency testing is concerned are: first, those Tanzanian universities doing ELP testing do it for screening purposes while in the universities found overseas the testing is for admission. Next, the English Language Proficiency Test (ELPT) in Tanzania evaluates mainly grammar and vocabulary skills in a written format. At the Sokoine University of Agriculture (SUA), for instance, entrants are given screening tests; the results show substantial increases in the number of new entrants who fail. Consequently, most of them are being advised to register for the intensive grammar programme or for Communication Skills 1.

Tanzania basically does not use ELP as one of her admission criteria, but rather uses O-level and A-level NECTA results as a key criterion when admitting candidates for advanced studies or for a college programme. The assumption is that students' scores on these tests prior to the learning for which these tests are intended to qualify them are significant in predicting the final score or success of these same students in the final examinations administered on other levels, such as in A-level universities and colleges. Therefore, the scores of students in O-level or A-level NECTA results ought to be significant in foretelling what a student will score eventually in A-level final evaluations or in their final scores at the university.

The public and some scholars, however, blame English as the cause of underachievement because students are admitted into various levels with poor grades in English. Indeed they cannot express themselves in English, the language that is supposed to be transmitting knowledge to them.

Good performance on the part of students is essential for the personal development of individuals and for the social and economic development of society-at-large. Here in Tanzania, poor students' academic performance in most secondary schools is a growing problem and is now at an alarming rate. Because this is the case, affluent parents have lost trust in the public schools and are now taking their children to the private schools; some send their children abroad. One of the factors frequently mentioned as to why they don't want to take their children to public schools is that the English taught there is not up to par. As a result, there is a fear that if their children were to go to the public schools, they would not be proficient in English, and thus would fail to keep up with the pace of the teaching and learning processes at more advanced institutions.

It is obvious that Tanzania like other multilingual societies in the world has not eluded the problem of language of education. In the country, the Language of Instruction (LoI) in primary schools is different from that of schools on the secondary and tertiary levels. English is the LoI of secondary schools and higher learning institutions while Kiswahili is used in the primary schools.

The LoI, for more than 50 years since independence has always been a matter of public debate. There is an opinion that we can get rid of English as the LoI because even after students take courses that focus on English, they nevertheless manifest weak proficiency.

Actually, students' success in school depends upon their proficiency in the LoI (Mvungi, 1982; Osbiston, 1980). The LoI plays a crucial role in learning: Malekela (2003), for example, argues that if the learner is handicapped in the LoI, then learning may not take place because the instructor and the learner will not be communicating with each other. Therefore, the overall performance of students seems to depend extensively on the LoI.

Poor performance in the country is not restricted only to secondary schools where English is the LoI, but also to primary schools where English is not the LoI. This really raises a crucial question as to whether English really is the genuine cause of poor performance in secondary schools as critics tend to claim. One would expect primary school pupils to perform well because they are taught in Kiswahili, which is our *lingua franca*[1] and a first language for some.

But this has not been the case. In recent years, the examination board has been frequently reporting on poor primary school results.

In the present article, therefore, language proficiency should generally be understood as the overall ability/versatility of an individual in the use of language. An English Language Proficiency Test (ELPT) is to be understood as a test for proficiency that is organised systematically into listening, reading, writing and speaking skills. Academic outcome[2] is intended to mean the result of academic work undertaken by a student and is defined in terms of the scores that a student is able to garner after a certain period of learning. Language of Instruction (LoI) simply refers to the language utilised in the process of teaching and learning; in other words, it is the medium of instruction.

2. Problem Statement

Many students in Tanzania complete various levels with poor grades or scores in English and in other subjects like Mathematics, Biology, Chemistry, and History, to mention but a few. As a result, many of these students resort to reseating. Having repeated one or several courses, only a very few successfully pass and have the opportunity to continue with A-level studies or with a college education. As Kagashe reports in a January, 2011, issue of *The Citizen*, for instance, from among 397,251 students who sat for the national examinations in 2010, a total of 174,193 (43.83%) of the students failed the examinations (i.e., they scored division zero); and 223,058 – in other words, 56.15% – passed the examinations.

[1] Lingua franca is a language used among people whose main languages are different. Most Tanzanians have their own mother tongue (like Kisafwa, Kibena, Kisukuma, Kikinga, Kizigua, Kimakonde, and so forth) while Kiswahili is a common language; for some Kiswahili is their mother tongue.

[2] In this study academic achievement or academic performance and academic outcome are used synonymously to mean scores or grades achieved or realised by assessing or examining the ability displayed through speaking or writing what one has learnt in the classroom.

The average pass mark dropped from 52.83% in 2009 to 50.40% in 2010.

The trend did not seem to change in succeeding years: the students who sat for Form Four examinations in 2012 produced very poor results. Siyame (2013) reports that from among 397,136 students who sat for the examinations, 240,903 got division zero – 60% – and those who got division I – III were less than even 6%. The results were so devastating that the government decided to lower the standards – to lower the cut-off points –so that students could be admitted to Form Five and other levels even though by the standards of previous years they would not have been allowed to do so.[3] This is to say that without lowering the cut-off points or curving the scores it would have turned out that some schools and colleges would have had no candidate or very few candidates to enter A-level or college education.

Scholars have given this problem of poor performance and decrease of quality of education considerable attention (Omari 1995; Osaki 1999 and Wilson 2011). The performance of students in the CSSE has been of humiliating dimensions for the three consecutive years 2010, 2011 and 2012. The publication of these embarrassing results has fuelled fierce discussion and raging debates about the possible causes. In fact, these debates and discussions have often been ascribing the poor performance on the part of the students to weakness in English language proficiency since this is the language through which knowledge transmitted to learners.

Generally speaking, most language experts in Tanzania have so far been considering lack of proficiency in English as a factor for the underachievement of most students at higher levels of education because students fail to learn effectively when the sole medium of instruction is English. Often teachers feel compelled to use Kiswahili to clarify what they are trying to teach in English (Jones, Rubagumya and Mwansoko, 1998). Hence, in most classes code switching is unofficially the continuing paradigm for teaching academic subjects.

---

[3] In such a problematic situation one may choose to curve the scores: this is usually done according to the parameters of a bell curve (Editor’s Note).

Despite the ongoing debates about the LoI – debates that have continued unabated since independence – researchers know little about the influence of ELP on academic performance or on whether scores in English proficiency correlate with actual ability in English language usage. Very little has been investigated to ascertain whether scores the students achieve in language reflect their ability in the language. The few studies that indeed focused on this problem did not seem to shed any light on the matter (Jones, Rubagumya and Mwansoko, 1998; Mvungi, 1982; Roy-Campbell and Qorro, 1997). There were others, however, that arrived at the noteworthy conclusion that English was not to be blamed (see, for example, Kadeghe, 2000).

Actually, the problem of poor performance of public secondary school students is not limited to Tanzania. According to Ajayi, a Nigerian scholar, public schools in Nigeria have been persistently experiencing mass failure in public examinations. The researcher argues that the factors affecting the situation are multi-dimensional in nature in the sense that they range from either positive or negative influences on the part of parents, students, teachers, schools, government and the society-at-large (Ajayi, 2012).

It is the intent of this present paper, therefore, to examine to what extent the English language is the culprit to be blamed for the mass failures that have been occurring time and time again. Does English deserve the suspicion that the public and some scholars are giving it as if it were the only cause for the failures?

3. Theoretical Considerations

We have been indicating repeatedly that the poor performance of secondary school students in various subjects in the national examinations has often been ascribed to their weaknesses in the English language. The insinuation is that the LoI has a marked influence on the students' academic success. The increasing failure of students in courses that concentrate on the English language together with their failures in other school subjects and the ensuing downfall of education in general has inspired scholarly discussions on the possible factors of such a dismal situation, a situation that seems to have prevailed since the 1980s.

It is a matter of course that various studies reveal that most Tanzanian students have low levels of ELP. Scholars like Mvungi (1982) and Osbiston (1980) argue that proficiency in the LoI is an important factor in general academic performance; hence lack of proficiency in English results in poor performance in other academic subjects.

Table 1 below shows that in 2010 a total of 334,531 students from the Tanzania Mainland sat for national examinations among whom 1.58% scored Division I, 2.92% Division II, 7.10% Division III, 37.70% Division IV and 50.70% failed. In 2011, a total of 324,421 sat for CSEE among whom 1.11% of students scored Division I, 2.47% Division II, 6.47% Division III and 42.64% Division IV while 47.30% failed. The failure tallies, 50.70% in 2010 and 47.30% in 2011, are high. Indeed the data presented in the table clearly show that the general performance in the CSEE was poor in both years. The majority of the candidates scored Division IV which corresponds to a marginal pass; the rest scored Division 0, that is to say, they "Failed". When the percentages of the marginal pass tally (Division IV) and the failure tally (Division 0) are combined, the resulting percentages, 88.40% in 2010 and 89.30% in 2011 represent students who performed either on the borderline or below it. Currently the CSEE results are becoming even worse year after year. For example, the results of 2012 were the worst ever recorded by the national examinations board. When scholars and the general public review the total configuration of scores for recent years, they seem to rush to the conclusion that the problem rests with poor ELP on the part of the students.

3.1 Previous Studies on Prediction of Academic Outcomes

Prediction of academic outcome refers to the act of foretelling what a student will score at the end of the course of study because particular tests given to students are significant in forecasting the final scores of such students in the final examinations. Dooey and Oliver (2002) did their study on "the predictive validity of the [International English Language Testing Service] (IELTS) test as an indicator of future academic success". The purpose of their study was to investigate how accurate IELTS is, as a predictor of performance and success in the school of business, science and engineering. To do this, a small-scale quantitative study was carried out amongst first year undergraduate students from diverse non-English speaking backgrounds who were admitted to their academic programmes on the basis of their IELTS scores. The findings showed little evidence that the IELTS could support the hypothesis that language proficiency is a predictor for academic success. It is possible that these results are the consequence of involving students in the study who in fact came from a broad range of various backgrounds, age groups, faculties and departments. This confirmed previous research findings which suggested that language is only one among many important contributing factors.

In 2006, Woodrow investigated the predictive validity of the IELTS test on students' success at the university. IELTS subtest scores were correlated against students' first semester Grade Point Average (GPA), which Woodrow considered to be a reliable criterion for the level of academic achievement for that particular semester.

Year			**Divisions**		
			I	**II**	**III**
2011	Girls	No.	1,073	2,405	6,347
		%	0.78	1.74	4.59
	Boys	No.	2,538	5,595	14,652
		%	1.36	3.00	7.87
	Total	No.	3,611	8,000	20,999
		%	1.11	2.47	6.47
2010	Girls	No.	1,457	2,862	7,547
		%	0.96	1.89	4.97
	Boys	No.	3,814	6,896	16,198
		%	2.09	3.77	8.87
	Total	No.	5,271	9,758	23,745
		%	1.58	2.92	7.10

IV	**O**	**I-III**	**I-IV**	**All Levels**
2011	**2011**	**2011**	**2011**	**2011**
G 54,941	73,482	9,825	64,766	**138,248**
% 39.74	53.15	7.11	46.85	
B 83,402	79,986	22,785	106,187	**186,173**
% 44.80	42.97	12.24	57.03	

T 138,343	153,468	32,610	170,953	**324,421**
% 42.64	47.30	10.05	52.69	
2010	**2010**	**2010**	**2010**	**2010**
G 51,459	88,503	11,866	63,325	**151,828**
% 33.89	58.29	7.82	41.71	
B 74,699	81,096	26,908	101,607	**182,703**
% 40.89	44.39	14.73	55.61	
T 126,158	169,599	38,774	164,932	**334,531**
% 37.71	50.70	11.59	49.30	

Table 1: Mainland Tanzania School Candidates, CSEE 2010-2011: Performance by Divisions (See: NECTA Stats, 2012)

The results of this 2006 study indicated that the level of English Language Proficiency, as measured by the IELTS, moderately predicted academic achievement in the first semester of study for the students sampled. In this study, the overall IELTS represented 16% of the variance in academic achievement as measured by the first semester GPA. The results are consistent with those of other studies that indicate that variables other than language proficiency are relevant.

Woodrow examined other variables including professional experience. However, there seemed to exist no significant correlational relationship between these variables and the first semester GPA. The analysis indicated that at a lower level of English, the relationship is stronger than at a higher level. Thus, for students scoring 6.5 or lower, proficiency may influence their achievement, whereas with students scoring 7 and above, English proficiency does not influence academic performance. Woodrow concluded by stating the obvious: academic achievement is a complex issue. Her study found that proficiency in the English language, particularly at the low end of the proficiency scale, may be related to performance; and that academic achievement for international students is depends partly on language proficiency.

A lot of studies in other parts of the world show that LoI has a role to play in educational success (Bellingham 1993; Elder 1993; Allwright and Banerjee 1997 and Cotton and Conrow, 1998). From these studies conducted in the developed world, it can be concluded that a relationship exists between the language proficiency scores of students instructed in English and their eventual academic performance. With particular reference to Tanzania, several studies on academic achievement have concentrated on finding factors affecting poor performance in science subjects (Chonjo and Welford, 2001), in medical education (Leshabari and Masesa, 2000) and in teachers' education (Dasu, 2001). Osaki (1997) studied the relationship between CSEE results and one's final degree classification. More significantly, Ndabi (1987) observed that Form Four results in individual subjects correlated significantly with the results in the corresponding Form Six subjects. Ndabi concluded that the CSEE results predicted students' academic performance in subjects that concerned the sciences.

In contrast, Ndabi (1989), investigating the relationship between Qualifying Tests (QT) and CSEE results (for the period from 1980 to 1982), found that QT could be used to predict the performance of CSEE candidates. This seemed to indicate that helpful data about the predictive power of proficiency in LoI on academic outcomes could have been available in previous years but researchers simply had not applied themselves to this issue.

Dooey and Oliver observed that there is no significant relationship between language proficiency and academic achievement; Criper and Dodd (1984), on the other hand, realised that there is a substantial gap between the students' proficiency in English and the kind of facility necessary for English to be a useful tool for studies in Tanzania. Woodrow noticed that at lower levels of English proficiency, the lack of this language skill plays a detrimental influence on achievement.

Fakeye and Ogunsiji (2009) observed that ELP has a significant impact on academic achievement. A synopsis of all the studies pertaining to our topic manifests a conflict in the findings and hence calls for further research. All the studies, especially those conducted in Tanzania that concern prediction of performance, conclude that when the causative factors are addressed, better academic achievement will be attained. It must be noted, however, that none of these studies seemed to have the capacity to predict what learning approach could be unequivocally advantageous for academic achievement; nor did any of these studies show convincing evidence of the influence of LoI on academic outcome.

In fact, with particular reference to Tanzania, the question about whether ELP can predict academic performance becomes a complicated one since for most students English is a third language. For only a few, is it a second language. What creates even further complications is that in the villages students are exposed to the English language by and large only in the classroom, while outside the classroom, Kiswahili predominates.

Therefore, our present study targets the issue of the influence of English language proficiency on secondary school students' ability to perform academically – that is to say, the study focuses on the power of ELP to predict academic achievement.

4. Study Methodology

4.1 Study Area, Sampling and Study Design

The study was conducted in Morogoro, Tanzania. The Morogoro Urban District served as the study site since the area has a big number of poorly performing schools and is among the regions showing a trend of poor performance in CSEE (URT, 2010). This district has an annual growth rate of 2.6% and is situated on the lower slopes of Uluguru Mountains; it covers an area of 260 km^2 (URT, 2010).

Purposive sampling was the technique used for selecting the site and the population that would take part in the study. The participants were from Morogoro Secondary School. The researchers selected students whose academic achievement test scores in English and General Studies (final examination results) were available in their progress report forms. That is to say, those whose test scores were not available in the students' progress reports were not involved. General Studies was used as a representative subject for the other non-selected subjects because it is the subject which – as the title of the course indicates – involves all the students irrespective of whether they belong to the science or arts streams.

The target population in this study consisted of the Form Five advanced level male and female students. These students were deemed appropriate to provide data for the study since A-level students, unlike those of Form One, have greater exposure to English as the medium for learning. One secondary school that enrols students from various parts of Tanzania, from both government and private O-level schools, was involved because its students came from diverse sectors of the country.

The study involved both a correlational research design and a cross-sectional design. Even though correlational research designs do not automatically produce cause-effect relationships, the researcher considered it appropriate to use the data offered by a correlational research design to bring forth a rough estimate of the predictive power of language proficiency on academic performance. In any event, the research also intended to assess the strength of the relationship between these two variables. The objectives of this study, therefore, determined the feasibility of this choice.

A cross-sectional design was used in order to bring forth data that might be representative of a much larger population than just the sample under study: this design typically includes either the entire population or a selected subset; from the selected individuals, data are collected to answer the research questions of interest. Cross-sectional design focuses on looking at how variables are related to each other at a specific point in time.

The study employed an ELPT and a documentary review in the data collection process. In order to ensure the reliability and the validity of the instruments, the ELPT was piloted in the private school that is nearest to the field school. The problems discovered during the pilot study helped in the re-arrangement of questions and phraseology to suit the Tanzanian context. The students' progress reports were reviewed to collect the secondary data for academic achievement scores of English and General Studies and the test for language proficiency was administered to all the sampled students. ELPT was used because ELP is considered a good indicator and predictor of academic achievement of students who are instructed in English (Bellingham 1993; Cotton and Conrow 1998; Feast 2002; Fakeye and Ogunsiji 2009).

The ELPT was a modified version of the TOEFL test. Modifying the TOEFL seemed necessary because the local proficiency test system is not standardized and is mostly grammar-based – i.e., it excludes other skills like speaking and listening.

In Tanzania, English for most speakers is a second or even a third language; hence either TOEFL or IELTS is an appropriate test to use in assessing the proficiency level of the students. The ELPT used was a hybrid of a variety of TOEFL tests found online[4]. Another justification for modifying the test in this fashion was that some of the tests involved sections that were difficult to complete using a pen and paper because they were originally intended to be completed and assessed through Internet-Based Language Testing (IBLT) software.

The subjects' academic performance evaluations were correlated with the proficiency test scores to determine whether a significant relationship existed and the extent of the relationship. A linear regression analysis was conducted with the help of the Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS) to determine the impact of ELP on students' overall academic achievement. With the help of a coefficient of determination (r^2), regression analysis helped to ascertain to what extent a change in academic achievement is explained by language proficiency. In other words, r^2 is used to determine what percentage of the variance of one variable can be appropriately explained, predicted or accounted for by the variance of another variable.

4.2 The Study

The data for the study were collected for three weeks during February and March, 2011. The study involved 89 students, all of whom were from the arts combinations. A-level students were selected since they are prospective university students: after a short time, they would be joining various universities within the nation or overseas where they would be given ELPTs to ascertain if they can cope with university studies.

Most of the A-level students in Tanzania have been learning through the medium of English for a suitably long time; hence they are assumed to have an adequate degree of proficiency and competency in the English language. Each student's scores on the final examinations (of English and General Studies), therefore, were correlated and analysed by means of linear regression analysis with proficiency measures.

[4] Free Practice Test for Learners of English found at http://www.examenglish.com/TOEFL/index.php

The study proceeded according to the hypothesis that to a large extent the ELP of Tanzanian secondary school students does not influence or predict – nor does it have any significant effect – on academic achievement. In statistics, a result is statistically significant if it is unlikely to have occurred by chance (Bryars, 1983). The amount of evidence required to accept that an event is unlikely to have arisen by chance is known as the critical probability value (p-value). The significance level is usually taken to be 0.05(5%), though sometimes more rigorous research analyses may require 0.01(1%) or 0.001(0.1%) (Bryars, 1983). When the p-value is less than the level of significance determined beforehand, whether it is at the 0.05 level or significance or at the 0.01 level ($p < 0.05$ or $p < 0.01$), the result is said to be significant (Sanders and Smidt, 2000).

The p-value also depends on whether one deals with one–tailed test or two–tailed test. When one already knows in what direction a correlation should be proceeding – for example, one knows that if one variable increases, the other should be increasing – one uses the one-tailed test. In contrast, if one is not sure whether one variable will increase according to the increase of the other variable or whether the first variable will decrease as the other variable increases, then one would utilise a two-tailed test to determine the significance of any correlation arising from the data (Field, 2005).

5. Results

5.1 Effects of LoI on Academic Achievement

The study aimed at exploring the extent of the impact of Proficiency in LoI on academic achievement. In testing the hypothesis that proficiency in LoI has a very little impact on academic achievement – i.e., that the degree of correlation would be statistically insignificant – English academic achievement scores and scores on proficiency in the LoI were compared in a regression analysis to explore the extent to which the achievement in English is explained by language proficiency. Table 2 reflects that r^2 which helps to ascertain how fit is the ELP in explaining achievement in English is 0.086, and Table 3 shows that the p-value for 0.086 is 0.005. Since $r^2 = 0.086$ (which is equivalent to 8.6%) this shows that ELP has the power to explain academic achievement in English language studies, or to put it in another way, affects academic achievement in English by 8.6 %. This can be interpreted to mean that ELP has an effect on English language performance of the secondary school students researched by 8.6%. The corollary to this is that the remainder, 91.4%, is due to other factors.

Table 2: Regression Summary-English Achievement and ELP

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of Estimate
1	0.293	0.086	0.075	7.784

Predictors: A (Constant) = English Proficiency; B = English Achievement

The relationship of these variables is statistically significant when $p< 0.01$. The level of significance was set at 0.01and the p-value as shown in Table 3 is 0.005. Here, the p-value is less than the significance level set ($0.005 < 0.01$). Hence, it was established that the relationship is significant. It was therefore ascertained that there is a significant positive relationship between ELP and academic achievement in English among the advanced level secondary school students that constituted the research sample.

Table 3: Analysis of Variance (ANOVA) for English and ELP

Model	Sum of Squares	Df	Mean Square	F	Significance Level
Regression	494.553	1	494.553	8.163	0.005
Residual	5270.952	87	60.586		
Total	5765.506	88			

Predictors: A (Constant) = English Proficiency (%); B (Dependent Variable) = English Achievement (%).

5.2 The Effects of Proficiency in the LOI based on each Stream Studied

The relationship between proficiency in the LOI and academic achievement was narrowed down to the streams that make up the research group so as to determine in which stream the ELP has more influence. The regression analysis presented in Table 4 shows that $r^2 = 0.296$ which is equivalent to 29.6% ~ 30%. Thus, ELP has the power to influence academic achievement in English for the HKL stream by 30%. This can be interpreted to mean that among the cluster of variables that might affect performance in the HKL stream, ELP accounted for 30% of the influence on English achievement. The influence of other factors on students' performance amounted to 70%. This influence is significant at the $p< 0.01$ level of significance.

Conversely, from the summary in Table 5, it is reflected that $r^2 = 0.006$, equivalent to 0.6% implies that in the HGL stream proficiency in English, the LoI has the power to influencing performance by less than 1 %. This influence, of course, was not significant because $p > 0.01$.

Table 4: Summary of Regression Analysis for HKL Stream

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate
1	0.544	0.296	0.279	7.463

Predictors: A = Language Proficiency for HKL, B = Dependent Variable: Achievement in English

It can be said, therefore, that the regression analysis conducted relating proficiency in the LoI and achievement in English for each stream reflects that the influence of the proficiency level seems more determinative for a student in the HKL than for the student in HGL. This is another way of saying that the analysis shows that in the HKL stream English proficiency has more influence on academic achievement than in the HGL stream since ELP's influence on HKL stream was found to be 30% and that of HGL was 1%. This influence is much higher in HKL possibly because the HKL are dealing with both languages, Kiswahili and English. Hence learning transfer seems to be occurring: the learning of one language seems to help in the understanding of the other language, especially where language features are definitively transferable.

Table 5: Summary of Regression Analysis for HGL Stream

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate
1	.075	.006	-.018	7.545

Predictors: A (Constant) = ELP Scores (%). B (Dependent Variable) = Achievement in English (%)

5.3 Effects of Proficiency in the LoI on other Subjects Apart from English

It was of significant interest for the researcher to ascertain the regression relationship of ELP and other subjects apart from English. To this end, General Studies was used in the analysis. Table 6, shows that r = 0.096, this implies that there is a weaker relationship between these two variables. Further, $r^2 = 0.009$ which is equivalent to 0.9%, meaning that proficiency in LoI has the power to influence academic achievement in General Studies by 0.9%. In other words, ELP has a very little influence on General Studies; its influence is less than 1%. For this reason, other variables apart from language proficiency, when considered as one cluster of influential factors, have greater influence on academic performance, more than 99% according to our analysis. The influence of ELP was seen to be insignificant: $p > 0.01$.

Table 6: Regression Analysis: ELP and General Studies

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate
1	.096	.009	-.002	9.211

Predictors: A (Constant) = Language Proficiency Scores (%); B (Dependent) = General Studies (%)

As far as the hypothesis is concerned, the data presented above seem to support the assumption that only to a little extent does ELP act as a determinative factor for academic performance in English and in other school subjects. That is to say that only to a very small extent does ELP affect performance in English, and even less in other subjects.

Although the influence of English proficiency on academic achievement is small, it is to be recalled that our data did show that there is a meaningful and statistically significant influence of ELP on academic achievement if the academic subject in question is English. The influence of ELP on achievement in other subjects when General Studies is accepted as the dependent variable is negligible and statistically insignificant.

We reiterate, therefore, there seems to be a meaningful significant positive relationship exists between ELP and academic achievement in English among the studied A- level students.

Extending the relationship to other subjects apart from English, represented by General Studies, it was observed that the p-value (0.372) is not less than the significant level set, 0.01 (i.e., 0.372 > 0.01). This implies that if there is an influence our research could not determine it since any figure above the significance level could be due to error variance. In this respect, the hypothesis upon which the study concentrated was partly upheld: the ELP has a meaningful significant influence on English, while to a large extent, the ELP does not influence academic achievement in other subjects apart from English itself.

6. Discussion

English, the LoI, in Tanzania has fallen victim to accusations from some scholars and the general public as the cause of mass failure of students and the downfall of education standards in the country (Wilson, 2011). Our findings establish that language proficiency influences performance of students when the academic subject at issue is English itself but this influence seems to disappear when one studies the correlation between ELP and academic achievement in other subject areas. It is clear from the study that the influence is not great enough to deserve to be blamed in the public forum as it has been. The accusations thrown at English make it seem as if the lack of English proficiency is the only cause of underachievement among students in Tanzania. The study has revealed that it is the non-ELP factors that influence performance greatly. Thus, it should be understood that poor performance is an interplay of several factors – those who publicly blame lack of proficiency in English seem incorrect in their judgment.

The study does seem to show that the more one improves proficiency in the LoI, the more improved will be academic performance. This implies that the impact of LoI may vary according to how the students differ from each other in their language ability. Students with high proficiency in English are likely to benefit most where English is used as the LoI.

The effects of LoI on learning outcomes may vary from one subject to another. Basically, the influence that the degree of proficiency a person has reached in the language of instruction exercises on that person's performance in any given subject will vary according to how instrumental the language is for grasping the content of the subject. For example, a social science subject like history demands much language involvement while a pure science like mathematics demands less language ability for formulating and grasping a content which consists largely of numbers and symbols. Therefore, the effect of proficiency on learning outcomes will vary in accordance to the indispensability of the language for grasping/understanding the content of the subject. In the pure sciences the non-LoI factors would seem to exert a greater effect on the outcome, while in the social sciences the ELP would seem to have much influence.

It seems, then, that there is a need to interpret academic scores, especially that of English, with great caution. The general public is acquainted with the notion that a score or grade represents the degree of measurable achievement; and when a student gets an ***'A',*** say in the English language, the actual ability of such a student in English should be excellent, implying that s/he is excellent in writing, listening, reading and speaking. In reality, this may not be the case. The scores allotted to students in English do not necessarily correlate with their ability in using the language. Our study seems to show, for example, that an ***'A'*** score granted to a student may be the consequence of a constellation of considerations on the part of the teacher and therefore may be a function of many variables. In this scenario, English plays a role but not the dominant role.

Hence for many Tanzanian students, the scores they attain in either the English language or in other school subjects do not necessarily reflect their ability in the language that was used, nor do they necessarily reflect that there is occurring a transferring of proficiency in the LoI to a proficiency in understanding the content of a specified field. As far as the majority of students are concerned, if they attain an ***A*** or ***B***+ grade, it doesn't mean that their proficiency in English is ***A*** or ***B***+. We have no discernible reason to believe that the influence of English on performance is noteworthy; hence, we remain saddled with the problem: what issues should be catching our attention in the schools of Tanzania so that, having taken steps to resolve these issues, we systematically improve the academic performance of our students?

Lecturers in the universities sometimes complain that students' performance at the university in a number of disciplines does not reflect the grades or scores that were to be noted on their secondary school transcripts when they registered as new students. The assumption underlying such complaints is that ACSSE scores/grades that students presented the day of their university registration were going to be reliable predictors of the students' future performance at the university. Furthermore, managers in companies where university graduates are called for interviews say most of the candidates' abilities in language and in the discipline for which they are making application do not reflect the grades that appear on their transcripts.

Employers observe the actual work of their new employees: they notice that, in spite of the fact that their new employees have graduated just recently from the university, they are underperforming. The ones who are intending to benefit from the proficiency, skills and competencies of the new employees – the so-called consumers – take note of the apparent lack of ability of the new employees. Employers and consumers alike fail to see the connection between the graduates' actual performance and the scores recorded in their certificates or transcripts (Wilson, 2011). The academic records are showing that these recent graduates enjoyed excellent and/or very good scores in their years of university education, but in actuality they do not have the language skill to express the content of the courses in which they supposedly excelled.

Wilson's research correlates with that of other researchers from other parts of the world. Studies conducted by Ajibade (1993) and by Dooey and Oliver (2002) support the hypothesis that ELP has only a weak positive influence on students' academic performance. Our present study shows that proficiency in English has only a weak positive influence on academic performance when the students from whom the data are collected are advanced level students in Tanzania. Despite this weak connection between English proficiency and academic performance here in Tanzania, a more refined analysis of the variables involved indeed manifests that there seems to exist a significant correlation between proficiency in English and academic performance in those subjects that require versatility in English in order to master the subject matter, while such a correlation does not significantly exist between English proficiency and subjects that do not require language skill in order to be mastered. English as an academic subject requires English proficiency: hence in this case the correlation exists. Mathematics does not require such proficiency in language: hence in the case of mathematics such a correlation does not exist.

Generally speaking, our study has shown that the LoI has only a weak positive influence on what students achieve. It also has to be kept in mind that the grades recorded on certificates or transcripts are a function of several factors: proficiency in the English language seems to be only a minor factor. One reason English seems to exert little influence on achievement may be poor testing styles: if the teacher, for example, formulates questions in a multiple-choice framework or in a framework that requires answers that can be memorized without being properly comprehended, a student may do well without really knowing English. Thus one would get an ***'A'*** grade or ***'B+'*** in English while his/her actual ability is not of an ***'A'*** or a ***'B+'*** level, but rather is much lower. In this situation, of course, the scores will not reflect the abilities in the LoI. It also must be considered that English may not be well taught, because many instructors themselves do not know English. Consequently, they cannot teach it well. What can we conclude from all this? It seems that there is a need to emphasize teaching English as a real means of communication.

7. Conclusion and Recommendations

The present study attempted to investigate to what extent proficiency in the LoI influences academic performance and whether such influence is significant. The hypothesis was that to a large extent the ELP among Tanzanian secondary school students do not exert an influence and hence show no significant effects on academic outcomes. The findings of the study by and large supported the hypothesis: only to a small extent does proficiency in LoI influence academic achievement.

One implication of this finding carries the implication that other variables apart from ELP, at least when they are clustered together, have a greater impact on academic performance. Despite the ELP's inability to influence performance, the fact that there is at least a small tendency to influence academic outcomes cannot be ignored. We make this assertion on the basis that ELP was in fact a significant factor in academic performance when the subject at issue was English itself.

Yet ELP failed to exercise any influence over other subjects such as General Studies. We conclude that language plays a role in educational success but not a dominant role. **Our study gives rise to the recommendation that Tanzania explicitly require ELP to be a criterion for students' admission into secondary schools and universities**. Why are we saying this? … because O-level or A- level academic results alone are not sufficient criteria for determining academic capability. Indeed whether a student can succeed or not in his or her academic pursuits seems to be an issue that requires research into an entire cluster of variables that may be affecting our Tanzanian students' academic performance and consequently their future range of possibilities in the work world and in the various echelons of society to which they aspire.

References

Ajayi, I.A., Mass Failure of Students in West African Senior School Certificate Examinations (WASSCE) in Nigeria: The Teachers' Perspective, Las Vegas, Nevada: *The Clute Institute International Academic Conference* (2012), pp. 33-38.

Ajibade, A.Y., *Proficiency in English and Affective Factors as Predictors of Senior Secondary School Students' Achievement in French.* Ibadan, Nigeria: Unpublished Ph.D Thesis, University of Ibadan, 1993.

Bayliss, A. & Ingram, D.E., IELTS as a Predictor of Academic Language Performance, *Australian International Education Conference,* (2006), p. 112.

Bellingham, L., The Relationship of Language Proficiency to Academic Success for International Students. *New Zealand Journal of Educational Studies*. Vol. 30 (1993), pp. 229-232.

Bryars, A.D., *Advanced Level Statistics*. London: Collins' Education, 1983.

Chonjo, P. N. & Welford, G.. Reasons for Poor Performance of Students in A– Level Science Examinations in Tanzania. *Papers in Education and Development*. No. 21, (2001), pp. 39-51.

Controller and Audit General of the United Republic of Tanzania, *A Performance Audit Report on a School Inspection Programme for Secondary Schools in Tanzania.* Dar es Salaam: National Audit Office, 2008.

Criper, C. & Dodd, W., *Report on the Teaching of the English Language and its Use as a Medium in Education.* Dar es Salaam: The British Council, 1984.

Dasu, M.M., Effective Teacher Education for Effective Classroom Teaching. *Papers in Education and Development*. No. 21 (2001), pp. 14-23.

Dooey, P. & Oliver, R., An Investigation into the Predictive Validity of the IELTS Test as an Indicator of Future Academic Success. *Prospect,* 17 (1), (2002), pp. 36-54.

Fakeye, D. & Ogunsiji, Y., English Language Proficiency as a Predictor of Academic Achievement among ELF students in Nigeria, *Journal of Science Research,* Vol. 37, No. 3 (2009), pp. 490 - 495.

Feast, V., The Impact of IELTS Scores on Performance at University, *International Educational Journal*. Vol. 3(4), (2002), pp. 70-85.

Gibson, C. & Rusek, W., *The Validity of an Overall Band Score of 6.0 on the IELTS Test as a Predictor of Adequate English Language Level Appropriate for Successful Academic Study.* New South Wales: Unpublished Masters of Arts (Applied Linguistics) Thesis, Macquarie University, 1992.

Kadeghe, M.Y., *The Implication of Bilingual Education in Learning and Teaching: The Case of Tanzanian Secondary Schools.* Dar es Salaam: Ph.D. Dissertation, UDSM, 2000.

Kagashe, B., Girls Outshine Boys, *The Citizen* (27 January 2011), p. 2A.

Leshabari, M.T. & Masessa, Z.E. The Impact of the Deteriorating Quality of Education in Schools on the Training of Medical Doctors in Tanzania. In Galabawa, J..C.J, Senkoro, F.E.K and Lwaitama, A.F. (Eds.). *The Quality of Education in Tanzania: Issues and Experience,* pp. 135- 144. Dar es Salaam: Faculty of Education, University of Dar es Salaam, 2000.

Malekela, G., English as a Medium of Instruction in Post-Primary Education in Tanzania: Is it a Fair Policy to the Learner? In B. Brock et al. (Eds.), *Language of Instruction in Tanzania and South Africa*, Dar-es-Salaam: E & D Limited, 2003, pp. 102-112.

Mvungi, M. M., Relationship between Performance in Instructional Medium and Performance in Selected School Subjects in Tanzania Secondary Schools. Dar es Salaam: Ph.D. Thesis, UDSM, 1982.

National Data Centre, *Basic Education Statistics in Tanzania (BEST) 2006 – 2010*. Dar es Salaam: MoEVT 2010.

Ndabi, D. M., *The Predictive Validity of Secondary Education Examinations*. Dar es Salaam: NECTA, 1987.

NECTA, *Examination Results Statistics, Cycle 2012*. Dar es Salaam: NECTA, 2008.

Omari, I.M., Conceptualizing Quality in Primary Education. In *Papers in Education and Development*, 16 (1995), pp. 25-48.

Osaki, K.M., Forces Influencing Undergraduates' Performance in an African University. In *Perspective in Education*, Vol. 13 (3), (1997), pp. 145- 165.

Osaki, K.M., *Science Education in Secondary Schools (SESS): An Internal Project Evaluation.* Commissioned by GTZ, Dar es Salaam: Ministry of Education and Culture & GTZ, 1999.

Qorro, M.A.S., *A Qualitative Study on Teaching and Learning of Writing in Tanzania Secondary Schools in Relation to Writing Requirements of Tertiary Education.* Dar es Salaam: Ph.D. Thesis (unpublished), UDSM, Tanzania, 1999.

Qualifying Test as a Predictor of Academic Performance in CSEE, Dar es Salaam, NECTA, 1989.

Roy- Campbell, M.Z. & Qorro, A.M., *Language Crisis in Tanzania, the Myth of English Versus Education*. Dar es Salaam: Mkuki na Nyota Publishers, 1997.

Rubagumya, C.M. (Ed.), *Language in Education in Africa, a Tanzanian Perspective*. Philadelphia: Multilingual Matters Clevedon, 1990.

Rubagumya, C., Jones, C., & Mwansoko, H., *Language for Learning and Teaching in Tanzania: a Research Paper Funded by ODA*. Dar es Salaam: British Council, 1998.

Siyame, P., Watoa Sababu 17 za Matokeo Mabaya Kidato cha Nne. *Habari Leo*, (26/02/2013), p. 25.

United Republic of Tanzania (URT), *National Population Census*. Dar es Salaam: Government Printers, 2002.

Wilson, J., English Language Proficiency and Academic Achievement in Tanzanian Secondary Schools. Dar es Salaam: Unpublished M.A Thesis, University of Dar es Salaam, Tanzania, 2011.

Living the Truth… and What the World Can Learn from African Youth

Fr. John Gibson, OCD

Interdisciplinary Lecturer
Jordan University College

Introduction: Truth? ... What is that?

On the day he was to die a quite savage death on the cross, Jesus Christ, the Son of God, said to his judge, Pontius Pilate: *I was born for this, I came into the world for this, to bear witness to the truth: and all who are on the side of truth listen to my voice.*[1]

The issue is epistemological: can we really side with the truth and listen to the voice of Jesus with the objectively valid rational conviction that Jesus is the Truth?

I admit that each of us may have coping mechanisms – denial, projection, rationalization – that leave us distorting the truth a bit. But by means of this present article, I would like to opt for the God-given ability to listen to the voice of Truth and bear witness to that Truth by a life lived in purity, justice, and love. The two advocates whom I propose as witnesses to the Truth are a University of Cape Town student, Amazement Ndungane, and Donnell Tholley, a Sierra Leonean male nurse who just turned 26 years old a few months ago. I am going to add a third witness, Fatu Turay, who died soon after giving birth. I present them only as examples: if my personal experience in several West and East African countries is

---

[1] To bear witness to the truth – ινα μαρτυρησω τη αληθεια – "for the purpose of being a martyr to the truth": because the English words associated with bearing witness and giving testimony cohere with the Greek variants of the word corresponding to "martyr," one would need to carefully interweave the nuances that the one utilizing this vocabulary may intend – for purposes of the present essay the one whose vocabulary is at issue is the Beloved Disciple of the Fourth Gospel. Below I offer brief comments about Paul Ricœur's careful analysis of the words witness and testimony in the Johannine corpus.

any indication, there are many individuals that I could present and praise – particularly from Burundi, Cameroun, Central Africa, Congo, Ivory Coast, Kenya, Rwanda, Sierra Leone and, of course, Tanzania – in this brief essay.

Let us begin with the voice of Jesus.

Is it really the truth coming forth from this particular voice, the voice of someone entirely innocent but nevertheless utterly powerless – is this voice, the voice of the condemned, a voice that never seems to fade away because of the anguish that continues to seep forth from it – is this really the truth that I wish to hear?

Am I not inclined to let those who pose as the experts of today, the cross-cultural philosophers who "read" ideologies and presuppositions, the economic specialists, the politically astute, the psychologically insightful, and the spiritually influential – not to mention the middle people – the journalists – who rubber neck their way into the communication networks commandeered by the experts, that is to say, those journalists who purport to be quite capable of communicating clearly, accurately and persuasively what all these experts are saying and doing – are not these the voices that stabilize me in the truth of the present moment? Are not the ones who offer the latest news, the latest fashions, the latest conveniences, the latest economic opportunities, and perhaps most influentially, the latest hours for music, dance and film entertainment – are these not really the voices I need to listen to if I want to have a practical, up-to-date grasp of what brings me psychosocial contentment, of that which is going to satisfy my deepest longings?

The purpose of what I am about to say is to shed a ray of light on the human ability to perceive the truth, accept the truth, live according to the truth and die as a martyr to the truth. We shall listen for a brief moment to the heralds of the Enlightenment who made it their business to anchor human aspiration to the truth within the quite limited human ability to make rational judgments. We shall listen for a more extended moment to the social psychologists of our own era who seem to give credence to the rationalist ideals of the enlightenment by their thought-provoking systematic observation of what happens when individuals surrender their capacity to make rational judgments to directives that are given to them from external sources, from sources that are apparently authoritative.

During the course of this exposition, we shall listen responsibly to those voices who advocate planting the seeds of human rationality in the soil of eternally creative, divine wisdom. Prominent among these advocates of submission to divine authority are Edith Stein, Paul Ricœur, Bernard Lonergan, and (Bl.) Mother Teresa of Kolkata. Tailay Mkuna of Jordan University College draws out the implications of submitting to divine authority in the particular case of the communal consciousness in the family.

Finally, we shall set our gaze upon those individuals who by their lives intend to bear direct witness to the truth: these are the individuals who, like Amazement Ndungane and Donnell Tholley, have come to concentrate their hearts' energies on the Truth that enters one's rational consciousness precisely by the paths that God has intended: by the path of a love that obeys and suffers, by the path of compassion for the one who lives and dies innocently but at the same time is condemned to live and to die in pain and anguish. These are the people who manifest to the rest of humanity the true face of God and the true destiny of the human person.

1. Living in Communion with the Truth: Mother Teresa

I was exercising my duties and responsibilities as a parish pastor in Inchon, South Korea, in the late spring of 1992 when I received a phone call that caught me by surprise. The one calling was Mother Teresa of Kolkata, the Catholic Sister awarded the Nobel Peace Prize for her thoughtful, compassionate, wholehearted service to the world's Poorest of the Poor.[2] I could never expect to receive a call directly from a person of such public stature.

She said: "Welcome home, Father John, welcome to Albania." This was her way of saying that I was to leave Korea as soon as possible to go to a new mission, that of Albania. "Come to Kolkata

---

[2] It is already widely known that she is to be canonized a saint next year in October.

for ten days," she said, "and then you and I are going together to Albania."

I was aware that my entrance into Albania would not be an easy venture because many individuals still in power had been members of the regime that killed all the Catholic bishops of the country and 95% of the priests. I was soon to learn that the two priests who were to be my new neighbours had survived severe tortures. One of the two told me they tore out of his mouth each and every tooth and so left him toothless. They did not use any Novocain or other pain killer to make their surgical manoeuvres more tolerable. My other neighbour had served 37 years of a 43-year sentence and had suffered, on a frequent basis, such lethal tortures as a prolonged bath, naked, in a pool of ice and frozen water. The only reason that he did not die from what should have been lethal treatment was that his torturers would always remove his dying body from the ice water right before death so that they could revive him and renew the torture on another day. I was sure that what Catholic priests had endured in Albania was the reason for Mother Teresa's choice to accompany me to what was for her, her native country.

Just as she had instructed, I went to Kolkata for ten days. At the beginning of my stay there, she asked to speak with me in private. Once seated comfortably in her simple "office" that consisted of one small table with nothing on it, two chairs, four bare walls, one bare ceiling and one bare floor, I waited for Mother to say what was on her mind. She followed her personal habit and came directly to the point:

"Father John, you are infallible when you obey your superiors even when they make a mistake."

These words form an important nucleus for the present article. A woman internationally recognized for her revolutionary insights regarding not only the dignity but the sacredness of every unwanted, abandoned, poor and suffering person was making a statement that utterly defied the currents of the secularist insistence on personal autonomy in decision making, an insistence that dates back to 30th September, 1784, when Immanuel Kant published a short essay, *What is Enlightenment?*

According to Kant, the motto of the movement known as the Enlightenment was: "Have courage to use your own understanding!" If one were to put it more succinctly, "Dare to know!" The unenlightened person, on the other hand, was the one who lived in self-imposed immaturity, which for Kant meant a lack of resolve and courage to use one's own understanding without guidance from another. With Kant's depiction of how an enlightened human being should be able to proceed as one capable of reasoning for oneself, by oneself and with oneself as a guide and of behaving according to one's rational judgments independently of any external influence, rationalistic individualism became a norm for assessing human maturity.

Epistemology and by implication anthropology quickly shifted from a metaphysics that accepted as its point of origin Absolute Being and the Truth that characterizes Absolute Being to a metaphysics that dispensed with all transcendental viewpoints – Kant called them "illusionary." For Kant the only valid starting points for the philosophical enterprise were what human rationality could accept as conditions for possible experience.[3]

Father John, you are infallible when you obey your superiors even when they make a mistake.

Such words coming from a Catholic nun would have boggled the mind of those who, like Kant, believed themselves to be the heralds of a new humanity, a humanity that knew how to obey, first of all, the determinations of one's own practical reason. A person

[3] In discussing his Method of Transcendentalism, Kant offers a concise assessment of pure reason's boundaries, when he stated: "It is humiliating, no doubt, for human reason that it can achieve nothing by itself, nay, that it stands in need of discipline to check its vagaries, and to guard against the illusions arising from them… The greatest and perhaps the only advantage of all philosophy of pure reason seems therefore to be negative only; because it serves, not as an organon for the extension, but as a discipline for the limitation of its domain, and instead of discovering truth, it only claims the modest merit of preventing error." See Immanuel Kant's *Critique of Pure Reason,* transl. by F. Max Muller. New York: Macmillan, 1922, 638. While Kant's explanation of noumena may seem quite laboured (see pages 192-211 of the *Critique*, Muller's translation), Kant makes a telling statement when he says, "In doing this, it [i.e., our understanding] immediately proceeds to prescribe limits to itself, by admitting that it cannot know these noumena by means of the categories, but can only think of them under the name of something unknown" (209).

with the moral intention to act in harmony with one's essence as a human being would follow the categorical imperative intrinsic to the very nature of practical reason – *Act only according to that maxim by which you can at the same time will that it would become a universal law.*

To obey an authority that one suspected to be rationally in error and therefore was issuing a directive that could not possibly cohere with what is a universal good: this was a primary target of Kant's essay explaining the Enlightenment.

If we were to frame Mother Teresa's remarks within the Hegelian dialectic, we could be safe in saying that a decision that my superiors had formulated concerning my immediate future was a thesis – one element of a rationally ordered cognitive process but certainly not conclusive – and that the implications of that decision for my life in terms of the dangers to which the decision might expose me was an antithesis.

Mother Teresa, however, always shifted the theses and the antitheses, the positions and counter-positions that individuals may impose upon each other to the higher viewpoints of harmonizing syntheses (Hegel would use the term sublations). Her personal epistemology transcended that of such rationalists as Kant and Hegel. Her conversation with me was yet another moment that surfaced her conviction that the human being acts intelligently when he or she opens the mind, heart and soul, in obedience, to the God of Truth and Wisdom – to the God who harmonizes everything he has created, prudently and wisely, into a marvellous, symphonic synthesis – when he or she obeys without complaint the instructions conveyed by a superior who is properly authorized to issue such instructions even when those instructions are neither prudent nor wise.

For indeed Mother Teresa never acted autonomously. Her starting point was Jesus in the Passion: she was in communion with her suffering God. For her to make rational determinations about truth-in-itself meant to be one with Jesus in his juridical proceeding where he bore witness to the truth by submitting himself to the determinations of a very anxious and confused man who ultimately attempted to crush the workings of wisdom by his own practical conviction that he could fabricate for himself his own personal “truth” independently of the Supreme Being.[4]

To be a witness to the truth does not mean to judge each and every declaration of authority for its measure of prudence and wisdom. On the contrary, to be a witness to divine truth means to suffer the mistakes of a human authority – just as Jesus suffered in breathtakingly brutal fashion Pilate’s mistakes – with the insightful realization that God harmonizes and synthesizes in unexpected ways: “God’s power – [his love, his wisdom, his grace, his prudence] – is at its best in human weakness.”[5] God is the highest viewpoint. His laws are universal in scope – i.e., his imperatives are categorical.

Mother Teresa wanted me to feel the full force of the truth she was trying to express: “You are infallible when you obey your superiors even when they make a mistake. Your superiors are sending you alone to Albania. That is a mistake.”

Mother Teresa wanted me to understand that I was to obey a mandate that was leaving me deprived of the communal love, wisdom and harmony of the family. At the very moment God was creating the human being, he made the divine observation, “It is not good for the human being to be alone.” Mother Teresa was making it clear that she disagreed with my superior’s mandate. But then she spoke a word that shifted the entire dialogue to a higher viewpoint. What on the level of human mandates was an error – sending me alone to Albania lacked prudence – and therefore a miscalculation of the truth could, on the level of divine grace, bring the victim of the error – in this particular instance, myself – to a new comprehension of the truth.

And what was this new insight, this intrusion of divine wisdom into human foolishness (for indeed without judging my superiors, Mother Teresa believed that the decision for me to go alone was a foolish one), this new exposure to Truth to which God was inviting me?

Teresa expressed it this way: “In fact you are not alone. God has given you a Mother, his own Mother Mary, to accompany you on

[4] Cf. John 19:10-11.

[5] 2 Corinthians 12:9.

the journey and to stay with you even at night. She shines in the darkness of the night." Mother Teresa was using as a starting point for her comprehension of what was happening in my life something that transcends the operations of human rationality. She was using as a basis for her thoughtful insight about the truth of the matter, the divine rationality that is to be found in God.

More specifically, Mother Teresa was referring to that very moment when Jesus seemed to be sinking into intolerably excruciating feelings of rejection, abandonment and loneliness on the Cross. From the depths of his loneliness, he made the divine choice to give the human being a new "starting point" for the interior life of rational consciousness: the gift of a mother, Mary. So that none of us might feel alone in the more anxiety-provoking journeys of our lives, Jesus chose to give us his Mother as our companion on the byways and alleyways of the world. To be rationally autonomous, we need to deprive ourselves of autonomy: we need a mother.

Our personal acknowledgement that God has given us this particular woman to embrace us with a mother's love and guide us with a mother's wisdom is not a conclusion that we have reached by a cognitive process, no matter how deductively or inductively rigorous such a process might be. No; it is a datum made available to us by God himself through John's account of the Passion. We are aware of this datum because God chose to tell us about this moment through a witness to the truth, namely, the Beloved Disciple of the Fourth Gospel. We have made the rational determination to side with the truth, we have listened to the voice of Jesus, and we have welcomed his gift of a companion for life.

Mother Teresa was reminding me that I am the disciple God loves in my own moments of fear and solitude. As his beloved disciple, I am never alone: the Mother of Jesus is with me. Divine Truth reminds me that it is foolish to think that human directives, policies and mandates have the last word. The one who said, "Father John, you are to go alone," did not realize that God was saying at the very same moment, "Father John, you are never alone; so go in peace and confidence."

Jesus identified himself to be the Truth.[6] Truth is a fully conscious subject. Jesus also confirmed by his divinely rational choice to offer his human body as a sacrifice of compassion that there are those who may try to kill the Truth, but Truth cannot remain dead. Indeed the Resurrection and Jesus' abiding presence among us – an event that escapes the individualist epistemologies both of Hegel and of Kant not to mention a host of other modern and contemporary philosophers – is yet another moment where Jesus has revealed God to be a Truth-always-in-communion. "Behold! I am with you always, even to the end of the ages."[7] The abiding individuality of Jesus remains concealed within His presence in the Eucharist, a presence that confirms the ethos of divine truth: Truth is communion that intends to include you, me – all of us.

What is at issue, it seems, is the disposition of human intelligence and human will that manifests itself in humble obedience. Humble obedience in its essence is the choice to say that someone else, namely, God, is grasping the truth more accurately and more comprehensively than I am, so I choose – intelligently – to "take his word for it". Kant's "dare to know" – the insistence on personal autonomy – becomes "dare to accept" – the invitation to accept the truth that God always is God.

In a healthy family situation, sons and daughters obey their father: they accept him as the head of the family. They also obey their mother: they accept her as the heart of the family. Children know that in obeying their parents, they are obeying God: they are obeying the divine mandate, "Honour your father and mother." These children know that they are growing in wisdom because they are accepting insights and disclosures from someone who is smarter than they are – from God – even if it is coming through the human media of parents, teachers, and elder brothers and sisters.

The obedience is humbler yet if the person obeying not only judges that accepting the word of the person in authority is a wise choice but also judges that it is a choice that corresponds to what divine wisdom desires from the obeying subject. Taking their cue

[6] John 14:8.
[7] Matthew 28:20.

from Sacred Scripture, religious authorities within the consecrated life of the Catholic Church have typically termed this disposition "obeying God's will." Contrary to what enlightenment philosophers may have wished to argue, this kind of obedience is not a failure to exercise one's rational abilities and a blind submission to a capricious authority; rather it is a truthful recognition that I am freely and responsibly mature when I accept as a wise friend, God himself.

It is to be noted that no one who chooses this particular path of enlightened obedience intends to confuse the man or woman issuing the directive – who actually may be making any number of mistakes – and the divine authority who wishes human authority's mistaken decision to be accepted and lived out. Hence the one who is living this path of humble obedience knows that God is going to manifest his divine love and wisdom even in those decisions that human authority makes under the influence of human attributes that militate against the truth: for example, human authority may be mistaken because of ignorance of factors crucial to making correct decisions, an attitude of partiality towards the persons affected by the decisions, emotionally charged opinions about the people receiving the directives, and perhaps even inclinations of jealousy or the desire for revenge towards the persons over whom one has authority.

The person who obeys knows that God is going to let the truth act as a saving power in his or her daily life. He or she also recognizes those moments inimical to human freedom and virtue when the one in authority issues a directive or policy that is blatantly immoral. The person formed in obedience has the interior awareness and integrity to give an immediate "no" to such a directive or policy.

Such obedience has confused minds steeped in the secularist notion that a person is intellectually mature when that person is able to reason by oneself, for oneself, with oneself as a guide without recourse to the guidance of another. Such insistence on personal autonomy in the formulation of rational judgments eventually leaves even God on the margins of ordinary cognitive process.

Concealed within the presuppositions of this insistence lies the suspicion that one's moral and religious convictions cloud the operations of reason in such a way that reason is deprived of necessary freedom. In this mindset freedom means the ability to judge whether one in authority deserves to be obeyed or not. In other words, the autonomous self becomes the authoritative criterion for determining whether the other really has authority. The autonomous self assumes the position of divine judge.

2. Who are the Enlightened?

Hence Immanuel Kant could not bring himself to believe that Truth-in-itself is available to human intelligence as its lynchpin. In fact he was audacious enough to declare that the pure, speculative reason of any human being does not have the capability to understand and bear witness to any noumenon, including the Truth-in-itself. But do we really understand Kant? If we were to apply what Hegel calls immanent critique to Kant's position about the inability of pure human reason to grasp noumena we would have to say that as a philosopher-in-himself, Kant is inaccessible both to his own self-awareness and, of course, to our horizon of consciousness. Who Kant is for you may be different from who Kant is for me; and, according to Kant's way of thinking, we have no objective criterion for determining who may be approaching an accurate understanding of the real "Kant-in-himself."

The same can be said of that form of rationality that Kant labels "pure reason." Who can know pure reason "in itself"? According to Kant I can only know pure reason as it is for me; I certainly do not know what pure reason is for you. By Kant's understanding of pure reason, no one can know what pure reason really is, who Kant really is – nor can they know anything as a subsisting reality. Truth-in-itself, reason-in-itself, the categorical imperative-in-itself, the person-in-himself, the person-in-herself, are noumena inaccessible to human understanding.

Hegel did not subscribe to the same scepticism about reason's capacity to understand and embrace truth. At which point human consciousness is actually ready to accept the Truth, however, is another question altogether. For Hegel the awareness and acceptance of the Truth is an endpoint of a turbulent enterprise that pits individuals against each other in positions and counter-positions that are antithetical to each other. This process involves shifts to higher viewpoints whereby those who worked in tension with each other in their individualistic endeavours now join forces in order to harmonize their interests and concerns into syntheses (sublation) that transcend individual aims and preferences. Only as a culmination to such a process – a process fraught with moments of self-alienation – can the human community arrive at a grasp of universal, objective truth. Truth requires the solidarity of all those reasoning subjects who enter into the communion of consciousness imbued with Absolute Spirit.

Put in another way, communal consciousness for Hegel is a terminus of a very involved series of transitions that begin with individualistic patterns of self-interest and from the conflicts that ensue when individuals mired in their own self-interests confront each other by means of positions and counter-positions. Shifts to higher viewpoints involve a harmonizing of theses and antitheses in such a way that those who formerly thought individualistically and somewhat antagonistically towards other human subjects now interweave their priorities and preferences with those of others so that they coalesce into a well-ordered synthesis. Coalitions form; those coalitions that endure may even become friendships.

These moments of synthesis for Hegel breed the growing conviction that, while a relentless, seemingly never-ending series of controversies that actually breed a pervasive sense of alienation, impedes everyone in their search for the truth, interweaving interests and purposes brings everyone, in communal fashion, closer to the truth. Eventually the shifts to higher viewpoints arrive at a universal viewpoint that embraces rational syntheses of all the positions and the counter-positions that seemed irreconcilable within the more individualistic framework. The universal viewpoint is a subject, not an object: it is Absolute Spirit; and Absolute Spirit is indeed the Truth.

Manipulating other human persons or suffering manipulation at the hands of others is for Hegel an inevitable stage in the development of an ethic that recognizes other persons as quite inclined to alienate themselves from each other before maturing into potential companions for each other in the communion engendered by Absolute Spirit. Everyone must pass through initial stages where the desire for recognition is paramount. Consequently an inter-subjectivity so complete that it can be called communion emerges only as a horizon of fullness – as an endpoint. It is an all-encompassing synthesis identifiable with Spirit as universal consciousness: but I emphasise that it is only an endpoint, never a starting point. Growth in consciousness for Hegel as for the other prominent voices of the enlightenment, therefore, is a process that finds its starting point, its roots and watering holes in a form of consciousness that is always individualistic; only eventually can this consciousness become communal in scope.

3. Conditions for the Possibility of Knowing the Truth

How am I able really to hear the voice of Truth and recognize Truth as more than my own individualist projection? How am I really able to understand myself and others within the words of absolute truth?

Am I not filtering the truth through my own mental categories that – in turn – may be malformed offshoots of a faulty intellectual, emotional and spiritual formation? (This might be especially true if I have belonged to a subculture – anywhere in the world – where I spent important moments of my childhood and adolescence letting peers shape my personality and character, without any moral parameters, according to those styles of music, film, dance, and other species of entertainment that are meant to tease and please.) Is the truth that I perceive and grasp not really my confused version of the truth? Is the truth that I think I have come to know – is this not at root a projection of what I wish to hear and see so that, perhaps unconsciously, I reject all those dimensions of the truth that are painful, mind-boggling, repulsive, traumatizing, anger-provoking, disgusting, or humiliating?

Or is this the pristine moment of objectivity when the Truth that I have come to perceive and understand is really the truth that God wishes to communicate to me? Is this really the moment when I can accept "the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth, so help me God"?[8]

For this I was born, for this I have come into the world, to bear witness to the truth. And all who are on the side of truth, listen to my voice.

Paul Ricœur, the populariser of the science of hermeneutics and mentor of Archbishop Marcel Madila Basanguka of Kananga, Congo (Kinshasa), offers us a rigorous – and I suggest an enlightening – analysis of "testimony" and "witness" as these words are used in divine revelation, particularly, in the Johannine corpus.

He is also to be commended for the manner by which he presented with beautiful articulation the desirability of philosophy to have a point of closure: for Ricœur the point of closure would be the promise God has made to grace us in a way that surpasses whatever we could deserve or understandably expect. This promise and the grace that fulfils the promise engender hope. One purpose of philosophy, according to Ricœur and Basanguka is to allow the dynamic of hope within human consciousness to broaden one's horizons of understanding what truth is.[9] Hope teaches human reason that the truth is a gift, totally undeserved, that cradles the unworthy sinner within the eternally thoughtful, compassionate,

[8] This is the formula that all witnesses in trials and other forms of judicial proceedings must use in many countries of the world in order to declare to the judicial audience that they intend to be faithful to the truth.

[9] For Ricœur's analysis of "witness" and "testimony," see his *Essays on Biblical Interpretation,* New York: Fortress Press, 1980, Chapter 3, "The Hermeneutics of Testimony." For his presentation of hope as a dynamic that leads to philosophy's point of closure, see his Chapter 4 of the same book, "Freedom in the Light of Hope." He makes a similar presentation on the dynamism of hope in the human act of understanding in French in *L'herméneutique biblique: la nuit surveillée,* "L'espérance et les structures des systèmes philosophiques", 11-128 (les Editions du Cerf, 2005). Ricœur anchors his convictions in divine revelation, specifically in Romans 5:12-20. How Basanguka understands Christian hope and its anchor point in God's grace came to my attention during my personal communications with him in Kananga, Congo, 2 April – 9 April 2011 in Kananga.

forgiving love that wells up within the Heart of God as a spring of Living Water.[10]

The words testimony and witness highlight the ability of pure human reason to exercise its autonomy by choosing not to be autonomous. I am referring to the opportunity for reason to exercise its operations by accepting the supernatural influence of the Holy Spirit's presence and action in the interior of one's rational life; to allow the Holy Spirit to conceive within one's consciousness faith, hope and love; and by this threefold dynamism to enter into communion with Truth-in-itself. In other words, Ricœur's analysis acts as a foil to those epistemologies that either directly or indirectly anchor themselves in Enlightenment principles.

On more than one occasion in the Book of Revelation, Jesus' very identity seems to be that of a Witness (Rev 1:5; 3:14). His very identity is to be in eternal communion with the truth. What is Jesus doing when he bears witness? Ricœur suggests that a synopsis of various verses gives compelling evidence that when Jesus gives testimony, he is rendering the Father accessible to human cognitive process. Revelation 1:2 speaks of the "testimony," *martyria* of Jesus Christ, as a synonym for "revelation," the *apokalypsis* of Jesus Christ, Revelation 1:1.[11] When one inserts John 1:18 into this collage of verses, "No one has ever seen God; the only Son… has made him known" (*exegesato*),[12] one comes to the unavoidable conclusion that the *exegesis* of God and the *testimony* of the Son are the same thing.

Contemplating for a moment what Jesus said to Pilate may even permit us to say that Jesus' purpose for coming into the world was to give God his proper place as the true starting point for the musings, speculations, cognitions, judgments, aspirations, hopes, decisions and behaviours of the wise.

There is an insistence in John's Gospel that the works Jesus accomplishes – works to which many can be eyewitnesses – bear testimony to him. Who he is becomes knowable through what he

[10] See Hosea 11:7-9; John 7:37-39.

[11] ‘Αποκαλυψις ‘Ιησου Χριστου (Revelation 1:1); μαρτυριαν ‘Ιησου Χριστου (Revelation 1:2).

[12] Εξηγησατο (John 1:18).

does. To do a hermeneutical shift from John's vocabulary and the cultural context that engenders it to our contemporary forms of expression, we might say that Jesus' works are empirical data that reveal who he is.

But at the same time the evangelist wishes us to know that the witness to the truth is a witness to what God reveals in the interior life of the human person: what today's philosopher might call data of consciousness. How the Gospel presents John the Baptist introduces us into this comprehensive meaning of testimony that embraces both the empirical data and the data of consciousness. John bears witness to the empirical reality of Jesus' presence and activity in the world; God himself reveals to John within the interior of his personal consciousness who Jesus is, the Son of God (cf., Jn. 1:34).

John does not know who Jesus is by the normal operations of cognitive process that arrive at a particular moment of insight. The source of John's discoveries about Jesus is not the insight of human rational consciousness; still less is it the workings of imagination and fantasy. The source, rather, is God himself.

The evangelist does not let the interior testimony of the Spirit render inconsequential the exterior testimony of the signs that Jesus performs. The evangelist is not a Gnostic; neither is Jesus. The coming together of external events and interior meanings in John's First Letter is not to be overlooked: "Who is it that overcomes the world but he who believes that Jesus is the Son of God? This is he who came by water and blood, Jesus Christ" – water and blood are empirical data at the moment of Jesus' death – "not with the water only but with the water and the blood. And the Spirit is witness, because the Spirit is the truth. There are three witnesses, the Spirit, the water, and the blood; and these three agree" (1 John 5:5-8). The Spirit is God himself – the God within rational consciousness who reveals the Truth that sets the human being free.

Hence to bear witness to Truth-in-Himself is to understand two dimensions to testimony that both expose human reason to noumena: the internal testimony, the seal of conviction, but also the external testimony of works, which ultimately is a testimony of suffering. This is why the Book of Revelation presents a vision of the true witnesses: those who sealed their testimony with their blood. “And they have conquered him by the blood of the Lamb and by the word of their testimony, for they loved not their lives even unto death” (Rev. 12:11). These are the ones who heard the voice of Jesus, accepted in Jesus the voice of truth and so chose to obey him, welcomed through Jesus the supernatural influence of the Holy Spirit in the interior of their rational life, and so entered into communion with God himself.

4. All who are on the side of Truth, hear my voice…

United in their witness to the truth, the martyrs fulfil what Jesus said to Pilate during his own juridical proceeding. “For this I was born, and for this I have come into the world to bear witness to the truth, and all who are on the side of truth listen to my voice” (John 18:37). Jesus’ words to Pilate seem to imply that communion with Jesus – not autonomy and the individualistic inclinations that take root in the pursuit of autonomy – is the original reality of the person who intends to live in the truth.

It is not good for the human being to be alone… you were created to be in communion. The child in the womb can already feel communion with a person, the mother, who is sheltering and nourishing her precious baby. That is why at the moment of birth the ordinary response of a baby to a new world is to cling to the mother – to remain in communion with the mother. Has there ever been a child coming forth from the womb who immediately suspected his or her own mother as someone about to endanger his or her infant “autonomy”?

When one accepts the divine viewpoint as one’s starting point for thinking rationally – in other words, if one foregoes autonomy and grounds one’s rationality in God as the real starting point since he is the one who designed the mind and intends to pour forth his divine love into the heart that bears his imprint – one sees the individualist soil of enlightenment philosophy to be rather diseased. Nothing can grow there because there is no communion, neither with God nor with other human beings.

The beloved disciple tells us in his Gospel that these words that Jesus uttered in the presence of Pilate – “For this I was born, for this I have come into the world, to bear witness to the truth…” –

came forth from Jesus' soul only some hours before Jesus' painfully lonely passage to the Father. By means of these words, Jesus allowed his Roman judge Pontius Pilate to see through the window of eternity where divine truth abides.

Pilate was pressing Jesus to disclose to him his personal identity – it would be a matter of debate whether Pilate was really interested in who Jesus was or whether Pilate simply wanted to ascertain Jesus' level of popularity among the crowds so that he, Pilate, could contain any unexpected mob-like activity on the very day when Jerusalem was crowding with pilgrims. Not only that: the temple priests were readying themselves to make a lot of commotion by their ritual 3 pm slaughtering of the paschal lambs on this, the Preparation Day for the Passover. Pilate was a man who did not want to deal with the unpredictable, especially if unpredictable meant entirely uncontrollable.

What Jesus said to Pilate – *I was born for this, I came into the world for this, to bear witness to the truth: and all who are on the side of truth listen to my voice* – may have been utterly incomprehensible to the Roman procurator. This we gather when we hear the question Pilate tossed back at Jesus, "What is truth?" What Jesus said about himself to Pilate – his divine choice to enter human history and human geography in order to be a martyr to the truth and to speak the truth to all who would listen – may have transcended the boundaries of Pilate's mental categories whatever they may have happened to be.

What Jesus said about himself to Pilate has baffled all those philosophers of the modern era who chose to sail in the wake of the "enlightened" refusal to believe that choosing to submit to ecclesial authority can be a choice to submit to divinely revealed truth. Those who pretentiously claimed that their movement towards intellectual liberation from the restraints of authority was a radical movement towards human maturity refused to believe that the choice to anchor one's judgment of what is really true in the disclosures of divine authority can indeed be an intellectual liberation. What we are referring to as authentic liberation is the desired relaxation of all the restraints that authority's critics impose when they, the so-called enlightened ones, choose to ridicule those who plant their prerogatives for intellectual freedom not within their personal autonomy but rather within the soil of that freedom’s Author – God himself.

5. But… maybe the Enlightenment is right…

Contemporary social science, however – taking its cue from catastrophic events of the twentieth century – seems to cast a puzzling shadow on the issue of submission to authority. Two series of social psychological experiments, designed to shed light on Adolf Eichmann’s inexplicable submission to authority that led to the slaughter of approximately six million innocent Jews, seems to buttress the enlightenment position. If Kant had been alive in the 20th century, he could have told all of us, “I knew this was going to happen... I told you so.”

Stanley Milgram and Philip Zimbardo were two secondary school friends who, each in his own way, showed experimentally how a person can lose their anchor in personal rationality by thoughtlessly obeying an authority who issues prescribed rules (the focus of Milgram’s shock experiments) or by thoughtlessly submitting to prescribed roles, established not only by authority’s directives but also by the pulls and tugs of peer pressure (Zimbardo’s point of concentration).[13]

Scientifically speaking, Milgram’s series of experiments proved more thought-provoking because they satisfied a very important criterion for hypothesis verification. Social scientists from various cultures around the globe at various junctures of recent history were able to replicate his studies and issue forth the same pattern of results even if exact percentages varied from place to place and from time to time. In other words, Milgram’s experimental procedures were able to give force to the fact that the phenomenon of obedience to authority in situations that violate personal norms of conscience transcend specific differences occasioned by tradition, culture, ethnic practices and historical period. It is not an exaggeration to say that Milgram’s research has

[13] Milgram summarized his series of experiments, the hypotheses he was attempting to verify and the results he actually obtained in a classic 1974 book entitled *Obedience to Authority: An Experimental View.* New York: Harper Collins.

played a very responsible role in the formation of social psychology as a field of study.

Milgram's basic paradigm involved three persons but it was really only one person that the experiment purported to observe and study – this person that was the focus of the research was labelled "Teacher" because his role was to be teaching a "Learner" memory exercises. For each mistake the Learner would make, the teacher was instructed by the experimenter to administer a shock of increasing intensity and hence of more severe pain. It was the Teacher's propensity to give what ostensibly were quite harmful shocks that concerned Milgram and his colleagues.

The one running the experiment acted as the person in authority: how the Teacher responded to the Experimenter's directives was indeed the phenomenon under scrutiny. In the initial studies, it was Milgram himself who did this. The naïve subject of the experiment, who played the role of teacher, "ought" to give shocks of increasing intensity to a learner who was making mistakes. How he responded to this role was the source of the principal experimental data. Thirdly, an actor working with the experimenter whose job it was to convince the Teacher that he was really suffering every time the Teacher shocked him was the one supposedly learning memory tasks. As a conspirator with the Experimenter, the Learner had to give convincing signs that he was getting increasingly hurt and distressed by each increase in shock level.

The experimental task was as follows: the experimenter instructed the experimental subject, i.e., the teacher, that he was to give simple memory tasks to the learner (i.e., the actor working with the experimenter who pretended to be shocked, but hardly any subject knew that the learner was pretending). Each time the learner made a mistake the teacher was to "punish" the learner by administering a shock that would be 15 volts more intense than the previous one. How the experimental subject, the so-called teacher was going to respond to the experimenter's directives was the focus of the study.

Would the teacher submit to the experimenter's authority even if the experimenter's directives seemed to be gravely contrary to acceptable moral norms?

At the beginning of the experiment the experimenter gave the teacher-subject a real 45-volt shock with the electric generator so that the subject could believe that all shocks were real. In fact this 45-volt shock that the teacher felt before the experiment was the only time during the whole process that anybody was really getting shocked. During the actual experiment, each time the teacher administered what he or she thought was a real shock, the generator made a mechanical sound that became shriller with each increasing level of shock. This sound also served to simulate genuine charges of electricity.

The learner, acting according to a pre-arranged script would always respond to a shock as if he or she were really in pain. The learner would groan, complain, yell, shout, cry violently or keep a stony silence according to the particular intensity of the shock.

At 150 volts, the level at which the learner begged to be released from the experiment, the majority of the teacher-subjects expressed doubts and began questioning the experimenter. The experimenter typically reassured them by saying they would not be held responsible for the consequences. Indeed the experimenter followed a standard procedure for responding to their vacillation when they began giving more intense shocks. He would say to the teacher-subjects:

- Please continue.
- The experiment requires that you continue.
- It is absolutely essential that you continue.
- You have no choice, you must go on.

At 300 volts the learner declared that he or she was not going to speak any more. When the learner made this declaration, the experimenter told the teacher that silence is also considered to be an error so the shocks must continue to increase.

All evidence indicated that the teacher-subjects upon whom the experiment concentrated its hypotheses were authentically deceived by the learner whom they were supposedly shocking. In other words, the subjects showed by their conflicts of conscience, noticeable signs of anxiety, distress, doubt and consternation, and by what they said during their post-experimental interviews that they thought they were really shocking the learner.

Milgram felt a surge of scientific curiosity and so decided to ask various groups to offer their predictions about the experimental outcome before he even began observing the teacher-subjects. A group of 40 psychiatrists from a medical school, for example, predicted that by the 300-volt shock, when the victim refuses to answer, only 3.73 percent of the subjects would still be administering shocks.

In Milgram's first set of experiments, 65% (26 of 40), administered the highest shock on the board, a 450-volt shock that was unmistakably labelled as lethally dangerous. Many teacher-subjects showed their discomfort: they knew they were violating moral imperatives of their personal conscience. Milgram concluded in a 1974 article, *The Perils of Obedience*: "The extreme willingness of adults to go to almost any length on the command of an authority constitutes the chief finding of the study and the fact most urgently demanding explanation."

Dr. Thomas Blass of the University of Maryland in the U.S.A. performed a meta-analysis on the results of repeated performances of the experiment by various researchers in various places at various times: the percentage of participants who were prepared to inflict fatal voltages remained constant, 61-66 percent, regardless of time or place.[14]

---

[14] T. Blass (1991). The Milgram paradigm after 35 years: Some things we know about obedience to authority. In *Journal of Applied Social Psychology,* 29/5, 955-978. Notable among Blass's findings is the male-female comparison, a popular research variable for psychologists of every culture. Milgram had found an identical rate of obedience in both groups, 65%, although women consistently reported more stress than men. In other words, objectively speaking, they inflicted the same amount of suffering and anguish on their victims, but they felt worse about it. Blass reports that there are about a dozen replications of the obedience experiment world-wide which had male and female subjects. All of them, with one exception, found no male-female differences. Blass's article also notes that no significant differences were found in the tendency to submit to authority in these shock experiments when the point of comparison was the year in which the experiment was conducted. Those doing the experiment in 1985 acquiesced to authority even to the extent of administering the lethal shock dosage more or less at the same rate as those tested in 1961. Because Milgram died in untimely fashion at the age of 51 years, Blass took it upon himself to devote a website to the global influence that Milgram's experiments have exerted. See www.stanleymilgram.com

One of the teacher-subjects in a 1964 presentation of the experiment – a subject whose name has not been disclosed – faced a critical dilemma during a tragically bloody period of the Viet Nam war: the American government was exercising its authority to draft him into the military. Choosing his words thoughtfully and courageously, he explained to Milgram what he learned from the experiment and how doing the experiment helped him make an intelligent decision:

> While I was a subject in 1964, though I believed that I was hurting someone, I was totally unaware of why I was doing so. Few people ever realize when they are acting according to their own beliefs and when they are meekly submitting to authority… To permit myself to be drafted with the understanding that I am submitting to authority's demand to do something very wrong would make me frightened of myself… I am fully prepared to go to jail if I am not granted Conscientious Objector status. Indeed, it is the only course I could take to be faithful to what I believe. My only hope is that members of my board act equally according to their conscience…[15]

The conscientious objector who wrote these words in a message that he sent to Milgram makes specific reference to the fact that rather than submitting blindly to a directive from civil authority that seemed clearly morally wrong, he chose to obey the directives of conscience – i.e., to be faithful to what he believed. His conscience was the authority in which he anchored his refusal to collaborate with war and its evils. But the conscientious objector was also offering an important insight that has escaped the accumulation of rationalist insights engendered by the Enlightenment: he was basing his decision of conscience on what he learned, not from interior recourse to a categorical imperative, but from a communal experience, namely, that of Milgram’s shock experiment.

Conscience formation is not an individualist project that engages one’s personal rational resources to the exclusion of authority as Immanuel Kant may have you believe. Just as this conscientious objector to the war illustrates by his openness to Milgram and his experimental dynamics, conscience formation is

[15] S. Milgram (1974), *Obedience to Authority: An Experimental View,* 200.

pre-eminently inter-subjective and communal with a number of significant others: as little children, with parents, teachers, and siblings; during the years of middle childhood and adolescence, with those who hold positions of authority in the belief systems and institutions to which the child and his family are adhering; when someone in authority abuses or neglects his or her responsibility, peers become dramatically more important in conscience formation.

Ultimately, throughout the span of life, God himself is the initiator, protector, and supreme designer of conscience in its capacity to know and bear witness to the truth. God is the author of human freedom: he is also the Author of Truth in all its symphonic dimensions. It remains a mystery why God entrusts human beings with such extensive authority in the sacred task of conscience formation.[16]

The Stanford prison experiment was a study of the psychological effects of subscribing to role prescriptions within a prison situation.[17] Professor Philip Zimbardo and his team of researchers conducted the experiment at Stanford University in California of the United States from 14 August to 20 August 1971. Military personnel from the U.S. Navy and Marine Corps took an interest in the study because of real-life conflicts between guards and prisoners in their military prisons.

Twenty-four male students out of 75 were selected to take on randomly assigned roles of prisoners and guards in a mock prison

---

[16] See Hans Urs von Balthasar (1987), *Truth is Symphonic: Aspects of Christian Pluralism.* Transl. by Graham Harrison. San Francisco: Ignatius Press.

[17] Zimbardo reported the results of his experiment in two journals. (1) C. Haney, W.C. Banks & P.G. Zimbardo (1973), Study of prisoners and guards in a simulated prison. *Naval Research Reviews,* 9, 1-17. Washington, D.C.: Office of Naval Research. (2) C. Haney, W.C. Banks, P.G. Zimbardo (1973), Interpersonal dynamics in a simulated prison. *International Journal of Criminology and Penology,* 1, 69-97. More recently, Zimbardo discusses what happened during his experiment in more detail and makes enlightening comparisons with what happens in actual prison situations in P.G. Zimbardo (2007), *The Lucifer Effect: Understanding How Good People Turn Evil.* New York: Random House.

situated in the basement of the Stanford psychology building. It was supposed to be a two-week experiment.

The instructions that Zimbardo gave to the ones accepting the roles of guards have become the subject of discussion and controversy from the time of the original experiment to today. Why? … for the simple reason that Zimbardo reported that his experimental design presented as the main situational variables the written rules and role prescriptions that pertained to the two groups, guards and prisoners. But in his actual conduct of the experiment he added another variable which may have significantly affected the behaviour of the participants: he gave his own verbal instructions by way of an exhortation. What he told them was as follows:

> You can create in the prisoners, feelings of boredom, a sense of fear to some degree, you can create a notion of arbitrariness that their life is totally controlled by us, by the system, you, me, and they’ll have no privacy… We’re going to take away their individuality in various ways. In general what all this leads to is a sense of powerlessness. That is, in this situation we’ll have all the power and they’ll have none.

With this verbal instruction, Zimbardo was presenting himself as an authority, precisely, a psychologist invested with the mandate to advance scientific knowledge about what affects human behaviour in a situation that could arouse antipathy. Acting under the influence not only of the written role prescriptions but also under the directives they had received from Zimbardo, those playing the role of prison guard acted in a manner that could only be called malicious when prisoners refused to obey directives. On the second day of the experiment, for example, the three prisoners in Cell 1 blockaded their cell door with their beds, took off their stocking caps, and refused to come out or follow the guards’ instructions. Guards unleashed fire extinguishers at the rebellious prisoners, a rather dangerous behaviour that could physically harm even the healthiest, strongest person.

Guards forced the prisoners to repeat their assigned numbers with total disregard for the prisoners’ names to reinforce the fact that the number was equivalent to their new identity. Aggressive guard behaviour accounted for a rapid decline in sanitary conditions. Guards would not allow some prisoners to urinate or defecate anywhere but in a bucket placed in their cell. As a form of punishment, the guards would not let the prisoners empty the sanitation buckets.

Zimbardo's future wife, Christina Maslach, came into the research area in order to conduct interviews. What she saw appalled her so much that she mustered all her wits to convince Zimbardo that he should stop the experiment, which he did, after only 6 days. Most of the guards were upset when the experiment concluded so prematurely.

Zimbardo noted that the environmental conditions of the experiment together with the scripts that both guards and prisoners had received exerted much more influence on the behaviours of individuals in both groups than any personality pre-disposition on the part of the participants. Hence he interpreted the significant events of this pseudo-prison situation as further confirmation of Milgram's findings: ordinary people did not act in Milgram's studies according to their personality dispositions but rather to the environmental cues that were impinging themselves on these ordinary people as manifestations of authority on the part of the experimenter and his team.

Both Milgram and Zimbardo seemed to be confirming by their experiments that human beings thoughtlessly conform to directives issuing from authority even when those directives contradict the moral requirements of the appropriately formed conscience. In other words, they seemed to be confirming Kant's accusation towards the rationally immature who do not seem to think and make choices by themselves. The word "conformity" became a watchword not only for the psychologists who studied conformity as a behavioural/attitudinal phenomenon but also for practitioners of political science, law, pedagogy, history, literature, theatre, and film. The operative historical paradigm was that of the Nazi regime where apparently respectable people with moral backbone suddenly degenerated under the pressure to conform to those in authority. What Kant said in his essay seemed tragically accurate even many generations after his essay first reached publication.

Milgram's experiment quickly became the paradigm in the social sciences. But when evaluations of his and Zimbardo's experimental design actually took a more thoughtful approach, conformity no longer seemed to be the culprit. The Enlightenment principle deserved to be questioned and suspected.

6. Do human beings surrender their freedom to be rational in order to conform to higher authority?

In the year 2006, two social scientists Alex Haslam and Steve Reicher designed what is called the BBC Prison Study. It was a partial replication of Zimbardo's prison experiment but the results and conclusions were not the same. This study questioned the notion that people slip mindlessly into roles; and it gave force and vigour to the conviction that tyranny of the kind that draws forth obedience can manifest charismatic dimensions of leadership that are appealing to people who actually do exercise rationality and intellectual ingenuity. In other words, it is not a case of impeding a person's freedom by pressuring the person to conform; rather it is an appeal to the person's freedom to make his or her own choice to obey those who present themselves as attractively "obey-able."

And what endows a person or a group with the charismatic ability to draw forth obedience?

First, one has plenty of accumulated evidence offered by Eichmann and others throughout the Nazi's trials that reveal his real frame of mind. A Nazi bureaucrat like himself was not simply following the orders of higher military or civil authority in a mindless, automaton-like fashion in order to commit atrocities that someone acting according to the parameters of a well-formed moral conscience would refrain from doing.

What really frightened the Kantians of the 20th century, what really sent chills up their spine was Eichmann's admission during the trials that he **always followed Kant's categorical imperative as his own moral principle.** This statement certainly caught the judge's attention. When he asked Eichmann to tell the court what the categorical imperative was in concrete terms, Eichmann gave a substantially meaningful and quite accurate definition. That stunned the academic experts even more.

What brought the Kantian ethical principles into the elite chambers of rigorous academic suspicion was Eichmann's further elaboration: he believed he was obeying intelligent people, obey-able because they were rationally insightful. Even though Eichmann – and the one reporting the trial, Hannah Arendt – did not explicitly say so, there was an exceedingly tragic implication to what Eichmann was saying: the rationally alert, intelligent leaders of the Third Reich could not be accused of ignoring Kantian ethics: **they, too, were themselves following Kant's categorical imperative.** Kantian ethics was on the verge of collapse.[18]

Why?

Because Kant, as so many other European epistemologists had dared to leave God's authority out of their ethical equations, moral authority for them was vested in rational principles, understood humanistically, yes, but applied without any reference to the question: "What might God say about this?"

Those, like Eichmann, who were to execute orders issued by higher authority manifested, therefore, a very good understanding of what they were doing and took pride in the energy and application that they brought to the task at hand. Typically too, those in higher authority were prescribing roles and rules that carried a certain ambiguity, especially since these authority figures could be working at a distance from the contexts they were trying to manipulate. Hence those who wanted to advance the Nazi program to exterminate the Jews (and not all did) plunged themselves into a frenzy of creativity and imagination in order to work towards what they assumed to be the regime's goals and to overcome the obstacles associated with any given attempt to accomplish those goals. Their explanations for what they did seemed to carry the rationale: we were acting legitimately.

Eichmann, for example, had to work out the details of the "final solution" himself; and he did not hesitate to confront and actually disobey his superiors – Himmler was one – when he,

[18] The primary figure who gives us careful records of what was said during the Eichmann trial is Hannah Arendt. For the segment of the trial that concerned Kant and for Arendt's interpretation of that segment – she was trying to save Kant's reputation – see her *Eichmann in Jerusalem: A Report on the Banality of Evil.* New York: The Viking Press, 1964, 66.

Eichmann, did not believe that his superiors intended to be faithful to the Nazi principles of ethnic genocide. What was truly frightening about Eichmann was not that he was unaware of what he was doing, but rather that he knew what he was doing and believed it to be right. Indeed, his one regret, expressed prior to his trial, was that he had not killed more Jews.[19]

Haslam and Reicher noticed that the participants in their research illustrate by their behaviour during the experiment and by their comments during the debriefing sessions that their intention to remain loyal to the purpose and methods of the research tend to eclipse their attentiveness to the voice of suffering. They believed that their decisions and actions had a worthy purpose even if other people suffered quite intense levels of emotional and physical pain. The mindset in question sadly resembles that of Caiaphas in the Christian Scriptures who offered his seal of approval to the brutal killing of God’s eternal Son because, he claimed, it served a “necessary” purpose: that of forestalling a Roman attempt to crush the entire nation.

The fundamental point is that tyranny does not flourish because perpetrators are blind conformists that authority figures have rendered helpless and ignorant in order to secure their continuing obedience. Tyranny flourishes because the ones obeying are indeed perpetrators who actively identify with those who promote vicious acts as necessary in order to protect social goals; like the guards in the prison studies, these are people who exercise ingenuity and insight in order to make sure that the social and political engineers accomplish their designs no matter how hurtful they may be to the poor and underprivileged.

7. What happens when one intelligently obeys the voice of Truth?

The voice of Truth offers the grace of an axial shift of consciousness: with the supernatural help of divine wisdom, human beings can submit their cognitive processes to a basic shift of parameters – they can dissolve the conviction that those in authority must seek to implement social policies and programs

[19] D. Cesarani (2004), *Eichmann: His Life and Crimes.* London: Heinemann.

regardless of the cost to marginalized, isolated and suffering human beings; and they can bring to birth the conviction that true human rationality is wholeheartedly willing to anchor itself in the virtues of compassion, thoughtfulness, empathy and solidarity in order to bring the discouraged, lonely, humiliated and suffering human being into an ethos of dignity and respect.

8. Mother Teresa and Edith Stein – to know means to be in communion

Mother Teresa's epistemology travelled in quite a different direction than that of the European Enlightenment and the various amplifications, transformations, reversions, and nullifications that European epistemology visited upon the operations of human reason. Not surprisingly, Teresa's epistemology did not find reference points in what social psychologists might offer through their experimental research. Her epistemology, rather, is pre-eminently communal. Indeed her daily practice was not to wake up in the morning in order to think for herself, by herself, with herself as guide but rather to seek communion with Jesus and to find her personal truth in that communion – *... those who are on the side of truth, listen to my voice* was the testimony that Jesus gave during his trial before Pilate; and it was the daily conviction of Mother Teresa.

It is remarkable that a philosopher of Middle Eastern origins who found herself in Edmond Husserl's circle of phenomenologists could bring to the epistemological enterprise a community-based mindset, i.e., a mindset quite in harmony with Mother Teresa's, that differed radically from the individualistic tendencies of Enlightenment thinkers and those who followed in their wake.

As a phenomenologist, Edith Stein occupied herself principally with essences. Indeed her doctoral dissertation explained emphatically and convincingly that the ability to think in a communal manner by means of a process called empathy is a characteristic that belongs to the very essence of human rationality.

Expressed simply, the human capacity for empathy means that a human being is not only able to consider life from his or her point of view – data that I sense, perceive and come to understand are not only “data-for-me.” The human being, rather, is essentially a communal being: he or she may see, feel, and apprehend life from the point of view of other people.

One of Edith’s colleagues who gave witness to her holiness at the Beatification ceremony, Fr. John Nota, S.J., offers a fine synthesis of Edith’s insight about the communion that human beings can enjoy with each other by means of their ability to empathize:

> Returning from God to his creation Edith Stein develops how all creation is an image of God. Human beings are God’s image in a special way… God created man and woman according to his image as spiritual-personal beings. One wonders, if this was the reason that it was “no good” that one would be alone, because the deepest sense of spiritual-personal being is mutual love and oneness of a plurality of persons in love. The Lord gave Adam a help as his counterpart… a companion, corresponding to him as one hand to another. She was almost exactly like him and still a little bit different, and so she was capable of a proper and complementary action, according to her bodily and psychic being. We are allowed, Edith Stein thinks, to interpret the ‘to be in one flesh’ not only as an essential unity of the bodily nature… but at the same time as a crossing of life-happenings which let grow from both a unity of being. In that case a still deeper unity will be possible for the souls, because on the level of the spirit, there is a communion that does not have its equal on the level of the body; the created image of the love between the eternal Father and the divine Son. All creatures have their own nature, not one nature together as the divine Persons. But the human souls are able, because of their free spirituality, to open themselves to each other and to receive the other into oneself in loving surrender.[20]

In her more mature years, as a Carmelite contemplative Sister consecrated to God by the vow of chastity, Edith showed an intelligent reluctance to confine her insight to the marital state. Communion on the level of spirit is what God intends for the entire human family, for we are created to be an image of the eternal love that unites the Father and the Son in the Holy Spirit. Edith invites us to consider ourselves as a thoroughly interwoven, thoughtfully loving family because she hopes that we are recognizing God’s

[20] J. Nota (1987), Edith Stein and Martin Heidegger in *Edith Stein Symposium: Teresian Culture,* Washington, D.C.: ICS Publications.

wish that we love each other as one beautiful family who blissfully live under the same roof.[21] Empathy is a necessary rational dimension for those who are to live in this particular spiritual communion with each other.

It was enlivened by this spirit of empathy that Edith Stein – known in religious life as St. Teresa Benedicta of the Cross – died as an executed victim of the same Third Reich that Eichmann believed he was serving with such rational correctness.

Both Mother Teresa and Edith Stein anchored their ethics in a rationalism that finds its starting point in God and then proceeds to become manifest to the human heart within the communal context of the family.

When the ought-to-be-obeyed imperatives of God enter the cognitive process of individuals, families and communities, another axial shift of consciousness takes place. All who are on the side of truth hear Jesus' voice and that voice is saying, "If you do not become as a child, you cannot enter the Kingdom of heaven."

It is remarkable that even in a Church that recognizes a categorical imperative of divine origin, "Be one in solidarity with the poor," children are often omitted from the picture. A tragic implication that flows forth from those who ignore Stein's and Teresa's mindset is the grave harm visited upon the soul of a child who is born from parents who think and make decisions individualistically, in other words, according to the cultural mindset of those developed countries that insist upon individual liberties at the expense of family and community development.

Tailay Mkuna of Jordan University College in Morogoro points out that there is a serious perversion at work in those sexual relationships where a man and a woman, rationalizing their behaviour in the name of personal autonomy, may unite with each other sexually but simultaneously lock their hearts into an

---

[21] The image of the human family as a communion of men, women and children happy to live under the same roof comes anonymously from a Korean priest who expressed this conviction in the preparatory materials for the 44th International Eucharistic Congress which took place in Seoul in 1989. The theme of the congress was universal solidarity, verbalized according to Ephesians 2:14, "Christ, our Peace!" (I was present at the Congress as a delegate for Mexico).

individualistic mindset and so avoid the issue of readiness to welcome children and to love them responsibly. Even here conformity is at work: the contraceptive mentality may be a sad example of how men and women conform to voices that tease and please, and so assume for themselves persuasive power in the public square independent of the voice of divine Truth.

What seems to inject particularly treacherous poison into the message of those who would persuade is their apparent ability to convince the naïve and the thoughtless that the pleasure-inducing, self-gratifying, unrestrained impulse to do as one wishes is authentically human: it corresponds to the categorical imperative.

When such individualism dominates the sexual/marital relationship, bitterness, love and lust vie for attention in the secret recesses of the heart – and the conviction that each and every child – indeed each and every person – is a most precious gift from God to the family evaporates.[22]

Often those involved in sexual relationships are giving priority to their own professional future. Often they are in need of what their partner in the relationship can give them economically or affectively. In these scenarios, children are marginalized.

Tailay suggests that when a man and a woman engage in marital relations with an attitude that children are unwelcome, for example, by intentionally impeding the possibility of having children through the use of contraceptives, the children to whom they later give birth may feel that they themselves were not really wanted. This eventuality leaves the child feeling alone and separated from parental love, which is precisely the situation that God says is "not good."[23] If either the father or the mother abuses the authority that naturally belongs to him or her by issuing orders that frighten the children, harm them or discourage them from harmonious relationships with the other parent or with their siblings, such

[22] For the citations she has chosen and for her own conclusions that she draws from her research, see T. Mkuna (2015), *Assessment of the Family Climate that Occasions Repeated Child Physical Abuse in Tanzania: The Child's Point of View,* Morogoro: Jordan University College Library Resources, 1-4, 35-39.

[23] Genesis 2:18.

orders may reinforce the feeling that they are not wanted. This is certainly not indicative of rational maturity.

The citations that Tailay offers and the conclusions she reaches on the basis of her own interviews with abused children are clear and to the point: a person is most rationally mature when he or she is ready to sacrifice autonomous pursuits for the good of others, especially for those who, like children, are fragile, vulnerable, and in constant need of others' loving attention. The authority at work is not a categorical imperative intrinsic to practical reason that, within a dynamic of rational freedom, establishes a person as truly human. The moral authority at work, rather, is the God who gives the human being the rational choice to accept him, God, as eternal Love, pouring himself forth as Goodness and Gift. The voice of divine authority does not deprive one of freedom: on the contrary, divine authority energizes and renders dynamic the impulse to actuate all human potential to freely love and give oneself to the beloved and at that very moment, to procreate life.

The child, a most precious gift of love, is the doorway through which a human being may enter God's very own mindset and hence into the communion of saints.[24]

Parents need divine authority: listening to God's voice supersedes listening to one's own voice no matter how intelligent the person may seem to be. Perhaps rational consciousness seems to be a seedbed of respect for the human being as an end-in-himself or herself, created for his/her own sake; perhaps practical, rational consciousness seems to be freely and intelligently accepting the moral dynamisms proper to human attitude and behaviour… nevertheless if the person is choosing to ignore the sacredness that God has invested in the act of sexual intercourse, to intentionally disregard God's intention that those who are married be ready to welcome children precisely by means of marital intercourse, and so to depart even for an isolated moment from one's vocation to be a person of moral integrity – this is not only self-centred individualism; it is blatantly irrational.

To devote obsessively one's full emotional energy to what one can get out of the sexual relationship rather than what one can

[24] See also Matthew 18:1-4.

responsibly and generously put into it – this is a situation that disfigures the human heart, corrupts rationality, and – most importantly – signals the need of the human person to admit that he or she has been acting inhumanly. It is the moment to submit to the prerogatives of divine authority: the Kantian imperative "dare to know" becomes the divine invitation "trust that God knows and submit yourself to him."

This is why Mother Teresa insisted with the United Nations in New York City and with other international audiences that the greatest destroyer of the human heart is not war but abortion. Abortion violates the initial, mother-child communion that every human being should be able to enjoy from the moment of conception. Abortion is also a grievous indication that a woman and a man engaged in sexual relations without the conviction that any child conceived from the relationship deserves to be wanted, respected, loved and nurtured.[25]

---

[25] Mkuna, *Assessment of the Family Climate,* 5; see Mother Teresa's address at the United Nations' International Conference on Population and Development, Cairo, Egypt, Sept 9, 1994. Noteworthy among her remarks were: "I was surprised in the West to see so many young boys and girls given to drugs. And I tried to find out why. Why is it like that, when those in the West have so many more things than those in the East? And the answer was: 'Because there is no one in the family to receive them.' Our children depend on us for everything – their health, their nutrition, their security, their coming to know and love God. For all of this, they look to us with trust, hope and expectation. But often father and mother are so busy they have no time for their children, or perhaps they are not even married or have given up on their marriage. So their children go to the streets and get involved in drugs or other things. We are talking of love of the child, which is where love and peace must begin. These are the things that break peace…

"But I feel that the greatest destroyer of peace today is abortion, because it is a war against the child, a direct killing of the innocent child, murder by the mother herself. And if we accept that a mother can kill even her own child, how can we tell other people not to kill one another? How do we persuade a woman not to have an abortion? As always, we must persuade her with love and we remind ourselves that love means to be willing to give until it hurts. Jesus gave even His life to love us. So, the mother who is thinking of abortion, should be helped to love, that is, to give until it hurts her plans, or her free time, to respect the life of her child. The father of that child, whoever he is, must also give until it hurts."

The alert reader has probably noticed by this time that I have been referring to Mother Teresa as an epistemologist – as if she were a philosopher in her own right who has elaborated her ideas and intuitions in systematic fashion through monographs, treatises, or some other identifiable form of philosophical literature. What has provoked me to "dare" to call Mother Teresa an epistemologist cradled in the communal nature of rationality is actually a significant insight of a truly philosophical personality, namely, Bernard Lonergan, S.J.

Lonergan expressed the communal roots of rationality within the idiom of divine love:

> It used to be said, *Nihil amatum nisi praecognitum,* Knowledge precedes love… There is a minor exception to this rule inasmuch as people do fall in love, and that falling in love is something disproportionate to its causes, conditions, occasions, antecedents. For falling in love is a new beginning, an exercise of vertical liberty in which one's world undergoes a new organization. But the major exception to the Latin tag is God's gift of his love flooding our hearts.[26] Then we are in the dynamic state of being in love. But who it is we love, is neither given nor as yet understood. Our capacity for moral self-transcendence has found a fulfilment that brings deep joy and profound peace. Our love reveals to us values we had not appreciated, values of prayer and worship, or repentance and belief. But if we would know what is going on within us, if we would learn to integrate it with the rest of our living, we have to inquire, investigate, seek counsel. So it is that in religious matters love precedes knowledge and, as that love is God's gift, the very beginning of faith is due to God's grace.[27]

Mother Teresa lived the primacy of God's love: she allowed divine love to flood her heart and reorganize for her all those situational variables that mediated the Truth-in-itself, that is to say, that finds its origin in divine wisdom. For her to live, suffer and die within the Truth meant to live, suffer and die in compassion and solidarity with all those humiliated, lonely, rejected and abandoned

[26] Lonergan here seems to be simply rephrasing Romans 5:5. Other phrases within this citation show a marked resemblance to the convictions expressed in Ephesians 3:14-21.

[27] B. Lonergan (1972), *Method in Theology.* New York: Herder and Herder, 122-123.

people who thirsted painfully for her love. They were rendering really present to her, her crucified Lord and Savior. He is the Faithful Witness to the truth that God is the Love always ready to suffer.

When one accepts divine revelation as data that house the truth, one arrives at three principles that tie directly into the issue of the capacity to live and die according to the dynamisms of the truth. First, the human being needs a family with the lifelong friendships that a family entails. My family is my first direct experience of God’s gratuitous and generous love. It is my first experience of communion with Jesus, a communion in love but at the same time a Lord-disciple relationship. It is also my first experience of culture: indeed my culture is itself a gift that blossoms forth from God’s love and generosity. Edith Stein dwells on this dimension of family and culture in her autobiographical *Life in a Jewish Family.*[28]

Within the family, I come to recognize a second principle: the data of wisdom that God makes so generously available is not primarily for the super-smart, that is to say, for the heart and mind that are energetically intelligent or incisively rational. No; instead God has chosen to reveal his Love and Truth to the little ones. And the one who refuses to become as a little child can never enter into communion with divine wisdom. I am a little one when my criteria for action are not the product of my speculative, pure reason, but rather are the product of my very reasonable choice to let God give me my criteria for action.

To say the same thing in different words, no one becomes a philosopher if he or she does not become a child totally dependent on the mysterious wisdom of the Creator. One has to live in lifelong friendship with the little ones. But the data coming to us from the divine wellspring offer yet a third principle: this principle may actually be the most important because God has indicated that our future within eternity depends on our acceptance or rejection of this third principle. And what is this principle?

[28] E. Stein (1986), *Life in a Jewish Family: Her Unfinished Autobiographical Account,* transl. by Sr. Josephine Koeppel, OCD. New York: ICS Publications.

It is this: besides a communion with my family and my community that is based on empathy, I must also learn that I am to enter into a lifelong friendship with those who suffer as Jesus, the living Fountain of divine Wisdom has suffered. We are speaking of a culture where humility and meekness give rise to thoughtful compassion and a limitless capacity to forgive. You might say it is an advanced empathy. To suffer with those who suffer is compassion; and without compassion one cannot become a wise human being, one cannot really become fully human. I am speaking of the compassion that flows like a mighty river of living water from the heart of the person who recognizes that his or her family is not confined to his or her village, district, region or country. I am speaking of the compassion that is, to our astonishment, missing from Enlightenment principles. I am referring to the compassion that, to our shock and surprise, was painfully absent from the choices that participants in social psychology experiments were formulating.

When I speak of that advanced form of empathy called compassion, I am speaking of the one who gives welcome to all those who are utterly deprived of the love and tenderness of the family. We think of the first Christian arrival in Africa: it was the baby Jesus himself cut off from his village of Bethlehem, from his country of Israel – a child refugee to whom the people of Egypt gave hearty welcome.

9. Today's Witnesses to the Truth

We think of a most recent Christian enterprise at the University of Cape Town South Africa. A cursory reading of Amazement Ndungane's activities in that university's prolife movement shows a culture of truth in the making – she is living as a martyr to the truth. The priorities she and her companions have pursued, for example, in the year 2010 manifest heartfelt dedication to the principles of compassion and communion: (a) a united effort to bring the homeless together under one roof, to feed and clothe them and so to give them a sense of human brotherhood, sisterhood and friendship; (b) a united effort to bring encouragement and a sense of solidarity to all those engaged in saving the unborn children through the challenging enterprise of pregnancy counselling; (c) by means of reaching out to other university organizations, the effort to awaken compassion and conviction in the hearts of those individuals who may not easily rely on divine wisdom; and (d) the united effort on the part of the university students to embrace a medical practitioner who was on the forefront of the effort to create in South Africa an ethos of compassion for all unborn children.

The failure to recognize the transformation of human rationality by the infusion of divine love that "floods" the heart, to use Lonergan's expression, is precisely the Achilles' heel of Enlightenment rationalism – it is the Enlightenment's failure to grasp this notion of God's compassion-generating activity within human rationality that causes it to founder without any possibility of re-stabilizing. Because Immanuel Kant did not understand this original unity, in love, of the human person with his/her Creator, he believed any kind of miracle – a work that finds its origin in divine wisdom but a wisdom that nevertheless is at work in the human heart – is not really an authentic exercise of rationality but rather is an act that engenders superstition: "To think that, through the gift of a really firm theoretical faith in miracles, man could himself perform them and so storm heaven – this is to venture so far beyond the limits of reason that we are not justified in tarrying long over such a senseless conceit."[29]

Because Georg W. F. Hegel did not understand how God's wisdom, exercised with compassion, may transform human rationality he delegated miracles – indeed the entire historical sojourn on earth of the Incarnated God in Jesus – to the dustbins of pictorial thinking and imaginative representations of a distant past. Hegel does not try to conceal his pejorative attitude towards the historical presence of the Incarnate God, when he says that this presence, "the historical manner in which spirit once upon a time appeared, the soulless recollection of a presumably individual historical figure and its past" is nothing but an "impoverishment"

[29] I. Kant (1794), *Religion within the Limits of Reason Alone,* Section II (Concerning the Legal Claim of the Evil Principle to Sovereignty over Man…), General Observation, concluding remark. (The text I am using is in soft copy, Microsoft Word document, translated by T. M. Greene & H. H. Hudson.)

of the life of the spirit.[30] Miracles, according to Hegel, may be relegated to certain periods of history where one sought sensuous contact with the God who is Spirit, but miracles bear no particular relevance for the contemporary human person who has no need of miracles since he or she is utterly reasonable, is capable of scientific progress, and is in immediate communion with self-consciousness where the particularities of what is individual, sensuous and historical are alienating.

When one's moral compass is pointed in the right direction, one's choices for action cohere with the Truth that one perceives a stream of living love flowing into the constricted heart in order to expand its capacities: because this expansion of the heart's ability to see, hear, inquire, understand and make rational judgments originates in grace, i.e., in God's activity within the soul, this expansion is called supernatural. Such a term simply makes explicit the proper point of origin for the new infusion of rational capability.

Take for example the liberating power of a miracle. Miracles often defy rational explanations if and only if those explanations confine themselves to the normal operations of human reason without consideration for Divine Wisdom's ability to intervene in the ordinary circumstances of one's conscious life. How do miracles interface with the normal operations of the intellect? If we include among the really insightful philosophers of history, the one who is supremely wise – that would be God himself in Jesus Christ – we are able to appreciate the workings of divine wisdom in a human intellect.

Jesus' human rationality is not of a different nature than our own. His divine wisdom, characteristic of his divine nature, is of an infinitely different nature from our own, but by divine choice this wisdom has joined to itself a human nature with a wisdom that is proper to human nature. The purpose of the hypostatic union was to redeem the human being in such a way that the human mind and heart, limited as they are, may be so liberated that they may

[30] G. Hegel (1807), *Phenomenology of Spirit,* n. 765. (The text I am using is in soft copy, Microsoft Word document, J.B. Baillie translation, made available through the University of Idaho, Department of Philosophy, Internet utilized resources: mickelse@uidaho.edu).

participate fully in the activity of the divine Spirit (see Isaiah 11:2-6 and 2 Peter 1:4). This is a miracle of grace.

10. How divine wisdom operated in Jesus’ human soul

First, it is to be noted that Jesus could have chosen to anchor all his choices and judgments in the normal operations of human cognitive processes without recourse to his divine wisdom. From this perspective, Jesus was fully capable of the maximal degrees of intellectual maturity so ardently aspired to by the notables of the Enlightenment. This intellectual maturity is possible for all of us who enjoy the gift of mental health.

The second option, however, is one that modern philosophy has lost the ability to understand. It is no less rational – but it is not achievable by the workings of human reason alone. I am referring to the option of submitting one’s rationality to the incomprehensible workings of a divine wisdom that flows forth as a flood of compassion. While a more rigorous analysis of the operations of divine wisdom in Jesus of Nazareth goes beyond the scope of this essay, one can begin to grasp the rational integrity of Jesus’ surrender to the Father’s wisdom by means of an example:

> **Enlightened Submission to Divine Wisdom** Choosing to submit himself to the directives of divine wisdom and feeding a crowd of five thousand men together with their women and children when all he had on hand was five loaves and two fish could not possibly be a choice one would reach by confining oneself to the free workings of human rationality. Jesus’ prayer of thanksgiving that drew forth from the heart of the divine Father a divinely operative blessing was more than enough to feed everyone; and it was an act of submission that supersedes the ability of human understanding to recognize and evaluate the relevant questions that could have led to Jesus’ choice. What seems to have happened is that Jesus wisely surrendered himself to the mysterious workings of Trinitarian compassion.

Nevertheless, Jesus’ greatest act of love for the poorest of the poor was not really a charitable gift of bread and fish as miraculous as it may have been. His gift of love was the sacrifice of his life, a gift offered in full communion with the Father’s mysterious wisdom. The Father’s love had given him the will and the power to lay down his life; this same divine love gave him the power to take it up again by rising from the dead.[31] Indeed it was this same divine wisdom and love that, in Jesus, constituted the divine will to give eternal peace and joy to all who would wisely submit themselves to that divine will. Jesus substantiated his words with deeds: from within the Paschal Mystery Jesus offered his own sacrificed body and blood as Eucharistic food and drink to all who aspired to live freely as children within the loving embrace of the Father.

None of this was calculable by human reasoning. All of us who believe in and look forward to the resurrection from the dead and the entrance into a communion of love that brings to blossom eternal peace and joy are operating not by the ordinary processes of human cognition but rather by the insights that divine wisdom offers when we choose not to be individualistic but to live in Eucharistic communion with God. This is communion with the God who floods our hearts with love and communion with the brothers and sisters whom that same love brings forth into existence.

11. Amazement Ndungane has a soul mate: Donnell Tholley[32]

A 19-year-old mother, Fatu Turay, dying from Ebola in Freetown, Sierra Leone, clutched her new-born son. The child's father was permanently absent and she had no one else to help her. Nurse Donnell Tholley, 25, had seen hundreds like Fatu in his work at Ebola clinics. Donnell knew how to keep his distance, not only physically since this disease is extremely contagious, but also emotionally in order to keep his heart free for the next patient that would need him.

Donnell is a martyr to the truth, the truth about God, about the human being, about the human heart… he is also a martyr to the truth about the fabric of the human family, its origin and its destiny. Donnell felt a surge of compassion as he asked the dying Fatu,

---

[31] Cf. John 10:18.

[32] K. Larson (3rd Sept 2015), Associated Press, Young Nurse Asked to Adopt Newborn After Mom Dies of Ebola. http://news.yahoo.com Site visited on 4th Sept 2015.

“Sweetheart, what is the name of your baby?” “Bobo,” she said in a whisper. The name in Krio means “my sweet boy.”

Tholley wasn’t sure how to accept what she was saying. He muttered, “That’s not a real name!” Impulsively he grabbed a scrap of paper, wrote down his name and phone number and gave it to her. Then he moved on to other patients. Fatu meanwhile was rushed off to yet another treatment centre – nevertheless she still held on to her baby as she struggled to live.

About a week later, Donnell received a phone call from someone unknown. A nurse was calling him. “Your wife is dying,” she said. “You must come to see her right away. She is not going to be with us much longer.”

Donnell, of course, did not have a wife. He did not understand why this nurse would call him until he remembered that indeed he had given his phone number to a dying young woman named Fatu. He thought: Could this be Fatu that is about to die?

When he arrived at the treatment centre, her body was gone: someone was preparing her body for burial. The baby boy was nowhere to be found. But the nurse was still holding the sheet of paper with Tholley’s information on it: Fatu had been clutching on to that paper as she lay dying: alone. She was a martyr to the truth: she loved her child, and to express that love with purity and honour, she held in her hands not just a piece of paper but a human being who with a surge of compassion initiated the gesture of community, of family.

The Ebola epidemic had already killed nearly 4,000 Sierra Leoneans and left thousands of orphans. Some were placed with other family members or with neighbours who welcomed them. Because Ebola had the reputation of moving quickly from person to person, many were fearful to accept children whose parents had died from the virus.

Bobo, now only two weeks old, was free from Ebola. But he was still dying: he had no mama to nurse him and no one was buying formula for him. He would wail out of hunger.

Tholley located the boy and went to see him. The nurses wanted to save the baby. They urged Donnell to consider taking the baby. Without a parent, the baby would die.

Tholley thought for a moment as an enlightened individualist who assesses situations with reasoned practicality and then advances to sound moral judgments: a man like him who worked long hours in the hospitals and treatment centres and so was also vulnerable to the epidemic could not care for a sick child.

Then Tolley thought as one who opens his heart to the Truth, to the God who is full of compassion and ready to share his power and vigour with those who are feeling tired, overworked, vulnerable and emotionally underfed. The little boy's fragility was exercising an impact, a flood of love into his heart. The little boy's ribs were about to protrude through his skin. His little feet bore scars from the disinfectant used to clean the Ebola ward where he was born.

At the centre of Tholley's thoughts was the divinely revealed datum: it is not good for the human being to be alone. His choice involved no adoption lawyers, no home studies. A week after his twenty-sixth birthday, Donnell Tholley chose to be a father. The six-week old Bobo came to his new home and felt embraced, wanted, loved – in a word, he experienced his true identity as a sacred gift from the All-Holy God. The record of the adoption is a piece of notebook paper on which a nurse from the hospital wrote in blue ball-point the names of all who witnessed the baby's arrival at his new home.

They call the boy Junior. He is now nine months old.

Tholley's working hours have decreased since the epidemic has slowed down. Tholley wants to get married and have more children someday so his son can have brothers and sisters. Did Donnell Tholley do the right thing? Yes, because his own father – the heavenly Father who is responsible for all of us who have received the gift of life – is the one who taught him to move his heart into action. There is no greater wisdom than to open one's heart to the tender, compassionate love of the God who created it.

12. Amazement Ndungane and Donnell Tholley Correct the Errors in European Epistemology

When one considers such philosophers of the modern era as Immanuel Kant, Baruch Spinoza, David Hume, John Locke and G.

Hegel – and, of course, many others – one notices a particular lacuna in their philosophies that arises from the fact that they use human reason as a major starting point without reference to the directives of divine wisdom. St. Thomas, on the other hand, is one of several among the world’s philosophers who remains anchored in divine wisdom because of his choice to accept Truth “in itself” – i.e., divine truth – as his starting point. In this Thomas coheres with Edith Stein, Paul Ricœur, Mother Teresa of Kolkata, Tailay Mkuna, Amazement Ndungane and Donnell Tholley. One finds the truth in communion with God.

In the course of this essay, we have highlighted the words of Jesus to Pilate in John 18:37-38: *This is why I was born, and why I have come into the world, to bear witness to the truth. Everyone who is of the truth hears my voice.*

To bear witness to the truth by “hearing the voice” of Jesus who is the Way, the Truth and the Life (John 14:6) is in its first phase an activity of what Kant would call pure speculative reason. This hearing of God’s voice is, for Kant, an experience of a phenomenon; for Thomas it is an experience of the love that offers to the human soul, wisdom and eternal life.

If one joins St. Thomas in his conviction that God has created the human soul in such a way that it is capable of knowing the truth about what is (i.e., being), then one also grows in his/her understanding of St. John’s notion of martyrdom: one thinks, speaks, decides and acts in full accord with the love one has come to understand through pure reason. The person who is living every moment of his or her existence as a martyr to the truth has discovered that truth by paying attention to what is, by inquiring about what is, by answering all relevant questions about what is, by judging that what one has come to understand to be, really is – it is a fact – and it deserves to be protected, confirmed and preserved by one’s “practical reason” in its identity as a gift of love.

The moral power of martyrdom finds its source in God, more precisely, his “voice”, i.e., the voice of truth and love. This is what Amazement, Donnell and Fatu have done: by their fundamental option to listen to God’s voice, they have chosen to give a voice and to give a life to those dangerously exposed to the possibility that they are going to be deprived of it. God has enabled human beings like Amazement and Donnell to know the truth. Those who bear witness to the truth may achieve full moral integrity in this life, not only by physical martyrdom – the physical shedding of blood – but by the "martyrdom of the heart" (expression from St. Jane Frances).

The martyrdom of the heart is what a person suffers when he or she has come to know what is precious, has come to value that which he or she knows to be precious, has come to love it, and now makes the informed and discerned choice to sacrifice what is precious for a higher Truth, a higher Good, a higher Beauty – for God himself in Jesus Christ. Both Amazement and Donnell had their personal priorities, but they sacrificed them in a complete re-ordering of their lives according to the contours of thoughtful love and compassion. We can say no less for Fatu.

The martyr, then, enjoys intellectual integrity: the speculative intellect and the practical intellect are all the same intellect. Practical reason is primary because pure reason has given it reliable access to the truth that grounds its moral choices. One acts as a martyr according to the requirements of the truth because one has opened the intellect to a flood of divine love, and within that wellspring of love and life has perceived what it means to enter into communion with the divine mystery. Acting upon this perception, the martyr aspires to communion with God's will as his or her eternal destiny. Submission to divine authority is an enlightened choice that ushers one forth into eternal freedom, peace, and unmitigated joy.

Development of the Concept of Emotional Intelligence

Fr. Abraham Thomas

Unit of Psychology and Counselling
Jordan University College

Abstract

Interest in Emotional Intelligence (EI) accelerated in the last decade of the twentieth century as persistent and insightful research into the possibilities for integrating a person's emotional life into the multiple avenues of cognitive process gave rise to the utility of measuring aptitude for emotional versatility. Such versatility extends well beyond the ability to recognize one's and other's emotions, to express emotion, and to integrate internal "messages" provoked by emotions into decision-making cognitive processes. Indeed by the beginning of the 21st century psychologists from all sectors began assessing the level of EI in individuals. The aptitude to permit one's emotions to stimulate intuitions that might give rise to insights otherwise not accessible to cognitive process gave especially Positive Psychologists the aspiration to place EI at the centre of their attention. The present article focuses on the conceptual and empirical development of Emotional Intelligence. A brief discussion on the quality of current EI measures and constructs precedes some humble suggestions for future research.

Key Word – Emotional intelligence

Introduction

Medieval and classical philosophers generally considered human emotions as animal instincts and hence as contrary to the rational nature of the human being. They also considered 'reasoning' as something divine. But now these concepts have shown themselves subject to change. Emotion today is never considered as something contrary, unwanted, as simply an animal instinct in human beings. Rather emotion is considered as one of three fundamental classes of mental operations natural to human beings (Mayer et al., 2000).

The other two classes that psychologists such as Mayer and his colleagues would have in mind are motivation and cognition. According to their hypotheses, motivation arise in response to internal bodily demands and states which include drives such as hunger, thirst, need for social contact, and sexual desires. Emotions form the second class of this triad. Emotions appear to have evolved across mammalian species so as to signal and respond to changes in relationships between individuals and environment. Moreover, each emotion organizes several basic behavioural responses to such changes. The third member of the triad is cognition which allows the organism to learn from the environment and to solve problems in novel situations. Cognition often serves to satisfy motives or keep emotions positive (Mayer et al., 2000).

At the beginning of the 20th century, many psychologists gave extra attention to the study of intelligence, a cognitive factor. Thingujam tells us that some of the main researchers of this field were Terman and his associates (whose publication appeared in 1916); Thurnstone, who publicized his work in 1938; Wechsler, whose research appeared the next year; and then forty-three years later, Guilford. However psychologists were not able to settle down with a commonly accepted definition of intelligence. Thingujam indicates that Spearman, publicizing his research in 1927, talked about a common ability inherent in all the tests of intelligence and a ‘specific factor’ in each test that is completely independent of other factors. In the 1980s a so-called revolutionary theorist like Stemberg indicated his agreement with classical theorists Terman and Wechsler who chose not to accept the notion of a ‘general factor’. They did not consider the concept of IQ as a quotient or as an indicator of intelligence. Those who thought like Stemburg further believed that Binet and the psychologists of Binet’s ideology were viewing traditional notions of intelligence as too limited and ought to be modified.

[The synopsis given below gives an idea of the interaction between the triad of motivation, emotion and cognition and the development of personality.]

1. Personality and Its Major Subsystems

When the purpose of the subsystem is to satisfy internal needs,

- the qualities that characterise the system are **intrapersonal**, e.g., understanding oneself;
- the interactions that take place within the system are **motivational** and **emotional**, e.g., the blocked motives that lead to anger.

When the purpose of the subsystem is to respond to the external world,

- the qualities that characterise the system are **interpersonal**, e.g., knowing how to socialise;
- the interactions that take place within the system are **emotional** and **cognitive**, e.g., understanding others' emotions.

When creating a heuristic for Emotional Intelligence, one may conceive the development of personality in terms of interactions among the motivation-emotion-cognition triad. See Mayer, Salovey & Caruso (2000), Handbook of Intelligence, p. 398.

Thingujam tells us that a humanist psychologist like Abraham Maslow never favoured the concept of IQ. Maslow seemed to find the concept of IQ as highly irritating, because it has nothing to do with wisdom and seems to be a purely technological concept. His argument is that people neglect wisdom, knowledge, insight, understanding, common sense and good judgment because IQ is technologically more satisfactory. Thorndike (1920) formulated and defined the concept of social intelligence, which is so vital for EI. He defined social intelligence as the ability to understand and interrelate with men, women, boys and girls, in other words, as the ability to act wisely in human relations. Social intelligence and EI seem to correlate but EI may be more clearly distinguished from general intelligence because it involves the manipulations of emotions and emotional content – manipulations which ordinarily are not included with general intellectual capabilities.

There are, however, psychologists who are sceptical about the existence of Social Intelligence as a separate intellectual aptitude. Thingujam reports that in 1960, Cronbach concluded that after fifty years of intermittent attempts at investigation, social intelligence remained undefined and unmeasured. According to Thingujam, in the year 1969 Weinstein published his research that seemed to indicate that Social Intelligence boils down to the ability to manipulate the responses of others. In fact the insinuation that manipulation is at work can be attributed to many traditional views of intelligence because an individual's own and others' emotions are not taken into consideration in the process of conceptualizing intelligence. It has also becoming increasingly clear that social intelligence is not readily demonstrable as a separate intellectual aptitude.

Wechsler (1958) defined intelligence as "the aggregate or global capacity of the individual to act purposefully, to think rationally and to deal effectively with the environment." According to Thingujam (2000), this definition included one's ability to adapt to several situations and face life situations successfully. However the intelligence tests that carry Wechsler's name (WAIS, WISC) have not exactly measured the ability to adapt; instead they have confined themselves to the ability to make spatial judgments and to manifest various verbal skills.

Researchers started enrooting the concept EI in the classical works of medieval and modern philosophers. Thingujam (2002) ascribes to the 17th-century Spinoza the speculation that emotions and intellect together contribute to aggregates of cognitive processes. Spinoza seems to have talked about three levels of cognition: (a) emotional cognition, (b) intellectual cognition and (c) a kind of intuition.

According to Thingujam, Ellis, working in the early 1960s, conceived human emotion and cognition as processes that can never be diagnosed completely apart from each other. Thingujam reports that in 1991 Mahoney made a comment about cognitive constructivists: these are theoreticians who view feeling, knowing, and acting as inseparable components of our experience during the course of adaptation and development. In this context, the popular adage 'reason without affect is impotent, affect without reason is blind' becomes pertinent.

Similarly social reasoning has constituted a part of performance and verbal sub-scales, but there has been no separate and distinct entity of measurement for social intelligence. It is said that Gardner talked about multiple forms of intelligence including interpersonal and intrapersonal intelligence. Intrapersonal intelligence is an ability to understand one's own emotions; interpersonal intelligence is an ability to know others' emotions and intentions. These concepts are basic to emotional intelligence. Stemburg (1985) conceptualized a triarchic theory of intelligence, which consists of componential intelligence, experiential intelligence and contextual intelligence. Contextual intelligence very much overlaps with EI because contextual intelligence deals with the ability of people to cope with their everyday life.

From this kind of critical thinking psychologists started conceiving of intelligence as a capability that deals with all dimensions of interactions. Yale psychologists proposed a new cognitive ability under the label Emotional Intelligence in 1990. This concept got even more attention and popularity on account of Daniel Goleman's elaborative description of 'Emotional Intelligence' in 1995. Psychologists like Salerno (1996), Segal, (1997), Bar-On, (1997) and Gottman (2001) published research that fortified the concept of Emotional Intelligence.

2. Emotional Intelligence as a Notional Construct

It has been the failure of the notion of IQ to predict real life success that has surprised psychologists repeatedly.[1] In 1995, Sternberg, Wagner, Williams & Hovarth placed the scientific estimate of the contribution of the IQ factor to the predictability of

[1] It is not difficult to understand that any system, scientific or philosophical, that begins with intelligence or human rationality as a starting point is going to wander into various forms of determinism and consequently is going to underestimate God's capacity to intervene in the lives of individuals to bless them with success or to permit failures that may eventually lead to even more important future successes. Indeed more thoughtful contemporary philosophers such as Paul Ricœur and psychologists such as Viktor Frankl indicate that it is not the scientist who defines the parameters of human intelligence: it is God himself. Ricœur's thoughtful explanations of the inhibitors to human freedom suggest that the scientific insistence on intelligence as a criterion or predictor for success easily becomes a venture into the schools of suspicion (see footnote two of this article). To pursue a thoughtful understanding of the difference between one's intelligence as a determinant of personal integrity and submission to divine authority as a determinant of personal integrity, please see the article that precedes this one (Editor's Note).

life success at 20% (Thingujam, 2002). The search for other factors that might contribute more influentially to the predictability of life success has occasioned attempts to understand intelligence from a broader perspective. The search for new parameters for intelligence to understand factors, hitherto unexplainable, that may be associated with human life success has given rise to new theoretical constructs. Many researchers who have given their attention to this matter have put more and more at the centre of their focus the concept of social intelligence, that is to say, the same notion explained by Thorndike in the 1920s.

In the early eighties the concept of multiple forms of intelligence that Gardner is said to have formulated included the concept of social intelligence under the label of "personal intelligence." The other six that he identified out of his total of seven were linguistic, logical-mathematical, spatial, musical, bodily-kinaesthetic, and naturalistic (Kumar V. Shanwal, 2003).

Although the concept of emotional intelligence was identifiable in the writings of Thorndike (1920) it became only an empirically supportable dimension during the latter part of the 20th century with the realization that intelligence seems to consist of three component abilities:

a) Verbal-propositional, which includes measures of vocabulary, verbal fluency and the ability to perceive verbal similarities and to think logically.
b) Spatial-perceptual intelligence, which includes the ability to assemble objects and recognize and construct designs and patterns.
c) Social intelligence. Of the three component intellectual abilities, social intelligence is the most controversial. Even when it is the focus of study it still seems difficult to distinguish from the other two intellectual components, whether the methodology for studying it is more theoretical in its approach, as is the case with Mayer & Salovey (1993), or more empirical as in the approach chosen by Cronback (1960).

Researchers in the field have believed that it makes sense to sub-divide portions of social intelligence into motivational and emotional intelligence (Mayer & Geher, 1996). Motivational intelligence, they suggest, involves understanding motivation in terms of the need for achievement, for affiliation or for power

(Wagner & Sternberg, 1985) and the goal-setting related to them (Cantor & Kihlstrom, 1987).

Emotional Intelligence (EI) at the most general level refers to the ability to recognize and regulate emotions in self and in others (Goleman, 2001). Emotional Intelligence in the context of personality theory has postulated that it is a reliable predictor of the general “well-being” of the individual.

If one were to accept the face validity of the notion of Emotional Intelligence, one could readily perceive that the notion has implications for the manner in which individuals tackle daily problems, that it plays a preventive – i.e., protective – role in physical and mental health, and that it offers possibilities for effective developmental intervention in schools and communities, businesses and families (Goleman 2001). More specifically at the individual level it seems to modulate parenting behaviour, ego strength, the choice of role models, the communication of feeling, the appreciation of aesthetics, moral and ethical feelings, social problem solving, leadership and spiritual feelings (Mayer & Salovey, 1995). Gradually over time the concept of EI has developed into a scientific construct.

3. Emotional Intelligence as a Scientific Construct

Aristotle seems to have been the first one in European culture to describe aspects of emotional intelligence within the parameters of a construct when he stated it as the rare ability “to be angry with the right person, to the right degree, at the right time, for the right purpose, and in the right way”. The current scientific formalization of the concept of Emotional Intelligence has been developing since the early twentieth century. Kumar Shanwal informs us that the term Emotional Intelligence (EI) was used for the first time in 1966 by a German psychologist called Leuner (Kumar V Shanwal, 2003). The insight that emotion and intelligence (cognition) can complement each other became the basis of formulation of the various current models of emotional intelligence

4. Definitions of Emotional Intelligence

Mayer offers the following as a definition of EI: “an ability to recognize the meanings of emotions and their relationships, and to reason and solve problems on the basis of emotions. Emotional Intelligence involves the capacity to perceive emotions, assimilate emotion-related feelings, understand the information provided by emotions and manifest an aptitude to manage emotions" (Mayer, 2001, p9). EI has been described as an ability or tendency to perceive, understand, regulate and harness emotions adaptively in the self and in others. Gerald & Moshe (2002) have described EI as an underlying process that supports emotional management, such as labelling somatic sensations, selecting verbal descriptors for emotions and accessing memories of personal emotional experience.

In a 2006 article in the *Journal of Applied Psychology*, Fitness and Curtis present a model that they attribute to Mayer and Salovey, an ability model of emotional intelligence that includes four genres of abilities. These abilities process information about one's own emotions and the emotions of others. The first one of these genres is called emotional perception. Emotional perception is the ability to register, attend to, and decipher emotional messages as they are expressed in a variety of non-verbal contexts including facial expressions and tone of voice. People who are skilled at perceiving emotions are consequently better informed about their environment and so they may adapt better to it.

The second genre refers to the emotional integration which signifies the ability to access and generate feelings and facilitate thought. "Emotions can enter the cognitive system as explicit thoughts about specific feelings. Thus emotions can facilitate thoughts by giving information about our mood state. People skilled in emotional integration are more likely to view things from an optimistic perspective. Such people have the ability to see things from multiple perspectives as their mood alters. This facility to view things from multiple perspectives may facilitate very creative and problem-solving behaviour" (Carr, 2004, 110).

The third genre is called emotional understanding. This signifies the ability to comprehend the implications of emotions. People with well-developed emotional understanding can understand how emotions align themselves into temporal patterns which can affect relationships. If someone understands that anger expressed in aggression hurts others, and that if retaliation does not occur, conflict situations ease, such an individual may be better able to handle conflictual situations than someone who does not have the skill to understand these types of temporal emotional sequences (Carr, 2004).

The fourth genre is emotional management. Emotional management is the ability to “regulate emotions, to choose to be open to experiencing emotions and to control the way in which these are expressed. A person with well-developed emotional management abilities has the option of choosing to experience emotions, or of blocking the experiencing of emotions. This helps individuals to enhance and deepen relationships so as to be open to emotions experienced by oneself or expressed by others and to express one’s emotions freely” (Carr, 2004, 110). People with well-developed emotional management abilities are able to choose the degree to which they are open to experiencing emotions and expressing them. According to EI theory these four genres form a hierarchy, increasing from emotion perception to emotion management. A person’s EI is the combination of these four abilities. An EI instrument known as the MSCEIT tests all these four genres of abilities. According to researchers EI must meet three criteria to be considered as a standard for intelligence.

1) It must be operationalized as a mental ability. It was in this vein that Mayer and his colleagues (2004) accordingly presented an ability model of emotional intelligence.
2) It must meet correlational criteria that indicate it as a unitary ability that represents a new kind of performance empirically distinct from that tapped by earlier measures of intelligence and personality inventories.
3) It must exhibit growth with age, a developmental course similar to that of other forms of intelligence (Mayer, et al., 2004).

5. A Cognitive Ability Model of EI

Peter Salovey & John Mayer published their seminal article “Emotional Intelligence” in 1990. It has proven to be a very influential statement of Emotional Intelligence theory in its current form. Their concept of emotional intelligence primarily focuses on the complex and potentially insightful interventions of emotional reasoning in everyday life. These authors surmise that emotions convey knowledge about a person’s relationship with the world

(Mayer & Salovey, 1995). Thus according to these authors there are certain valid generalities and laws of emotions. These general rules and laws offer parameters in recognizing and reasoning with feelings. Emotional reasoning according to these authors brings to light relationships between emotional experience and cognitive process. For example an insulted person may feel angry or a person who is insecure and not assertive might feel shame, humiliation or repressed anger. Recognition of these reactions requires some form of intelligence.

Examining more complex manifestations of emotional intelligence often requires understanding the individual's cultural context. Authors recognize that emotional intelligence requires some ‘right answers’ as to feelings and that some questions about emotions do not have right answers. Basing their model on cognitive ability, the authors utilize an age-old concept of a tripartite division of mental activity into motivation, emotion and cognition and suggest that the interplay of these three forms of mental activity has been the basis of a concept of intelligence as it is understood traditionally. Within these inseparable divisions of mental activity, authors suggest that emotions reflect relationships between a person and a friend, between a person and a family, between a person and a situation, between a person and society or more internally, between a person and his own processes of reflection or memory (Kumar V. Shanwal, 2003).

Based on this understanding, the authors presented their first definition of emotional intelligence as “the ability to monitor one's own and others’ feelings and emotions, to discriminate among them, and to use this information to guide one's thinking and action” (Salovey & Mayer, 1990). Later in their revised model, Salovey & Mayer recognized the fact that their earlier definition omits mention of the very important reciprocal interaction between emotion & cognition, i.e., it omitted thinking about feelings. Later in 1997 they found a solution to this problem and presented a revised definition of emotional intelligence: “Emotional intelligence involves the ability to perceive emotions accurately, to appraise them and to express them; the ability to access and/or generate feelings when they facilitate thought; the ability to understand emotion and emotional knowledge; and the ability to regulate emotions to promote emotional and intellectual growth”.

Based on their own analysis of emotion-related abilities, the revised model of Emotional Intelligence that Mayer & Salovey present consists of four kinds of abilities that range hierarchically from more basic psychological processes to more complex ones that serve to integrate emotions and cognition (Mayer & Salovey,1997; Salovey & Caruso, 2000).

6. Daniel Goleman's mixed model of EI

Daniel Goleman (1995) defined Emotional Intelligence as the ability to know emotions, to manage one's emotions, to recognize emotions in others and to handle relationships. He formulated the theory in tandem with various personality attributes like zeal, persistence and motivation. His definition was extensive enough to include the concept of "character" under Emotional Intelligence. Hence he conceived EI as a "master aptitude, a capacity that profoundly affects all other abilities, either facilitating or interfering with them" (Goleman, 1995).

7. Bar-On's Relational Model of Emotional Intelligence

Some seemed to have defined emotional intelligence in terms of an array of emotional and social cognitive processes and abilities that influence our overall aptitude to effectively relate with environmental demands. This array includes (1) the ability to be aware of, to understand, and to express oneself; (2) the ability to understand and to relate to others; (3) the ability to deal with strong emotions and to control one's impulses; and (4) the ability to adapt to change and to solve problems of a personal or a social nature. The five main domains in Bar-On's models, for example, are intrapersonal skills, interpersonal skills, adaptability, stress management, and general mood (Bar-On, 1997).

8. Ability Vs Mixed Models of Emotional Intelligence

Because Mayer, Salovey, and Caruso (2000) place the notion of emotional intelligence within a more general theory of intelligence, they have made distinctions among various models of emotional intelligence that are called "mixed" and those that are exclusively related to mental ability, the so-called "pure" models. Mixed models, they argue, contain a mélange of abilities, behaviours, and general dispositions and conflate personality attributes such as optimism and persistence with mental ability. Based on this understanding they suggest that Emotional Intelligence models of the type proposed by Daniel Goleman and Bar-On are mixed models, while they present their own model as a pure ability model.

9. Mayer & Salovey (1997) as a pure ability model

1) Perception (identification) and Expression of Emotion
   - Identifying and expressing emotions: in physical states, feelings, thoughts;
   - Identifying and expressing emotions in other people, artwork, language, and so forth.
2) Assimilating – and therefore, making use of – emotion in thought
   - Emotions prioritize thinking in productive ways;
   - Emotions are generated as aids to judgment and memory.
3) Understanding and analysing emotion
   - Ability to label emotions, including complex emotions and simultaneous feelings;
   - Ability to understand relationships associated with shifts of emotion.
4) Reflective regulation (managing) of emotion
   - Ability to stay open to feelings;
   - Ability to reflectively monitor and regulate emotions to promote emotional and intellectual growth.

10. Bar-On (1997) as a Relational Model

1) Overall definition: “Emotional intelligence is… an array of non-cognitive capabilities, competencies, and skills that influence one’s ability to succeed in coping with environmental demands and pressures” (Bar-On, 1997).
2) Intrapersonal Skills: Emotional self-awareness, Assertiveness, Self-regard, Self-actualization, Independence.
3) Interpersonal skills: interpersonal relationships, Social responsibility, Empathy.
4) Adaptability scales: Problem solving, Reality testing, Flexibility.

5) Stress-management scales: Stress Tolerance, Impulse, Control.
6) General mood: Happiness, Optimism.

11. Goleman (1995a) as a Mixed Model

1) Overall definitions: "The abilities called here emotional intelligence… include self-control, zeal and persistence, and the ability to motivate oneself… There is an old-fashioned word for the body of skills that emotional intelligence represents: character."
2) Major Areas of Skills and Specific Examples
   - Knowing one's emotions: recognizing a feeling as it happens; monitoring feelings from moment to moment.
   - Managing emotions: handling feelings so they are appropriate; ability to soothe oneself; ability to shake off rampant anxiety, gloom, or irritability.
   - Motivating oneself: marshalling emotions in the service of a goal; delaying gratification and stifling impulsiveness; being able to get into the "flow" state.
   - Recognizing emotions in others: empathic awareness; thoughtful attentiveness to others' needs/wants.
   - Handling relationships: skill in managing emotions in others; interacting smoothly with others.

J.D. Mayer presents these three models in a 2001 Psychology Press publication that he edited with several others, *Emotional Intelligence in Everyday Life* (p11).

Mayer, Salovey, & Caruso's model arises from a psychometric mindset that intelligence must meet three criteria to be defined as intelligence: First, it must be conceptual (that is, it must reflect mental aptitudes rather than behaviours); second, it must be correlational with other forms of intelligence that are already recognizable as forms of intelligence; and finally it must be developmental (that is, the aptitudes that characterize it must go through a maturation process).

12. Alexithymia

Alexithymia is a Greek word that means absence of emotional feelings (*a* = absence, *lexis* = word, *thymos* = emotions). It is said that this term was coined by Peter Sifenos to refer to the difficulty in identifying and describing subjective feelings in patients. Later John Nemiah recognized that the syndrome manifested itself in the following manner:

1) Difficulty in identifying feelings and distinguishing between feelings and bodily sensations of emotional arousal,
2) Difficulty in describing feelings to others,
3) Constricted processes of the imagination, as shown by a lack of fantasy and a stimulus-bound, externally-oriented cognitive style.

Clinicians have added to the list difficulties in emotional processing, inability to separate emotional feelings from physical states, impulsiveness, and the tendency to express feelings globally. Psychologists later developed the *Toronto Alexithymia Scale-20* to assess alexithymia. Mayer and Salovey (1990) concluded that persons suffering from alexithymia neglect the expression of positive feelings, have difficulty expressing mixed emotions, and instead focus on negative emotions. They concluded this as a state of low emotional intelligence. When researchers examine the relationship between TAS-20 and the Bar-On Emotional Quotient Inventory, they notice that there is evidence that alexithymia and EI are related inversely. So the studies on alexithymia and its causes may make it possible even further to elaborate and specify the term emotional intelligence.

13. Qualities of an EI Person

According to the psychologists who specialize in EI, high EI individuals are more capable of perceiving emotions, integrating them into their thoughts, understanding their meanings, and managing them better than others. These individuals solve emotional problems with less cognitive effort. They also tend to be somewhat higher in verbal, social and other intellectual aptitudes, particularly if the individual scores higher in the understanding portion of EI. This kind of individual tends to be more open and agreeable than others. The high EI person is drawn to occupations involving social interactions such as teaching and counselling more than to occupations involving clerical or administrative tasks (Mayer, Salovey & Caruso, 2004).

The high EI individual is less apt to suffer from problem behaviours and avoids self-destructive negative behaviour, such as smoking, excessive drinking, drug abuse, or violent episodes with others. The EI person tend to be sentimentally possessive and attached around the home and to have more positive social interactions. Such individuals may also be more adept at describing motivational goals, aims and missions.

Conclusion

The discussion in this brief article has focused on Emotional Intelligence, its origin and development. Future researchers, perhaps, may explore more concretely the reliability and validity of its measuring instruments. The present article suggests that interdisciplinary research into emerging models of emotional intelligence has surfaced the need to cultivate emotional intelligence skills to improve human performance in the field of education and in a number of other professions. Leading researchers in business, education, psychology, and behavioural medicine have clearly established the significant role of emotional intelligence in achieving personal, academic, and career success. To create a healthier and more resourceful life, the individual person needs to understand emotional dynamics and the contributions of emotional intelligence.

The learned ability to identify, understand and apply essential emotional intelligence skills enhances both the achievement of personal goals and the maintenance of good health. An effort to systematically integrate emotional and academic learning can prove advantageous to the entire educational process.

Competition prevails as a social dynamic in many of today’s societies that consider themselves to be free. Competition, however, needs to be balanced with fairness. Individual differences, it is true, are evident in a multicultural and diverse society, but these need to interface with regulatory standards that bring a sense of equality in the opportunities to perform and produce. Measures of success and achievement need to harmonize with genuine respect for hard work and a commitment to principles that are humane, altruistic and capable of engendering organizational climates of solidarity.

Many of those who have researched emotional intelligence have concluded:

- ✓ One, Emotional Intelligence is the single, most influential factor in personal achievement, career success, and physical health.
- ✓ Two, Emotional Intelligence is a learned ability, unlike the traditionally-defined IQ that many consider innate.
- ✓ Three, emotional learning requires an intentional, active, learner-centred approach that is a natural, normal part of education.
- ✓ Four, Emotional Intelligence consists of specific skills and competencies.

Are the research efforts and ensuing discussions that focus on Emotional Intelligence becoming too wordy, too divisive, too inconclusive and, therefore, too much of a waste of time? Our modest effort in this article has been to highlight the fact that if researchers collaborate to bring forth a concept of Emotional Intelligence that is transparent in its meaning and application, all – theorists and practitioners alike – benefit.

References

Bar-On, R. (2001). Emotional intelligence and self-actualization, In Ciarrochi, J., Forgas, P.J., Mayer, J. (2001) (Ed.) *Emotional Intelligence in Everyday Life*, New York: Psychology Press.

Bar-On, R. (1997). *The Emotional Quotient Inventory (EQ-i) Technical Manual*. Toronto, Canada: Multi health Systems.

Brackett, M.A., Mayer, J.D. (2003). Convergent, discriminant, and incremental validity of competing measures of emotional intelligence, *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin,* 29, 1147-1158.

Brackett, M.A. – *et al*. (2006). Relating emotional abilities to social functioning: A comparison of self-report and performance measures of emotional intelligence, *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 4, 780-795.

Brackett, M.A., Warner, R.M., & Bosco, J.S. (2005). Emotional intelligence and relationship quality among couples, *Personal Relationships*, 12, 197-212.

Ciarrochi, J., Forgas, P.J., & Mayer. J., eds. (2001). *Emotional Intelligence in Everyday Life*, New York: Psychology Press.

Fitness, J. (2001). EI and intimate relationships, In Ciarrochi, J., Forgas, P.J., Mayer, J., eds., *Emotional Intelligence in Everyday Life,* New York: Psychology Press.

Gerald, M., & Moshe. Z. (2002). *Emotional Intelligence, Adaptation to Stressful Encounter and Health Outcomes,* New York: Psychology Press.

Goleman, D. (1995). *Emotional Intelligence*, New York, Bantam Books.

Goleman, D. (1998). *Working with Emotional Intelligence*, New York, Bantam Books.

Goleman, D. (2001). Emotional Intelligence, Issues paradigm, in C. Cherniss & D. Goleman, eds., *The Emotionally Intelligent Work Place*. San Francisco: Jossey –Bass.

Gottman, M.J. (1993). The roles of Conflict Engagement, Escalation, and Avoidance in Marital Interaction: A Longitudinal View of Five Types of Couples, *Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology,* 61, 1, 6-15.

Gottman, M.J. (2001). EI and Intimate relationships, In Ciarrochi, J., Forgas, P.J., Mayer, J., eds., *Emotional Intelligence in Everyday Life*, New York: Psychology Press.

Kumar, V.S. (2003). *A Study of Correlates and Nurturance of Emotional Intelligence in Primary School Children*, Delhi: Faculty of Education, Jamia Millia Islamia, Unpublished Doctoral Thesis.

Mayer, J.D. (2001). A Field Guide to Emotional Intelligence, In Ciarrochi.J., Forgas, P.J., Mayer, J., (2001) (Ed.) *Emotional Intelligence in Everyday Life*. New York: Psychology Press.

Mayer, J.D., & Geher, G. (1996). Emotional intelligence and the identification of emotion, *Intelligence*, 17, 433-442.

Mayer, J.D, Salovey, P., & Caruso. D. (2000). In Ciarrochi, J., Forgas, P.J. & Mayer, J., eds., (2001) *Emotional Intelligence in Everyday Life*, New York: Psychology Press.

Mayer, J.D. & Salovey, P. (1990). *Emotional Intelligence*, New York: Baywood Publishing.

Mayer, J.D. & Salovey, P. (1997). Excerpt from Fitness., & Curtis. (2006). Emotional Intelligence and the Trait Meta-Mood Scale: Relationships Empathy, Attributional Complexity, Self-Control, and Response to Interpersonal Conflict, *Journal of Applied Psychology,* (2) 38-48.

Mayer, J.D, Salovey, P., & Caruso. D. (2004). Emotional Intelligence: Theory, and Findings, Implications, *Psychological Inquiry,* 15,197-215

Mayer. J.D, Salovey. P., & Caruso. D. (2000). In R. Sternberg, *Handbook of Intelligence,* Cambridge, UK, p. 398.

Mayers, S.A., & Landsberger, S.A. (2002). Direct and indirect pathways between adult attachment style and marital satisfaction, *Personal Relationships,* 9, 159-172.

Salerno., J.G. (1996). *The Whole Intelligence: Emotional Quotient (EQ)*. Oakbank, South Australia: Noble House of Australia.

Salovey, P. & Caruso, D. (2000), Emotional intelligence and relationship quality among couples. In Brackett, M.A., Warner, R.M., Bosco J.S., (2005) *Personal Relationships*, 12, 197 – 212.

Salovey, P., & Mayer, J.D. (1989-1990). Emotional intelligence, *Imagination, cognition, and Personality*, 9, 185–211.

Salovey, P. – *et al*. (1999). Excerpt from Tugade., M.M., Fredrickson, B.L. (2004). Resilient Individuals Use Positive Emotions to Bounce Back From Negative Emotional Experiences, *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 86 (2) 320–333.

Salovey., Hsee., & Mayer. (1993). Excerpt in Fitness & Curtis. (2006). Emotional Intelligence and the trait Meta-Mood Scale: Relationships Empathy, Attributional Complexity, Self-Control, and Response to Interpersonal Conflict, *Journal of Applied Psychology*, (2) 38-48.

Salovey, P. – *et al*. (1995). Excerpt in Fitness & Curtis (2006). Emotional Intelligence and the trait Meta-Mood Scale: Relationships Empathy, Attributional Complexity, Self-Control, and Response to Interpersonal Conflict, *Journal of Applied Psychology,* 2 (2) 38-48.

Segal, J. (1997). *Raising your Emotional Intelligence*, New York: Holt.

Sternberg., Wagner., Williams., & Hovarth. (1995). In Thingujam, S. N. (2002). Emotional Intelligence, What is the evidence? *Psychological Studies*, 47 (1-3) 55-69.

Sternburg, R.J. (1985). Beyond IQ; A triarchic theory of human intelligence, New York; Cambridge University Press.

Terman & Buttenweiser. (1935). In Kelly, E.L., & Conley, J. James (1987). Personality and Compatibility: A prospective analysis of marital stability and marital satisfaction. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology,* 52, 27-40.

Thingujam, S.N. (2002). Emotional Intelligence, What is the evidence? *Psychological Studies*, 47 (1-3) 55-69.

Thorndike, E.L. (1920). Intelligence and its Uses, *Harper's Magazine*, 140, 227-235

Wechsler, D. (1939). *The Measurement of Adult Intelligence*, Baltimore: William& Wilkins

Wechsler, D. (1958). *The Measurement and Appraisal of Adult Intelligence*, Baltimore: William& Wilkins

THEOLOGY & CULTURE

Generosity Makes Rich, Greed Makes Poor (Prov 11:22-28)

Fr. Bernard Witek, SDS

Department of Theology
Jordan University College

Greed is one of the forces that pushes people to do evil things with the expectation that they might get richer. Because of greed, some big and influential people have caused the recent financial global crisis. Closer to our local context, it is noticeable that greed is one of the forces that corrupt people. The author of this brief essay proposes a contextual reading of a cluster of proverbs (11:22-28) where the issues of greed and generosity form the nuclei of the cluster.

The Text

22 A golden ring in the snout of a pig
is a beautiful woman without judgment[1].

---

[1] The Septuagint renders the expression סָרַת טָעַם by κακόφρων סָרַת טָעַם by κακόφρων "ill-minded, insane" and the Vulgate renders it by *fatua* "fool". Some scholars read it in an intellectual sense like "insane" or "foolish" (e.g.: L. ALONSO SCHÖKEL – J. VILCHEZ LINDEZ, *Proverbios*, Nueva Biblia Española, Madrid 1984, 279; J. HAUSMANN, *Studien zum Menschenbild der älteren Weisheit (Spr 10ff.)*, FAT 7, Tübingen 1995, 153; A. MEINHOLD, *Die Sprüche*. I. *Sprüche Kapitel 1–15*, *ZBK.AT* 16, Zürich 1991, 193. Some others render it as referring to behaviour, e.g.: "without tact" (W. FRANKENBERG, *Die Sprüche*, HK 3/1, Göttingen 1898, 74; W. MCKANE, *Proverbs. A New Approach*, OTL, London 1970, 430), "without discretion" (D.A. HUBBARD, *Proverbs*, CCS.OT 15A, Dallas 1989, 426; T.T. PEROWNE, *The Proverbs*, Cambridge 1916, 94), "without good manners" (R.B.Y. SCOTT, *Proverbs. Ecclesiastes*, AncB 18, Doubleday 1965, 86). The expression can be rendered

23 The desire of the righteous is only good,
the expectation of the wicked is wrath[2].
24 There is one who scatters yet grows all the richer,
but he who withholds what is due becomes poorer.
25 A generous person[3] will be enriched
and he who waters will himself be watered.[4]
26 He who withholds grain, the people curse him,
but the blessing on the head of him who sells it.
27 He who diligently seeks good seeks favour,

---

in a moral sense as "without discernment" or "without judgment" (D.J.A. CLINES, ed., *The Dictionary of Classical Hebrew*, III, Sheffield 1998, 373; B. GEMSER, *Sprüche Salomos*, HAT 16, 2nd ed., Tübingen 1963, 56; P.A. STEVESON, *A Commentary on Proverbs*, Greenville 2001, 153; C.H. TOY, *A Critical and Exegetical Commentary on the Book of Proverbs*, ICC, Edinburgh 1899, reprint, 1988, 233; R.N. WHYBRAY, *Proverbs*, NCBC, Grand Rapids 1994, 185).

[2] Instead of having an equivalent word to עֶבְרָה "wrath", the Septuagint reads ἀπολεῖται "will perish" which would make it a translation of the Hebrew verb אָבַד "perish". G.R. Driver suggests that the consonants are of the verb עָבַר "pass over"; and it should be vocalized עָבְרָה "will pass over" ("Hebrew Notes on Prophets and Proverbs", *JThS* 41 [1940] 174). The BHS suggests the same verb vocalized differently (עָבָרָה). Many scholars retain the Masoretic Text but some render עֶבְרָה as "frustration" (e.g., J. HAUSMANN, *Studien*, 62; D.A. HUBBARD, *Proverbs*, 150, 317). In view of v. 4 where "the day of wrath" implies divine punishment, עֶבְרָה the word in v. 23 would mean "divine wrath" (e.g., F. DELITZSCH, "Proverbs", in C.F. KEIL – F. DELITZSCH, *Commentary on the Old Testament*, VI. *Proverbs, Ecclesiastes, Song of Songs*, Peabody 1966, 177; J.H. GREENSTONE, *Proverbs*, Philadelphia 1950, 122; P.A. STEVESON, *A Commentary*, 153; W. FRANKENBERG, *Die Sprüche*,74). In our passage it could be possible to understand it as "wrath of the people" (cf. A. MEINHOLD, *Die Sprüche*, 198, who retains the ambiguity of the expression).

[3] The expression נֶפֶשׁ־בְּרָכָה meaning literally "a soul of blessing" implies a person that gives blessings to others. Taking into account the parallelism with the second line, this expression can be translated as "a generous person" (cf. W.D. REYBURN – E.M. FRY, *A Handbook on Proverbs*, UBS.HS, New York 2000, 256).

[4] The Septuagint substitutes the second line with ἀνὴρ δὲ Θυμώδης οὐκ εὐσχήμωὐ "but a passionate man is not graceful." The meaning of this line is that the one who gives a drink of water to others will in return receive a drink of water (cf. W.D. REYBURN – E.M. FRY, *A Handbook*, 257).

but he who looks for evil it will come to him.
[28] He who trusts in his riches will fall,
but like the leaves the righteous will flourish.

Composition

This passage contains three parts: verses 22-23, 24-26 and 27-28 in a concentric disposition: ABA’.[5] The first part (22-23) does not seem to form a unit. They seem to be two independent proverbs without any link. However, we can look for a conceptual link. V. 22 could be a metaphor of the wicked mentioned in 23b[6]; and such identification can be supported if we link it to the statement in v. 28a, *who trusts in his riches will fall*. This, in turn, is a synonymous expression to 27b, *he who looks for evil it will come to him*. On the other hand, v. 27b recalls the statement in 23b, *the expectation of the wicked is wrath*.

- [22] A **golden ring**	in the snout of a pig
- is a beautiful woman	without judgment
+ [23] The *desire* of the RIGHTEOUS	is only GOOD,
- the *expectation* of the WICKED	is WRATH.
+ [24] There is one who scatters	yet grows all the **richer**,
- but **he who withholds what is due**	becomes **poorer**.
+ [25] A generous person	**will be enriched**
+ and he who waters	**will himself be watered**
- [26] **He who withholds grain**,	the people **curse him**,
+ but the **blessing** on the head	of him who sells it.
+ [27] He *who diligently seeks* GOOD	*seeks* favour,
- but *he who looks* for EVIL	it will come to him.
- [28] He who trusts in his **riches**	will fall,
+ but like the leaves	the RIGHTEOUS **will flourish**.

The concluding part (27-28) forms a chiasm: ABB’A’. *He who diligently seeks good* (27a) recalls *the righteous* (28b). *Favour*

[5] I proposed this pattern for the structure of the passage in my dissertation (B. WITEK, *Dio e i suoi figli*, Thesi Gregoriana 117, Roma 2005, 64-66). Similar to this pattern: 22-31 (A. MEINHOLD, *Die Sprüche*, 198); 23-31 (H.-J. HERMISSON, *Studien zur israelitischen Spruchweisheit*, WMANT 28, Neukirchen-Vluyn 1968, 175; H.F. FUHS, *Das Buch der Sprichwörter. Ein Kommentar*, FzB 95, Würzburg 2001, 200).

[6] Cf. B. WITEK, *Dio*, 64.

(27a) intended as a reward to be pursued links to the simile of flourishing leaves (28b). At the centre of the chiasm, there are the previously mentioned synonymous negative statements (27b & 28a).

The central part of the whole passage (24-26) is concentric (ABA') framed by the inclusion of two similar proverbs (24 & 26).[7] The *one who scatters* (24a) is synonymous to the one *who sells* grain (26b). The general statement of withholding what is due (24b) is practically illustrated by the one who is reluctant to sell grain when it is needed (26a). The relationship of the two proverbs is chiastic (ABB'A'). The central proverb (25) is the nucleus with two positive synonymous statements: a general statement about generosity (25a) elucidated by a concrete situation of giving water to others (25b). The concept of "generosity" of the central proverb (25) comes to light in the surrounding proverbs (24a & 26b).

From the perspective of the whole passage the righteous one (23a & 28b) is identified in the central part with the person who is generous (24a, 25ab & 26b) while, on the other hand, the wicked one (23b, 27b & 28a) is identified in the central part with the one who withholds what is right (24b & 26a).

Thematically the correspondences between the parts are as follows:[8]

A Reward for the righteous and ill fortune for the wicked	22-23
B Blessing for the generous and curse for the greedy	24-26
A´ Reward for the righteous and ill fortune for the wicked	27-28

Biblical Context

The Wicked Place their Trust in Riches

Wealth in the Bible is a sign of God's blessing, just as it is stated in Prov 10:22, *The blessing of the Lord makes rich*. However, the Bible does not always present wealth in a positive light. Putting trust in riches (11:28a) calls to mind the Lukan parable about the

[7] Many recognize vv. 24-26 as a literal unit (e.g., F. DELITZSCH, "Proverbs", 177; R.N. WHYBRAY, *The Composition of the Book of Proverbs*, JSOT.S 168, Sheffield 1994, 97). A concentric composition of this unit is recognized by P.A. STEVESON, *A Commentary*, 153-154.

[8] Cf. B. WITEK, *Dio*, 66.

rich man who after getting an abundant harvest built bigger storage bins in order to accumulate his goods with an expectation of enjoying them later (Luke 12:16-21). The moral of the parable is that the attitude of the righteous man is that of getting rich in the sight of God instead of getting rich in material things (v. 21) for *one's life does not consist of possessions* (v. 15).

Putting trust in riches (Prov 11:28a) may as a consequence lead to a denial of God when a person feels self-sufficient and thinks that he or she does not need God to satisfy his or her own needs. While offering his petitions to the Lord, Augur gives voice to a preoccupation that moves him to perceive wealth as something to be avoided: *Lest, being full I deny you saying, "Who is the Lord?"* (30:9). The prophets accuse the people of Israel of abandoning their faith because of riches: *when they had fed to the full, they were filled, and their heart was lifted up; therefore they forgot me* (Hos 13:6; cf. Jer 5:7; Deut 32:15).

The Book of Proverbs condemns wealth accumulated by unjust means (cf. Prov 11:24b, 26a). We read that *treasures gained by wickedness do not profit* (10:1a; similarly, 11:4a), while, on the other hand, *righteousness saves from death* (10:2b; 11:4b). We find a similar statement in the Book of Sirach: *Do not depend on dishonest wealth, for it will not benefit you in the day of calamity* (Sir 5:8). Referring to the unjust rich people who are putting their trust in their possessions, the psalmist affirms that *no man can ransom himself, or give to God the price of his life* (Ps 49:7).

With such spiritual hazards at hand for those who are unjustly accumulating wealth, the Proverbs suggest moderation: *Better a little with justice, than a large income with injustice* (Prov 16:8). A similar teaching is to be found in Psalms 37:17, *better the meagreness of the righteous one than the plenty of the wicked.*

The Righteous Will Flourish like the Leaves

The simile in the concluding verse of our text, *like the leaves the righteous will flourish* (Prov 11:28b) echoes a number of other texts in the Old Testament. In the first place it recalls Psalm 1 where we read that the righteous *is like a tree planted by streams of water, that yields its fruit in its season, and its leaf does not wither* (v.3). We find a similar description about a man who puts his trust in the Lord in Jeremiah: *he is like a tree planted by water, that sends out its roots by the stream, and does not fear when heat comes, for its leaves remain green, and is not anxious in the year of drought, for it does not cease to bear fruit* (17:8). The same simile we find in Psalm 92 where we read that *the righteous flourish like the palm tree, and grow like a cedar in Leban* (v. 12). In Psalm 52, the psalmist contrasts himself to a person who puts his trust in his wealth instead of putting his trust in God: *But I am like a green olive tree in the house of God. I trust in the steadfast love of God for ever and ever* (v. 8).[9]

Interpretation

He Who Gives Receives More

Two statements that specify the motive of the righteous person, *the desire of the righteous is only good* (24a) and *he who diligently seeks good seeks favour* (27a), can mean that the objective of his actions is something that is good precisely for others. The nucleus of the passage, vv. 24a, 25, and 26b, illustrates this by focusing the reader's attention on the concrete actions of a generous person (24a, 25, 26b). One demonstrates his or her righteousness by the way he or she deals with others. In our passage a righteous one is a generous person who shares his possessions with the needy even lavishly, in a way that goes beyond expected limits (24a).[10] He is not withholding food in the time of famine but sells it when it is needed and at the right price, one that is affordable to the needy (26b).

[9] Cf. B. WITEK, *Dio*, 67.

[10] We tend to take the word צַדִּיק "righteous" in a legal sense as someone who observes the law, rules, and so forth. Interestingly the word צְדָקָה translated generally as "righteousness", can in some contexts mean "generosity" or "almsgiving," as in Prov 10:2, which often is translated as *Treasures gained by wickedness do not profit, but righteousness delivers from death*. The second of these proverbs can be rendered as *but almsgiving delivers from death* (such a meaning is suggested for example by L. ALONSO SCHÖKEL – J. VILCHEZ LINDEZ, *Proverbios*, 259; F. DELITZSCH, "Proverbs", 152).

The word *good* in 23a as opposed to *wrath* in 23b can also imply that there is recompense as a result of doing good to others. The same meaning can apply to the word *favour*[11] in 27a. A generous person receives human gratitude for the good he is doing to another, in particular to the needy (26b).

At first, the affirmation that the *one who scatters yet grows all the richer* (24a) seems not to make sense. How can someone enrich himself if he is giving lavishly beyond reasonable limits? We need to interpret it from the divine perspective. A person who is too generous may seem to be losing something economically, but his real profit is what he gains from God’s perspective. The same interpretation applies to the proverb at the nucleus of the passage (25). Both expressions *will be enriched* (25a) and *will be watered* (25b) can be taken as *passivum divinum*.[12] It is God himself who will compensate a generous person according to the following standard:

> Give, and it will be given to you; good measure, pressed down, shaken together, running over, will be put into your lap. For the measure you give will be the measure you get back (Luke 6:38).

The simile of the righteous who will flourish like leaves (Prov 11:28b) also implies a divine compensation that surpasses even what the generous giver has given. The righteous who provides water to those who need it (25b) is like the green leaves (28b) that never wither (cf. Ps 1:3) because God waters them (Prov 11:25b).

Evil Will Come to the One Who Looks for It

In our text the wicked (23b) is rich (28a); but driven by greed, he *withholds what is due* (24b). Wanting to gain more, *he withholds grain* (26a); and by creating its shortage on the market he causes

---

[11] The word רָצוֹן “favour” in 27a is ambiguous. It can mean an objective of his search, but because of its parallelism with the second stich (*he who looks for evil it will come to him*, 27b) it can be interpreted as a result of an action. In this case it would mean “favour of God” (cf. W.D. Reyburn – E.M. Fry, *A Handbook*, 258).

[12] *Passivum divinum* can be supported by the observation that in the central part all three verbs of recompense for a generous person are in passive form: נוֹסָף niphal rendered as “grows all the richer” (24a); תְּדֻשָּׁן pual, “will be enriched” (25a); יוֹרֶא hophal, “will be watered” (25b). Cf. B. Witek, *Dio*, 67.

increase of its price. The wicked can be very rich but in the eyes of God he is poor because he puts his trust in material things (28a) instead of in God; and therefore he does all sorts of evil things (27b). Applying the simile of the opening proverb (22), he in his riches is like a woman that in appearance is beautiful but inside is lacking very important qualities like judgment, intelligence, and wisdom (22b). His evil actions driven by greed provoke hatred on the side of the people he is harming (26a). On the other hand, the statement that *the expectation of the wicked is wrath* (24b) implies divine wrath, divine punishment for his or her evil-doing. In such a context the affirmation that *he who looks for evil it will come to him* (27b) can be understood to mean that the greedy, wicked person who pursues evil draws upon himself both human and divine punishment (26a and 24b). The one who puts trust in his riches, therefore, and does what is evil is like a tree that withers, because he is not rooted in God (28a).

The Ecclesiology of Pope Francis: The Church in Images – The Rainbow Church

Fr. Marcel Mukadi, SDS

Department of Theology
Jordan University College

1. Overview of the Church according to Pope Francis

Upon perusing one of Pope Francis' interviews with the Italian Jesuit journal, *La Civiltà Cattolica*,[1] I was really struck by the manner in which the Pope made use of metaphors and other linguistic forms of imagery in order to explain what the Church is.

First, he said: "The image of the Church I like is that of the holy, faithful people of God. This is the definition I often use. And then there is that image from the Second Vatican Council's *Dogmatic Constitution on the Church*." He continued explaining what this image might be:

> This Church about which we should be thinking is the home of all, not a small chapel that can hold only a little group of selected people. We must not reduce the bosom of the universal church to a nest that [simply] protects our mediocrity.

Then he shifted his imagery to that of motherhood: "The Church is Mother; the Church is fruitful. She must be".[2]

---

[1] This interview with Pope Francis took place over the course of three meetings during August 2013 in Rome. The interview was conducted in person by Antonio Spadaro, S.J., editor in chief of *La Civiltà Cattolica*, the Italian Jesuit journal. Father Spadaro conducted the interview on behalf of *La Civiltà Cattolica*, *America* and several other major Jesuit journals around the world. The editorial teams at each of the journals prepared questions and sent them to Father Spadaro, who then consolidated and organized them. The interview was conducted in Italian. After the Italian text was officially approved, *America* commissioned a team of five independent knowledgeable people to translate it into English. *America* is solely responsible for the accuracy of this translation.

[2] Here Pope Francis was using an image dear to the hearts of the African Church Fathers, St. Cyprian and St. Augustine. St. Cyprian: "He cannot have

Perhaps the most striking image in that interview was Pope Francis visualisation of the Church as a field hospital after battle.

> I see clearly that the thing the Church needs most today is the ability to heal wounds and to warm the hearts of the faithful; it needs nearness, proximity. I see the Church as a field hospital after battle. It is useless to ask a seriously injured person if he has high cholesterol and about the level of his blood sugars! You have to heal his wounds. Then we can talk about everything else. Heal the wounds, heal the wounds.... And you have to start from the ground up.

This last image made me think twice and brought me back to the scholastic period which considered the sacraments as remedy (*sacramentum medicina est*). It creates in me a great desire to knowing in depth his ecclesiology. In the meantime, I came to realize that one of Pope Francis's gifts as a communicator is a peculiar feel for memorable images. As we know, images speak more than words. So, I have decided to go through many of his speeches and homilies in order to seek out metaphors and other forms of imagery together with models that Pope Francis has included in his linguistic set of tools in order to explain the Church.

This was for me a very exciting work. I came to notice that during the General Audiences from May to October, 2013, he was conveying a great familiarity with the value of using images while speaking of the Church. People appreciate his way of adverting to images when talking about the Church. They seem to understand this style of language much more easily than by a strictly doctrinal, academic or systematic style of discourse, which certain groups of people find very heavy to swallow. The Church becomes very accessible to many whom she may not ordinarily reach. Images clearly and directly speak to them. They do not need any

---

God for his Father who does not have the Church for his Mother" (*The Unity of the Catholic Church,* chapter 6; PL 4, 495-520; CSEL, Vol. 3, part 1, Vienna 1868, 207-233). St. Augustine: "Let us love our Lord God, let us love his Church; Him as a Father, her as a Mother… What does it profit you to confess the Lord, to honour God, to preach Him, to acknowledge His Son, to confess the Son seated at the right of the Father, if you blaspheme His Church?... Cling then, beloved, cling all with one mind to God our Father and to the Church our Mother" (*Explanations of the Psalms,* Psalm 88. For the complete text of these *Enarrationes,* see Migne, PL 36 and 37; and CC [Corpus Christianorum], Vols. 38-40). (Editor's Note).

intermediary to clarify the thoughts of the Pope. The use of images has created a kind of lovely bridge between the Pope and the faithful. The Pope has surprisingly created an ecclesiology that, while planting its roots in divine revelation, casts its language in terms of human experience – in this sense, an ecclesiology from below.

2. The Church Is a Mystery

Nevertheless it seems necessary for me to emphasize the fact that for Pope Francis as well as for contemporary thinkers including theologians, to the question: "What is the Church?" He answers: "The Church is a mystery". Pope Francis expresses it this way: "Today I would like to begin a catechesis on the mystery of the Church, a mystery which we all experience and of which we are part. I would like to do so with some concepts that are evident in the texts of the Second Vatican Ecumenical Council".[3]

In other words, there is no proper word, no human expression that can comprehensively define it. Consequently, her nature and her mission is primarily expressed in metaphors or images or models. This leads me to suggest that there is actually a plurality of metaphors, models or images that may express the truth about the mystery of the Church and that depend on the signs of the times of a particular area and contribute to the quest for a clear understanding of what the Church really is or should be. This plurality produces a sign of vitality in ecclesiology and deeply enriches our understanding of the Church.

What does it mean actually to say that "the Church is a mystery?" There are two ways of answering this question. On the one hand, the Church cannot be enclosed in one global definition because that would mean diminishing her inner reality. On the other hand, the fact that the reality of the Church cannot be imprisoned in a unique description proves the incapacity of the human mind to fully grasp her very nature. Yes, the Church is a mystery. And the word mystery, according to *The Catholic Encyclopaedia*, signifies in general "that which is unknowable or valuable knowledge that is kept secret. The mystery, then, is

[3] POPE FRANCIS, General Audience *The Church as Family of God* on May 29th, 2013.

a supernatural truth, one that by its very nature lies beyond finite intelligence."[4] In this regard, Pius XII declared in *Mystici Corporis*: "If we could define and describe this true Church of Jesus Christ - which is the one, holy, Catholic, and Roman Church – we shall find no expression more noble, more sublime or more divine than the phrase which calls it the Mystical Body of Jesus Christ."[5]

The Church is a reality incommensurable with any human expression. Pius XII put the emphasis on Christ as the core, the centre, and the source of life to whom all are united, and who endows each one with gifts fitting him/her for his/her position in the body, which is nothing other than the Church.[6] In other words, as Henri De Lubac shows in his book, *The Splendour of the Church*, "the Church is a mystery of faith, and surpasses the capacities and powers of our intellect."[7]

We find the very same teaching, perhaps expressed with more weight, in the opening address of Paul VI at the Second Vatican Council, "The Church is a mystery. It is a reality imbued with the hidden presence of God. It lies, therefore, within the very nature of the Church to be always open to new and ever greater exploration."[8] And "since the Church is a mystery, it cannot be exhaustively defined, but its nature is best communicated by studying the various biblical metaphors."[9] The Church like the Blessed Trinity is a true mystery of our faith that we experience and believe in. That is to say that, like Christ, the Church is at the core of our faith. Hence, the Church as mystery becomes the

[4] J. A. McHugh, "Mystery", in *The Catholic Encyclopaedia*, vol. X, 1971, 662-663.

[5] Pius XII, Encyclical Letter *Mystici Corporis Christi* (June 1943), 13; published also in *the Papal Teachings. The Church*, New York, 1962, 532; quoted also by E. P Clowney, Interpreting the Biblical Models of the Church: A Hermeneutical Deepening of Ecclesiology, in *Biblical Interpretation and the Church*: *Text and Context* (1984), 64-65.

[6] G. H. Joyce, The Mystical Body of the Church, in *The Catholic Encyclopaedia*, vol. X, 1971, 663.

[7] H. De Lubac, *The Splendor of the Church*, London: Sheed & Ward 1956, 4.

[8] *LG* 1.

[9] *LG* 6.

nucleus around which all the other ecclesiological expressions revolve.

For Cardinal Avery Dulles too, the Church is a mystery that can never be properly described. This reality of the Church as mystery constitutes the basic foundation of his ecclesiology and even more of his models of the Church. He clearly expresses it when he defends his selection of the term 'models':

> In selecting the term 'models', I wish to indicate my conviction that the Church, like other theological realities, is a mystery. Mysteries are realities of which we cannot speak directly. If we wish to talk about them at all we must draw analogies afforded by our experience of the world. These analogies provide models. By attending to the analogies and utilizing them as models, we can indirectly grow in our understanding of the Church.[10]

In our own view, these analogies or models represent graced human experiences. They reflect the daily human life of communities both in the society and in the Church within the purview of Divine Providence. This approach to the mystery of the Church seems to follow from beginning to end the main threads of Dulles' understanding as well as that of Pope Francis concerning the reality of the Church. Both realize that the human intellect indeed cannot understand the inner nature of the Church as Mystery; but it can express that truth by analogies.[11] It cannot fully grasp the deep coherence and values that are contained in that mystery, but it can successfully help Christians to understand their own local milieu, their own Christian experiences and then to have the capacity to apply the model of the Church which really corresponds to their daily life without in any way belittling the others. It is just what the Holy Father says: "Today I would like to begin some catecheses on the mystery of the Church, a mystery which we all experience and of which we are part. I would like to do so with some concepts..."[12]

---

[10] A. DULLES, *Models of the Church* (Expanded Edition), New York: Doubleday Garden 1987, 9-10.

[11] On this point Pope Francis and Cardinal Avery Dulles are using a meaning of the word "analogy" that bears the imprint of St. Thomas Aquinas: see Summa Contra Gentiles, Book I, chapter 34 (editor's note).

[12] POPE FRANCIS, General Audience in Saint Peter Square *The Church as Family of God* on May 29th, 2013.

3. Use of Images

On this topic, Paul Minear in his book *Images of the Church in the New Testament* gives us more details.[13] The whole Bible provides us with a rich variety of images, both in the Old and the New Testaments. Paul Minear lists more than ninety-six images, for instance, the Church as a flock of sheep, a marching host, a temple, a field, a vine, and a pillar. Such images convey a particular message to those exposed to them. They suggest a program of life and action for specific communities and at the same time are capable of transforming in one way or another their perspectives on life. The images, as far as secular life is concerned, are capable of arousing courage, militancy, and purity among people. They generate, as Dulles says, confidence, devotion, a set of attitudes, and courses of action[14] in the community.

Meanwhile, Preston notes that not all these images are strictly and exclusively applied to the Church; but all to some extent reveal certain dimensions of the Church and speak about God within the context of this world.[15] So, we can say that these biblical images reveal various dimensions of what the Church really is. Images of the Church describe the reality of the believers and their daily human experience both social and religious. To use Dulles' language, "images of the Church should be deeply rooted in the corporate experience and situation of the faithful."[16]

It follows, then, that images do not have to be static, immoveable, unchanged because, on the contrary, they should be adaptable to the new form of life of the believers. They are dynamic

---

[13] For further studies, see P.S. MINEAR, *Images of the Church in the New Testament*, Philadelphia: Westminster Press 1960, 28, quoted by A. DULLES, Models of the Church, 19, and by E. P. CLOWNEY, *Interpreting the Biblical Models of the Church*, 64.

[14] A. DULLES, *Models of the Church.* 20.

[15] G. PRESTON, *Faces of the Church*, Edinburgh: T&T 1997, 3. The New Testament boasts a wealth of imagery where the Church is concerned. It is the salt of the earth, a letter from Christ, fish and fish net, the altar, God's building, the bride of Christ, the assembly of virgins, the wedding feast, a chosen race, a holy nation, the assembly of the justified, the lambs, the house of God, the assembly of the sons/daughters of God, the assemblage of diverse ministries, the body of which Christ is the head...

[16] A. DULLES, *Models of the Church,* 21.

and so they can change. It is worth noting what Paul Tillich has to say: "Images are born or they die, they cannot be forced on people, nor can they ever adequately represent the reality they signify."[17] Even apart from this understanding, it becomes very clear that there are old images which mean actually nothing to certain groups of people in our modern world and so among those groups these images are destined to disappear and leave space for new ones corresponding to recent transformations of their social contexts.

As the world changes, images also change. Rapid cultural change has great impact upon the newly adopted forms of images. If the meaning of an image remains vibrant according to the way it is expressed, then we learn how to use that image according to the more vibrant dynamisms of the culture in which we live. Our images reflect our experience of the particular dimensions of reality that surround us.

Images cannot be imposed on people. They should interface with people's identities. To find out the true meaning of a certain image for a particular group of people we must look at the environment within which the people encounter the image. We agree with Dulles who says, "The contemporary crisis of faith is in very large part a crisis of images."[18]

Whenever a theologian uses an image and applies to it to the Church, that image is imbued with meaning for him and for the milieu where he or she lives. For sure, the one choosing to communicate by means of a certain image is in love with that image. Although he/she is aware that there may be limitations to the image, the advantages of the image remain for him or her in the

---

[17] P. TILLICH quoted by Bishop C. MURPHY- O'CONNOR, *The Family of the Church*, London: Darton Longman and Todd, 1984, 9.

[18] A. DULLES, *Models of the Church,* 21. City dwellers in a twentieth-century democracy may feel ill at ease with many of the biblical images, since these are drawn from the life of a pastoral and patriarchal people of the ancient Near East. City dwellers, on the other hand, may be more familiar with the beggars on the street that are also part of Jesus' environment in the Gospels. Many of us know very little from direct experience about lambs, wolves, sheep, vines, and grapes, or even about kings and patriarchs as they were in biblical times. Many others may not have interpersonal relationships with beggars. There is need, therefore, to supplement these images with others that speak more directly to our contemporaries.

limelight. It is a kind of thoughtful love that flows between the theologian and the metaphor used.

We can see it in Pope Francis' choice of language when he speaks of the "Church as Mother". He lovingly says: "Today I am returning to the image of the Church as mother. I am extremely fond of this image of the Church as mother. For this reason I wish to return to it, because I feel that this image not only tells us what the Church is like but also what faces the Church — this Mother Church of ours — should increasingly have".

Then he explains the meaning of the image by looking at the daily experience of ordinary mothers: "Following what I said last Wednesday I would like to stress three things, still looking at our own mothers, at all they do, at all they experience, and at all they suffer for their children. I ask myself: what does a mother do?"[19] Then he applies those values to the Church.

Before someone uses a particular image, metaphor, or model, therefore, and applies it to the reality that we identify as Church, he/she needs to fall in love with that concept or that reality as the Holy Father does.

What then does the Church teach about her images?

4. Models of the Church

A principal agendum for Vatican II was the renewal of the Church. All documents of the Council to some extent make significant references to the Church. What strikes us is the fact that the Council presents the nature and the mission of the Church by way of images. The best illustration could be that of the Dogmatic Constitution on the Church, *Lumen Gentium.*

This document focuses on the Church as the Body of Christ and develops the image of the People of God. Clowney gives voice to what all of us have observed, namely, that chapter six of this document makes reference to many images of the Church that are to be found in both the Old and the New Testaments. In paragraphs six to ten of this chapter, one reads that the Church is the Flock of Christ, the Vineyard of God, the Temple of the Holy Spirit, and the Spouse of the Immaculate Lamb. Clowney seems to be making an

[19] POPE FRANCIS, General Audience in Saint Peter Square, *The Church as Mother (2)* on September 12th, 2013.

appropriate remark when he says: "These [images] are either taken from the life of the shepherd or from the cultivation of the land, from the art of building or from family life and marriage; they have their further preparation in the prophets."[20] These images magnificently supplement one another and indicate in different ways Christ's tender love for and intimate union with the Church.

Images derive from human daily experience and reflect its reality. What could the image of a vine mean for Africans who are not acquainted with this plant or the image of a shepherd for people who have grown up in urban centres in the East, West, North or South – or for those people who have had no contact with such images through their reading or exposure to television or films? Are these images not distant from their lives? This is because whatever image may be used, it carries with it the culture and the social activity of its people.

The same image can bear various meanings according to the place and the time. The way Africans understand the image 'shepherd' may differ from those who live in the industrialized sections of Europe or Asia. For most Africans, just as for the Navajo and other Native Americans in parts of the United States, a shepherd spends most of his time far from his people amidst his flock in the bush. He endures all kinds of difficulties to feed his sheep. For some economies that have developed certain kinds of agricultural technology, the shepherd's work may have become easier and may provide him or her with methods for taking care of his/her sheep without so much arduous labour.

Another image could be that of 'family'. Its understandings by Africans, Easterners, Westerners and Latins may differ. While for descendants of refugees and those populations that have been more mobile, it may mean the nuclear family, for Africans – as for Koreans, Japanese, many Central Europeans, and Latin Americans – they use the term to include the extended family.

Although we have different understandings of the word "family", nobody can deny the pivotal position of the family in every human society. There is no society without family. The crisis of a society is first the crisis of the family. "Like family, like society".

---

[20] E.P. CLOWNEY, *Interpreting the Biblical Models of the Church,* 64.

Pope Francis celebrated Mass in St Peter's Square on Sunday, October 27th, 2013, to mark the 30th Sunday of Ordinary Time and the World Family Day at the close of the 21st Plenary Assembly of the Pontifical Council for the Family, which met in Rome to discuss the theme of living the joy of the faith. In his homily, the Holy Father spoke of "the family as the salt of the earth and the light of the world, it is the leaven of society". Then on the same day, before reciting the Angelus, pausing before the icon of the Holy Family, he prayed: "Holy Family of Nazareth, reawaken in our society the awareness of the sacred and inviolable character of the family, an inestimable and irreplaceable good. Let every family be a welcoming place of goodness and peace for children and the elderly, for the sick and lonely, for the poor and needy". The last African Synod declares: "The family is the "sanctuary of life" and a vital cell of society and the Church. It is here that "the features of a people take shape; it is here that its members acquire basic teachings".[21]

It is noteworthy that to show the importance of the family in the life of the society-at-large, the Holy Father called for an Extraordinary Synod on the Family which took place at the Vatican, from the 5th to the 19th of October, 2014. The family is the foundation rock on which the society is built. In this regard the Synod considered the evangelization of the African family as a major priority.[22] God Himself elevated and sanctified the institution of the family by His incarnation choosing to enter into human history as the Redeemer through a human family. God, therefore, wants to show how open the family should be to every human being. The Church, the family of God, has this same desire. She should be a place where all are welcome and find shelter. We recall once more Pope Francis' words during his interview with *La Civiltà Cattolica*: "This Church with which we should be thinking is the home of all, not a small chapel that can hold only a small group of selected people".

[21] BENEDICT XVI, Post-Synodal Apostolic Exhortation, *Africa Munus (AM* 42*)*, Benin, 2011.

[22] JOHN-PAUL II, Post-Synodal Apostolic Exhortation, *Ecclesia in Africa (EA* 80) Cameroun, 1995.

5. The Church as Family of God

According to the Second Vatican Council, the Church is indeed identified as the universal sacrament of salvation, but she is not confined to that image. Other images, too, render vibrant the mystery of the Church: she is the People of God and the Body of Christ. Vatican II revived a way of looking at the mystery of the Church based on Scripture.[23] The Council seems to have understood better than earlier synods that mere definitions impoverish rather than enrich our appreciation of the Church as mystery. Therefore, the Fathers of the Council preferred the use of images. Although they used a diversity of images, they seem to emphasize the well-known figure of the "People of God".

Besides this image, we have fortunately another image of the Church that finds its origin in Africa, most publicly, since the first African Synod in 1994: "The Church as Family of God". The Synod Fathers acknowledged it as an expression of the Church's nature particularly appropriate for Africans to appreciate, inculcate and then teach to the rest of the world. For this image emphasizes "care for others, solidarity, warmth in human relationships, acceptance, dialogue and trust".[24] The Synod Fathers called upon African theologians to probe more deeply into this image of the Church: "It is earnestly to be hoped that theologians in Africa will work out the theology of the Church as Family with all the riches contained in this concept, showing its complementarity with other images of the Church".[25]

I was deeply amazed and excited to hear that on 29th May 2013, the Holy Father, Pope Francis, in his General Audience, used this metaphor that is specifically meant to be an African contribution to the universal Church. Let me repeat again his own words:

---

[23] Here one does not hesitate to call to mind the same fourth chapter of St. Cyprian's perennially important *The Unity of the Catholic Church,* where the African Father draws forth an insight precisely from Scriptural imagery: "This sacrament of unity, this bond of an inseparably cohering harmony, is indicated in the Gospel when the tunic of the Lord Jesus Christ is in no way divided" (CSEL, Vol. 3, part 1 [Vienna Corpus]). By resorting to images drawn from Scripture, the Second Vatican Council followed an age-old practice very much encouraged by the Fathers of the Church. (Editor's Note).

[24] *EA* 63.

[25] *EA* 63.

> Last Wednesday I emphasized the deep bond between the Holy Spirit and the Church. Today I would like to begin some catecheses on the mystery of the Church, a mystery which we all experience and of which we are part. I would like to do so with some concepts that are evident in the texts of the Second Vatican Ecumenical Council. Today the first one is: "The Church as the Family of God".[26]

That was marvellous for Africans to hear this metaphor of the Church from the mouth of the Holy Father in Saint Peter's Square. It was precisely the image that Africa should be teaching the rest of the world. A friend of mine called me that day from Saint Peter informing me that the Holy Father had publicly taken note of an image of the Church for which Africa was a spokesperson for the universal Church. He was so happy that he recalled the entire Post-Synod Apostolic Exhortation, *Ecclesia in* Africa.

On that day, Pope Francis said:

> What is God's plan? It is to make of us all a single family of his children, in which each person feels that God is close and feels loved by him, as in the Gospel parable, feels the warmth of being God's family. The Church is rooted in this great plan. She is not an organization established by an agreement between a few people, but — as Pope Benedict XVI has so often reminded us — she is a work of God, born precisely from this loving design which is gradually brought about in history. The Church is born from God's wish to call all people to communion with him, to friendship with him, indeed, to share in his own divine life as his sons and daughters. The very word "Church", from the Greek *ekklesia*, means "convocation": God convokes us, he impels us to come out of our individualism, from our tendency to close ourselves into ourselves, and he calls us to belong to his family... The lifeblood of God's family, of the Church, is God's love which is actualized in loving him and others, all others, without distinction or reservation. The Church is a family in which we love and are loved.[27]

On another occasion, during a teaching that concentrated on the words "I believe in One Church", the Holy Father emphasized again the dimension of the Church as the Family of God. He said:

> Wherever we go, even to the smallest parish in the most remote corner of this earth, there is the one Church. We are at home, we are in the family, and we are among brothers and sisters. And this is

[26] Pope Francis, General Audience, *The Church as Family of God.*

[27] Pope Francis, *The Church as Family of God.*

> a great gift of God! The Church is one for us all. There is not one Church for Europeans, one for Africans, one for Americans, one for Asians, one for those who live in Oceania. No, she is one and the same everywhere. It is like being in a family: some of its members may be far away, scattered across the world, but the deep bonds that unite all the members of a family stay solid however great the distance. [28]

The unity of the Church has to be built on the model of the unity of the family. Everybody cares for everyone.[29] As Pope Francis put it again in such a way it requires a deep personal meditation:

> When I hear that so many Christians in the world are suffering, am I indifferent or is it as if one of my family were suffering? When I think or hear it said that many Christians are persecuted and give their lives for their faith, does this touch my heart or not? Am I open to a brother or sister of the family who is giving his or her life for Jesus Christ? Do we pray for each other? I have a question for you, but don't answer out loud, only in your heart. How many of you pray for Christians who are being persecuted? How many? Everyone respond in his heart. Do I pray for my brother, for my sister who is in difficulty because they confess and defend their faith? It is important to look beyond our own boundaries, to feel that we are Church, one family in God![30]

It is together that we are the Church. In this regard, we dare to affirm that the African First Synod should be remembered for beginning to enrich the entire Church with the image of the Church as the Family of God. Using a very touching illustration, Gerard Nwagwu affirms with an insight into contemporary culture, "This is the model [the Church as Family of God] which has motivated people to paraphrase the pop song, 'We are the World' to read 'We are the Church'. It is a profound contribution to the universal Church, especially during this time when people's consciousness is focused towards creating a global village."[31]

---

[28] POPE FRANCIS, General Audience in Saint Peter's Square, *The Church is One*, on September 25th, 2013.

[29] For a through explanation of this form of solidarity/communion where everyone cares for everyone, see (St.) John Paul II, *Sollicitudo Rei Socialis,* Encyclical Letter "On Social Concern," par. 39 and 40 (Ed. Note).

[30] POPE FRANCIS, General Audience, *The Church is One.*

[31] M.G. NWAGU, *Communion and self-reliance: Signs of the Church as God's Family in Africa", AFER* 42 (2000) 18-26.

For the Church in Africa as well as for the Holy Father, the image of family brings about care for others, solidarity, hospitality, sharing, warmth in human relationships, mutual acceptance, dialogue and trust.[32]

This aspect of care for other members of the Family of God was clearly brought out by Pope Francis at a General Audience when suddenly he asked the crowd to pray for a member of the family of God – the Church – who is sick. It was one of the rare times in history that a Pope named someone and asked the assembly to pray for her. It was surprising and meanwhile his call has created in everyone the feelings of belonging to the same family. The Pope's call bound people together. He said:

> And now let me ask you for an act of charity: relax, it is not a collection! Before coming into the Square I went to see a little girl, a year and a half old, who is gravely ill. Her father and mother are praying, and asking the Lord to heal this beautiful little girl. Her name is Noemi. The poor little one was smiling! Let us perform an act of love. We do not know her, but she is a baptized child, she is one of us, she is a Christian. Let us perform an act of love for her and in silence ask the Lord for his help in this moment and that He grant her health. Let us take a moment of silence and then we will pray the "Hail Mary". And now all together let us pray to Our Lady for the health of Noemi. Hail Mary.... Thank you for this act of charity.[33]

"Be who you are" – this act of charity affirms who the Church is: the Family of God. The Church as Family of God has mainly two characteristics: "to be with Christ" in order "to be for one another". This Church must be the sacrament of brotherly love. It is the Church that prays together and cares for one another. In Francis 'own words:

> In the family, everything that enables us to grow, to mature and to live is given to each of us. We cannot grow up by ourselves, we cannot journey on our own, in isolation; rather, we journey and grow in a community, in a family. And so it is in the Church! In the Church we can listen to the Word of God with the assurance that it is the message that the Lord has given us; in the Church we can encounter the Lord in the Sacraments, which are the open windows through which the light of God is given to us, streams from which we can draw

[32] *EA* 60.

[33] POPE FRANCIS, General Audience, *The Church as Communion of Saints* (2), on November 6th, 2013.

God's very life; in the Church we learn to live in the communion and love that comes from God.

Suddenly, the Pope brings in new metaphors in juxtaposition with the image of the Church as Family of God:

> Each one of us can ask himself or herself today, how do I live in the Church? When I go to church, is it as though I were at the stadium, at a football match? Is it as though I were at the cinema? No, it is something else. How do I go to church? How do I receive the gifts that the Church offers me to grow and mature as a Christian? Do I participate in the life of the community or do I go to church and withdraw into my own problems, isolating myself from others? In this first sense, the Church is catholic because she is everyone's home. Everyone is a child of the Church and in her all find their home.[34]

The Church as the family of God is the home for all and nobody is excluded. What does it mean the home for all? The Holy Father has a clear answer:

> In visiting Elisabeth, the Virgin Mary brought not only material help — she brought this too — but she also brought Jesus, who was already alive in her womb. Bringing Jesus into that house meant bringing joy, the fullness of joy. Our Lady also wants to bring the great gift of Jesus to us, to us all; and with him she brings us his love, his peace, and his joy. In this regard, when he talked of Mary as image or model of the Church, he says: "In this, the Church is like Mary: the Church is not a shop, she is not a humanitarian agency, and the Church is not an NGO.[35]

For the Holy Father, the aim of the Church as Family of God is thus togetherness, brotherly care, unity, catholicity but always in diversity. That means diversity in harmony.

> The Church is catholic because she is the "home of harmony" where unity and diversity know how to merge in order to become a great source of wealth. Let us think about the image of a symphony, which implies accord, harmony, various instruments playing together. Each one preserves its own unmistakable timbre and the sounds characteristic of each blend together around a common theme. Then there is the one who directs it, the conductor, and as the symphony is performed all play together in "harmony", but the timbre of each

[34] Pope Francis, General Audience in Saint Peter's Square, *The Church is Catholic*, on October 9th, 2013.

[35] Pope Francis, General Audience, *Mary as the image and model of the Church*, on October 23rd, 2013.

individual instrument is never eliminated; indeed, the uniqueness of each is greatly enhanced!"

The true Church as family of God is the Church in harmony. The Holy Father is not yet tired to bring to us new images. As we said it earlier: "Images are born or they die, they cannot be forced on people, nor can they ever adequately represent the reality they signify."[36] After having taught about the images drawn from sport (stadium, football match), from art (cinema), from medical sciences (a field hospital after battle), and from the nature (nest), he has come up with a new image from music:

> The Church is like a great orchestra in which there is great variety. We are not all the same and we do not all have to be the same. We are all different, varied, each of us with his own special qualities. And this is the beauty of the Church: everyone brings his own gift, which God has given him, for the sake of enriching others. And between the various components there is diversity; however, it is a diversity that does not enter into conflict and opposition. It is a variety that allows the Holy Spirit to blend it into harmony. He is the true "Maestro". He is harmony.[37]

The key point, at this level, is unity in diversity.[38] And the image of orchestral harmony expresses it much better than any other image of the Church. Using this image of "orchestra", he joins those theologians and Church Fathers who declare their great love for this genre of image, just as he has for other images. If he fell in love with the image of the Church as Mother, he finds now that the Church as orchestra is a very beautiful image. Images require love from the person who is using them. You can only give what you possess.

---

[36] P. TILLICH quoted by Bishop C. MURPHY - O'CONNOR, *The Family of the Church*, 9.

[37] POPE FRANCIS, *The Church is Catholic.*

[38] The Pope here is using an image popularized by Hans Urs von Balthasar. See *The Truth is Symphonic: Aspects of Christian Pluralism.* San Francisco, Ignatius Press, 1987, to plumb the depths of what it means to be beautifully and harmoniously united in diversity as a symphony orchestra would be. It is well known that in his theological aesthetics, *The Glory of the Lord,* Von Balthasar developed a very expansive theology on the Beautiful: if God is Beauty, he said, we should speak [and sing] about God beautifully (Ed. Note).

6. Contributions of Avery Dulles regarding Pope Francis' Use of Images

In his book *Models of the Church,* Cardinal Avery Dulles speaks principally of five ways by which we can understand the nature of the Church: the Church is an Institution; the Church is a Mystical Communion; the Church is a Sacrament; the Church is Herald; and the Church is a Servant. Pope Francis seems to be posing a contrast: for the Pope the Church is the Family of God; the Church is Mother; the Church is Temple; the Church is a Field Hospital for those wounded in battle.

These models do not exclude each other as if one is comprehensively "correct" while the others are "defective." These models rather encourage thoughtful consideration of different approaches to ecclesiology. One cannot say of a single model, "This captures the entire essence of ecclesiology or that is exactly what the Church is."

So in order to understand properly the ecclesiology of Pope Francis, you need to consider the entire constellation of the images of the Church that he has used. Otherwise, you would not be able to do justice to his theology. What we are saying, of course, is that it would be a great mistake to be imprisoned in one model. To have recourse to a variety of images in the manner of Pope Francis is more likely to render the Church accessible as God intends her to be.

For instance, "the fact that the Church of a certain century may have been primarily an institution does not prevent the Church in another generation from being conspicuously a community of grace, a herald, a sacrament or a servant."[39] Every individual model underlines some dimensions of the Church that is lacking in other models. Each of the models possesses its own characteristic elements that distinguish it from the others.

The models remain located within a time and space framework. Each model reflects its own reality. The Church is not "an" image or "a" model or "a" metaphor; rather it is a constellation of images, models and metaphors. Yves Congar seems to capture the Church's

---

[39] A. Dulles, *Models of the Church,* 188 quoted by Bishop C. MURPHY - O'CONNOR, *The Family of the Church,* 10.

position in time and space when he says: *Que l'Eglise existe et vive dans une vraie histoire, cela signifie aussi qu'elle ne peut s'affranchir du temps, de son poids et de son épaisseur, des délais qu'il impose. Ce n'est pas malgré le temps et son déroulement, c'est en eux que l'Eglise porte les dons de Dieu et les met en œuvre...*[40] And in the same trend of thought, Bernard Sesboüé adds: *car l'Eglise est toujours de son temps et de la culture des milieux où elle vit.*[41]

A. Dulles encourages the combination of models because they shed light on – and at the same time qualify – one another. Any model applied exclusively to the Church may lead to fundamentalism and a consequent distortion.[42] Louis Luzbetak in his book, *The Church and Cultures* makes a beautiful observation on the matter. He says: "No single perspective - institutional, communal, sacramental, or whatever - will by itself describe the Church satisfactorily. In isolation, any single model would in fact be a distortion. I am saying that any sound ecclesiology will complement its preferred model with aspects from other models, thereby filling in gaps and restoring balance."[43]

To borrow an apt, classical comparison from Avery Dulles, "In ecclesiology we must constantly and simultaneously keep a variety of models before us [the dominant as well as the complementary] much the way jugglers concentrate on and deal not with only one but all objects tossed in the air."

It is easy to distinguish in the ecclesiology of Pope Francis the subsidiary images that complement from the principal images. At the beginning of each audience, he announces the topic he will deal

[40] Y. CONGAR, *Cette Eglise que j'aime*, Paris: Les Editions du Cerf 1968, 90. Translation: "The Church exists and lives within a true history. That means that she cannot free herself from the confines of time, from its size, its density, from the limits it imposes. It is not in spite of time and its advance forward but within time that she bears God's gifts and puts them into action."

[41] B. SESBOUE, *N'ayez pas peur! Regards sur l'Eglise et les ministères aujourd'hui*, Paris: Desclée de Brouwer 1996, 14. Translation : « Since the Church belongs always to her time and to the culture of the milieus where she lives… »

[42] A. DULLES, *Models of the Church*, 32.

[43] L. LUZBETAK, *The Church and Cultures. New Perspectives in Missiological Anthropology*, New York: Orbis Books Maryknoll, 1991, 129.

with. During the ensuing exposition of his topic, complementary images emerge that facilitate the understanding of the principal images.

Moreover, Pope Francis often explains certain images of the Church by using counter-images which describe what the Church is not supposed to be. For instance, while comparing the image of the Church to that of Mary, he says: "The Church is not a shop, she is not a humanitarian agency, and the Church is not an NGO". In the same way, while stressing the values of communion and mutual care in the Church as the Family of God, he clearly puts a line of demarcation between this image in its appropriateness and other images that he does not deem appropriate. He says, for instance, that when Christians go to church, they are not going to a stadium to see a football match or to a cinema and so forth.

Finally, when he speaks about the Church as the Family of God, and therefore as a home for all, he will contrast it with the image of the Church as a nest protecting the very few and guarding its mediocrity.

Actually, images of the Church can be complementary. "To ignore any one of them," suggests A. Dulles, "might well spell disaster."[44] From this observation, it follows that the models should interrelate among themselves in order to yield a good result. An accurate and practical ecclesiology should find out ways and means of discerning and including positive, important, and verifiably accurate aspects of each basic ecclesiological model within it. Any single isolated model, though excellent in its appearance, can hardly solve all questions in the community. It undoubtedly needs the help of elements from other models to be successful.

At the risk of repeating ourselves, we think in tandem with Dulles: we cannot exclusively commit ourselves to a single model of the Church because each of the models has its own strengths and weaknesses; no one model should be canonized as the measure of all the rest.[45] Dulles puts it this way: "We must recognize that our own favourite paradigms, however excellent, do not solve all questions."[46] In order to solve problems or to respond somehow to

---

[44] A. DULLES quoted by L. LUZBETAK, *The Church and* Cultures, 129.
[45] A. DULLES, *Models of the Church,* 32.
[46] A. DULLES, *Models of the Church*, 32.

the expectations of the society or of the community of the faithful in a fruitful manner, there is a necessity of interconnections among a variety of images. In other words, there is a need for creating an ecclesiological network of images of the Church which has as an overriding principle, interdependence.

The above contribution of Avery Cardinal Dulles can help us to understand the theology behind the variety of images used by Pope Francis to explain the reality of "Church". We underline the fact that "each image of the Church brings with it its own favourite set of images, its own rhetoric, its own values, certitudes, commitments, and priorities. It even brings with it a particular set of preferred problems."[47] In this regard, Dulles suggests that the work of a theologian is to harmonize all those models that reflect accurately one or more dimensions of the Church in such a way that their differences become complementary rather than repugnant.[48]

To grasp properly the thought of Pope Francis on the Church, therefore, one needs to consider the variety of images that he used and then situate them in time and space. It means to comprehend them in their own context because images are always fruits of life experiences.

In the case of Pope Francis, it is mostly during the General Audiences that he uses these metaphors of the Church: in fact it is during the Wednesday Catechesis on the Creed: "I believe in the Church". That means: "I believe in One, Holy, Catholic, Apostolic Church".

Conclusion

Hardly anyone doubts that the Holy Father is a good communicator. It is obvious that he is also a good pedagogue. As a good teacher, he knows that in order to be well understood by his audience, he has to be didactic and to teach didactically means to teach by using images. Words can be misunderstood, whereas images speak by themselves according to each one's own Christian perspective. When the Holy Father speaks of the "family", for example, everyone knows what he means and is aware of the new

---

[47] A. DULLES, *Models of the Church*, 31.
[48] A. DULLES, *Models of the Church,* 185.

challenges he/she personally is facing. It is the same with the Church as Mother; the Church as Orchestra; the Church as a field hospital after battle, … Each image speaks by itself to Christian hearts.

For sure, Pope Francis is not the first one to use models of the Church. There have been a lot of people, Church Fathers and theologians who used them before him, for example, Vatican II. Pope Francis himself acknowledges that the images he uses come from the Second Vatican Council.

We are all witnessing, however, that those images borrowed from Vatican II and used nowadays by Pope Francis are resonating differently within the hearts and lives of believers. They are exercising a great impact on the life of the faithful. As I indicated above, a well-known image of Vatican II, for example, is that of the Church as the People of God. In Africa, it is the Church as the Family of God. Why did these metaphors not fascinate people in the past like they are doing now in the time of Pope Francis? What is the key point?

It is true that Pope Francis does not invent anything new. It is also true that he is teaching what the Church used to teach and what the Church teaches now. However, the great difference is the way of transmission. He cultivates and puts into practice the art of transmission and communication in a very simple way that touches human hearts. He speaks with frankness to the individual person. He comes down and enters into human daily life and daily experiences. It is a kind of an ecclesiology of the incarnation. If the theology of incarnation talks about the Word becoming flesh and dwelling among us, the ecclesiology of incarnation speaks of the Church becoming flesh, the Church dwelling within human experiences, the Church smelling of her sheep and not neglecting to live even on the existential peripheries with the marginalized.

For Pope Francis, the Church must become the sacrament of God's love and God's justice in the world.[49]

The Holy Father's words are energizing:

---

[49] J.M. ELA, *Foi d'Africain,* Paris: Karthala, 1985, 100; J. BAUR, *2000 years of Christianity in Africa*, Nairobi: Paulines Publications Africa 1994, 437.

> The Church is called to come out of herself and to go to the peripheries, not only geographically, but also to the existential peripheries: the mystery of sin, of pain, of injustice, of ignorance and indifference to religion, of intellectual currents, and of all misery. When the Church does not come out of herself to evangelize, she becomes self-referential and she gets sick.[50]

Pope Francis applied this to himself. That is why the Church is breathing anew a very fresh air. With Pope Francis, we see also the emergence of an ecclesiology that, while coming from above (the Church is a gift from our heavenly Father through Jesus in the Spirit), it becomes flesh below, for example, within an ecclesiology of metaphors. The Church in images or the rainbow Church is an energetic one; the liveliness of the images enrich her nature and her mission. With this rainbow ecclesiology, the focus is no longer on understanding the Church exclusively by way of formulaic definitions, but rather, since she remains a mystery, to describe her through the many hues of prismatic imagery.

Let us conclude by adverting to the Pope's cordial salutation to the English-speaking faithful who attended the General Audience in Saint Peter Square that day he taught them about the Church as a Family of God. For me, it is more than a mere salutation; rather it is a call to conversion: "May you always grow in love for Christ and for God's Family which is the Church. God bless you all!"

---

[50] Pope Francis, Homily for Chrism Mass on Holy Thursday 28th March 2013. We find more in Jimmy Akin, *The 4-Minute Speech That Got Pope Francis Elected? On April 23rd, 2013.* In the period leading up to conclave, the cardinals of the Church gather in a series of meetings that are known as the "general congregations". In these meetings, they are allowed to make brief statements – known as "interventions" – about the problems they feel need to be addressed in the Church and what kind of man the next Pope should be. Before the recent conclave, Cardinal Bergoglio gave an intervention, which didn't even last four minutes but which got the attention of his brother cardinals. According to some, this speech was a major moment in his path to becoming Pope Francis. It is said that Cardinal Borgoglio gave the notes of this speech to Cardinal Jaime Ortega of Havana after he asked for a copy, one of the 115 cardinals that took part in the pre-conclave, recently released to the website of the Catholic magazine *Palabra Nueva* a handwritten note by Francis outlining the speech he gave at one of the closed-door pre-conclave meetings of cardinals.

Paving a Way for the Lord

Kazimierz Mazur

Faculty of Sociology
Higher School of Economics and Technology
Jaroslaw, Poland

A voice cries, ‘Prepare in the desert a way for Yahweh. Make a straight highway for our God across the wastelands. Let every valley be filled in, every mountain and hill be levelled, every cliff become a plateau, every escarpment a plain; then the glory of Yahweh will be revealed and all humanity will see it together, for the mouth of Yahweh has spoken’ (Is 40, 3-5).

What does it mean to prepare the way for the Lord? In the tradition of the Catholic Church we find many useful indications. For example, Origen, an alert African scholar from Alexandria and researcher of the above Scriptural passage stated that the very way in which we should prepare for Him is through what happens in our heart. In other words, to “prepare ourselves for the coming of the Lord,” implies we should build a foundation of truth and love within our hearts and souls

With this said, we enter upon the issue that constitutes the theme of this present article: the fashionably new paradigm for understanding gender, and the role this paradigm has usurped within present social and psychological fields of study.

It is almost impossible to ignore the fact that today’s media, making full use of the possibilities of international information technology (IT) in an expansively public manner *inundate* us from left and right with the issue of *gender*. This might be compared somewhat to the analogy of a building that once upon a time was constructed as a well-aligned roadhouse in the wilderness, but now – through ideological modifications, alterations of gender, and other related factors – has reverted back to be nothing more than a slippery steep slope, entirely useless for human life.

What *is* gender? How can we define it? The German writer and sociologist Gabriele Kuby, in her publication, *The Global Sexual*

Revolution: The Destruction of Freedom in the Name of Freedom, has said that in our times we are experiencing the most extreme possible form of relativism: it negates all of what has been learned through experience from the beginning of mankind, what is obvious, regular, predictable and visible as the contrasts between day and night… in other words, that human beings exist first and foremost as two separate sexes – male and female in their own separate essence and being. The German sociologist observes that during the last ten years this negation has become the principal current in and of itself and now carries along with it a social revolution that is shocking the very foundations of human existence.

Given such difficult circumstances, one might naturally formulate the following questions: Where is the soil within which this essential denial of gender has planted its roots? Upon what kind of foundation do these novel intrusions into understanding the essence of human existence stand? Is the foundation firm or shaky?

Male and Female: Product of a Heterosexual Imagination?

This new social phenomenon, according to Kuby, rests in the presumption that sexual differentiation between man and woman is the product of a manipulation, of a *social construction* – a component emerging forth from a *heterosexual patriarchate*.

According to this line of thought, it is voiced in the *public forum* that any traditional acceptance of sexual diversity not only oppresses and discriminates against the homosexual minority, but in general – and contrary to the *laissez faire* dynamic of social law – limits human freedom.

According to homosexual/lesbian belief systems, practices and tenets, heterosexuality is not of the human essence but rather is an “obligation imposed.” True freedom requires removing the obligation: this mindset implies that, regardless of “biologically given sex”, every human being is personally free to determine his or her own *social sex* and associated behaviour within the context of our present time. This fight takes place by placing at the forefront the artificial and innocently sounding concept of *gender*.

In order to truly understand this whole process – what is hidden behind this novel concept of *gender* – and its core propositions, we need to describe it more precisely.

Originally, at its infant stage of development, this term was used to determine the *grammar genre of nouns and pronouns* – in some languages, for example Thai, gender could also be a suffix for many parts of speech because the suffixes men use in Thailand are different from those used by women. At the World Population Conference in Cairo (1994) and the World Conference on Women in Beijing (1995), pro-feminists underhandedly introduced the concept of *gender* as a substitute for the word *sex*, to describe sexual differentiation terminology between *man* and *woman*. In so doing, they detached the word *masculine* from the noun *man*, and did the same manoeuvre with the female by detaching *feminine* from the noun woman. Thus, they opened the door for arbitrary decision-making in the use of these two adjectival referents.

To clarify further what was happening, Gabriele Kuby explained that gender assumptions become equivalent to a controlled process in which an ideal construct – “biological sex” – later on, and under duress, becomes a materialistic product of manipulation. It *ceases to be a natural fact or an inviolable condition of the body;* rather it is a *process* by which a person or group concretizes social norms by making the “ideal choice” for one’s sex versus the willing acceptance of one’s given biological sex – the concretizing takes place by a forced and constant repetition of what a person or group of people wish to promote as norms, terms and words. In this sense, one may claim that he/she is considered to be a man or a woman only because others – members of a family or a society – have persuade him/her to accept this as *ipso facto,* that is to say, as a “given fact”.

Kuby asserts that this form of struggle has become a political strategy and makes of gender a personal choice: this strategy may extend even to entire countries. It needs to be pointed out here, however, that the vast majority of the population does not even have the slightest idea of how far this process/strategy has successfully become part of the social fabric as a *given fact*.

One can speculate that the reason for this lies with the majority of ruling elites in the domains of politics, law and mass media.

These are the moguls who have now taken over promoting this strategy, even in militant fashion, as if it were their 'responsible mission', an obligation incumbent upon them in order to defend the individual rights of the human person. If one were to speak on a global scale, this mindset, injected into the international public mainstream, takes on the identity of "gender perspective."

Male and Female: God's Gift to Humanity?

For someone who still lives within the context of a traditional family unit – a scenario which still prevails in the world, especially in Africa – it seems almost impossible to believe or even imagine that there might exist a group or a party which has proposed principles and tenets for the human biological differentiation of the sexes and the behaviour associated with each sex (this includes dress) that actually strive to manipulate in a perverse manner God's created order – an order given to humanity as a gift. How is it possible that groups can resist that order and instead insist upon making one's sexual identity an individual choice? How can a person actually condone the principles of the *nouveau gender* mindset?

We should emphasize here that, whether it is due to our ignorance, to our lack of political involvements, or simply to a tendency to accept naively the voices and images of the propaganda that clutter the mass media, the mass media's ability to penetrate the lives of people everywhere so intrusively has given the term *gender* together with its harmful ideology a foothold within the social fabric. *Gender* becomes, for example, a subject for study and debate at almost all of the major universities. What is shocking is that those universities who for various reasons have rejected the *gender-by-choice mindset* now suffer punishment for their stance as if they were immoral in their rejection. They face staunch refusal of financial aid for research, of gifts or trusts for studies that involve religious issues; they are "black-listed," singled out by the gender-by-choice mass media.

Meanwhile, in various publications or interviews it is said that there is no such thing as '*gender ideology*. Rather, it is emphasized that "gender" now has become a serious academically acceptable area for traditional and formal research to explore variability of personal patterns and choice of gender preferences. This alternating pattern now includes in its developmental spectrum children who are encouraged to make a personal choice whether they would like to be a man or a woman and consequently determine their life identity according to the choice they are making, despite their biologically innate features and birth genome DNA type.

Therefore, it is necessary to look into ethical questions that can be raised in this field of the ideology of gender preference.

G. Kuby argues that, he/she who lives in relatively *normal* conditions could consider all these facts as described above as simply isolated incidents or accidents that involve neither himself/herself nor their children.

If we look closely, however, at the intensity by which the adherents to the gender ideology are going well beyond its character as a merely sexual issue into the political domain, and the consequent, apparently very effective fight they are waging for pushing this ideology as a global "human rights" issue, to be protected and guaranteed by laws and fortified by the programs of educational institutions and legal/political action movements that involve people of all ages – then we may notice that there looms the possibility of a global attack on the traditional religious beliefs expressed in the *Credo* and on the rational acknowledgement of a social order for the human race that God himself has designed. This very order, that from the creation of the first human beings, and throughout all subsequent historical periods of human growth and development, and in all cultures and religions that find their roots in those periods of growth and development – cultures and religions that have embraced a constellation of somatic-social mores that recognize what distinguishes men from women and what constitutes their unification by means of the sexual act, an act that is intrinsically directed towards procreation – it is this very social/cultural fabric that the new gender ideology menaces.

What Should We Do? What Can We Do?

Hence there arise the questions: What should *we* do? What *can* be done? These demand urgent answers.

A document that links together the moral consciousness of Polish bishops and that of the family-oriented cluster of African cultures is that issued by the Polish Bishops' Conference under the title: *With concern for the person and the common good*. The bishops, of course, take Poland as their example. They stress that Poland is currently reaching a turning point where this ideological trend threatens the higher levels of societal development even if that development has shown many commendable signs of success.

First of all, values maintained through solidarity have wrought and bonded the Polish nation for centuries and have helped it to survive despite times of distress and serious threats of impending collapse. Without reliance upon and reference to these values, any kind of achieved progress might have turned out to be simply a temporary and illusory mirage, and consequently might have even threatened and ripped asunder the intact "seamless garment of beliefs" – the very *Credo* of the nation. The manner in which Polish culture has kept the nation alive reminds one of the way traditional African cultures have kept the continent marvellously alive in the spirit of family and community.

The gender ideology would provoke a crisis, a free fall in the deterioration of standards and rules in the field of culture. The pseudo-culture of perversion and shamelessness could become expansive enough to take over the entire country. The recent past has seen great confusion both in what is understood and what is intended: because deliberate actions of a commercial nature have invaded the intimate sphere of human sexuality and targeted sexuality as a commodity, great embarrassment has ensued.

How should we respond? The most important initiative in this regard, as the Polish bishops presented it, belongs to the *parents*. In this sense, the document states that sexual education *still remains* a most *basic right and duty of parents. Concern* and *attentive guidance* must the mainsprings for sexual education, whether it is taking place in the home or within educational centres staffed, supervised, and cared for both by parents and by knowledgeable professionals.

Our reflection has explored a basic orientation and a path to follow that allows us to logically, calmly, and with determination plan strategic guidelines for the present and thus open the way for the future. Given this context and the urgency of the issue, it is to be noted that Pope Francis in his Encyclical *Lumen Fidei* (*The Light of Faith*) made the sharp observation that people have renounced the search for a great Light – for Truth itself – in order to be content with smaller lights that illumine fleeting moments yet prove incapable of showing the way. In the absence of light everything becomes confused; it is impossible to distinguish good from evil, to distinguish the road to our destination from other roads that only take us in endless circles and go nowhere. Only the true Light can define the way, even if there is initial darkness. The Light dispels the darkness, for darkness fails to co-exist with Light.

That is why the Holy Father argues for the urgency of recovering the light; for it *is the key characteristic* of faith. When the flame of faith goes out, all other lights eventually lose their lustre. The light of faith has its particular nature, because it is able to illuminate a whole person's life. In order to keep the light constant and powerful, it cannot come from ourselves. It must be rooted in the primary source, that is to say, that it must ultimately come from God. This Primary Source carries all the answers for which we cry out in our times.

The principal and basic message from Scripture says that a human being is created in God's image: "So God created man in the image of Himself, in the image of God he created him; *male* and *female* he created them" (Gen 1, 27). May we recover that image politically, socially, culturally, economically, educationally, and in the heart of our prayer and adoration.

References

Benedict XVI, Apostolic Letter Motu Proprio data *Porta Fidei* for the Induction of the Year of Faith. Vatican: Libreria Editrice Vaticana, 2011.

Gabriele Kuby, *Die globale sexuelle Revolution: Zerstörung der Freiheit im Namen der Freiheit.* Kißlegg: Fe-Medienverlags GmbH, 2013.

Jacqueline Russ, *La pensée éthique contemporaine*. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 2012.

Joseph Ratzinger, *Wendezeit fur Europa? Diagnosen und Prognosen zur Lage von Kirche und Welt.* Freiburg: Johannes Verlag, 1991.

Polish Episcopal Conference, *For the concern of the person and the common good*, (*W trosce o człowieka i dobro wspólne*). Warszawa: KEP Press, 2012.

Pope Francis, Encyclical letter *Lumen Fidei* (The Light of Faith), Vatican: Libreria Editrice Vaticana, 2013.

The Shaowu Mission – The Salvatorian Sisters in China (1925-1953)

Fr. Julian Bednarz, SDS

Department of Theology
Jordan University College

The Sisters of the Divine Saviour (in Latin, *Sorores Divini Salvatoris* – SorDS) date their foundation to 1888 when the Servant of God Father Francis of the Cross Jordan and Blessed Mary of the Apostles Wüllenweber coordinated their efforts in its establishment. Only two years later, in 1890, they undertook missionary work in the Apostolic Prefecture of Assam in India.[1]

Unfortunately, after the outbreak of the First World War, they had to leave the Assam Mission, because almost all of them were German. When in 1921 the General Chapter of the Salvatorians decided to accept a new mission field in China and gave the newly elected Generalate the mandate to present this decision to the Congregation for the Propagation of the Faith, it was obvious that the Salvatorian Sisters would collaborate in China with the Salvatorian priests and brothers. In July 1921, the General Chapter of the Salvatorian Sisters elected their third Superior General, Mother Liboria Hansknecht[2], who, like Blessed Mary of the Apostles, considered missionary work as one of the priorities for the congregation's apostolate. Subsequently – and despite the lack of staff in many European institutions – in 1925 she sent the first Sisters to Shaowu, China, where the Salvatorian missionaries had already begun their work in 1922.

---

[1] The Congregation received the *Decretum Laudis* in 1911 and the final approval of the Holy See in 1926. The first superior general was Mary of the Apostles Wüllenweber, who served from 1888 to1907 and the second was Ambrosia Vetter, 1908-1921.

[2] She held the office for four terms, from the Third to the Eighth General Chapters, 1921 to 1947.

When one scans the history of the Salvatorian Sisters' missionary activity in China, one notes how events internal and external to the Congregation gave parameters, often confining ones, to the freedom and scope of their apostolate. The mission reached its point of closure when they were forced to leave the country.

The history of the mission, then, may be delineated as follows:

1. **1925-1931**: this was a period of taking responsibility for the mission cultivating a slow process of growth with some interference from numerous occasions of social unrest.
2. **1931-1935:** these four years were a time of exile for the Sisters, when they took up their abode in Fuzhou and there cared for the orphans brought from Shaowu.
3. **1935-1941**: this was a period when missionary activity flourished.
4. **1942-1945**: these were years marked for a second time by a severe limitation of the Salvatorian Sisters' activity. They suffered severe impediments to their apostolate because of a formal declaration of war in December 1941 promulgated by the Chinese national government against Japan and the German Third Reich. Because of the ensuing danger, all the sisters were transferred to the main station in Shaowu. Between December, 1944, and January, 1946, all the sisters of German origin, who worked in Shaowu and Heping, suffered exile to Shanghang, in the territory of the Apostolic Prefecture of Changting [Tingchow].
5. **1946-1948**: this was another period when the missionary effort flourished. Uplifting historical moments were a canonical visit to the mission by the newly elected Superior General, Olympia Heuel;[3] the arrival of a new group of sisters; and the acceptance into the congregation of a number of native Sisters.
6. **May, 1949**: adversity visited the mission when the Chinese Red Army "liberated" Shaowu, and the communist authorities began to gradually reduce the free exercise of missionary activity on the part of the Sisters; in time, the sisters were forbidden to leave the gates of the missionary stations, and finally they were ordered to leave China (1952-1953).

[3] She was elected during the Eighth General Chapter and she governed the Congregation for three terms, from 1947 to1965. She sent some missionary Sisters who were expelled from China to new mission fields in Asia, particularly to Sri Lanka and Taiwan; and to the African nations, Tanzania and the Democratic Republic of the Congo.

1. Difficult Beginnings (1925-1931)

In 1923, the religious superior of the Shaowu Mission, Fr. Heribert Winkler, directed a written request to the Mother General of the Salvatorian Sisters, Sr. Liboria Hansknecht, to send 5 or 6 Sisters to China to engage in missionary activity that involved caring for the orphans, the elderly, and the sick; maintaining the church building; and coordinating the manual labour in the kitchen and the garden. The exchange of correspondence lasted more than two years before the first group of five sisters could at last arrive in Shaowu on August 1, 1925.[4] All the Sisters were German.

The eldest, S. Innocentia Stahl,[5] who had worked as a missionary in Assam (India) was appointed to be the first superior. Two Sisters, Florentia Berners[6] and Adolfina Witmann,[7] completed a one-year nursing course at the Missionary Medical Institute in Würzburg before arriving in China. The other two

[4] See. *Letters* of Fr. H. Winkler of: 3.12.1923; 28.07.1923; 29.07.1924; 26.02.1925 in the General Archives of the Salvatorian Sisters in Rome (AGSorDS). They are available in a file labelled *China.* Unfortunately, Mother General’s responses to those letters are not available.

Two descriptions of a three-month journey from Rome through Genoa, the Suez Canal, the Indian Ocean, Hong Kong, and Fuzhou with Shaowu as the final stopping point are preserved. Sr. Innocentia wrote the first one during the journey (Genoa: 6.05.1925; Port Said: 12.05; Colombo: 25.05; Singapore: 2.06; Hongkong-Foochow: 18.06; Shaowu: 9.08.1925, in AGSorDS, *China* file); Sr. Ferdinanda wrote the second one in Shaowu for *Missionär* (Swiss & German edition), which was published in several episodes (*Unsere Reise nach China. Aus dem Tagebuch einer Salvatorianerinen* in *Missionär* 1926, CH/Juni, 137-140; CH/Juli, 154-155; CH/August, 188-190; CH/September, 214-215; D/November, 260-262; D/December, 276-277).

[5] Her personal chronology: Birth – 14.10.1876 in Lengfeld, Germany; First Profession – 3.11.1903 in Rome; Missionary Activity: Assam, India, from 1912 to 1915 and China, from 1925 to1930. She died in Rome on 19.04.1968 (AGSorDS, personal file B54).

[6] Her personal chronology: Birth – 30.11.1895 in Dreihorn, Germany; First Profession – 22.8.1921 in Berlin; Missionary Activity: China, from 1925 to 1933. She died in Münster on 30.09.1978 (AGSorDS, personal file B4).

[7] Her personal chronology: Birth – 16.01.1892 in Tauberrettersheim, Germany; First Profession – 22.8.1921 in Berlin; Missionary Activity: China, from 1925 to1952. She died in Merano, Italy, on 3.03.1981 (AGSorDS, personal file B62).

Sisters, Ferdinanda Gauss[8] and Concepta Riegel,[9] had experience in the field of domestic work, child-care, and children's catechesis.

The second group of Sisters arrived in 1926 along with five Salvatorians from the men's congregation. The first leg of their journey, from Rome to Fuzhou was uneventful but during the second leg of the same journey, from Fuzhou to Shaowu, the missionaries had a dramatic encounter with robbers, and then contracted cholera.[10] The newly arrived Sisters – Elekta Schlusche,[11] Kiliana Hornung[12] and Viktorina Kraus[13] – were temporary professed religious.

As soon as the first group of Sisters arrived in the Shaowu Mission – as we said above, it was the 1st of August, 1925 – three of

[8] Her personal chronology: Birth – 31.12.1890 in Liebenau-Tettnang, Germany; First Profession – 3.01.1915 in Merano, Italy; Missionary Activity: China from 1925 to 1933 and 1937 to1952. She died in Merano on 17.12.1977 (AGSorDS, personal file B16).

[9] Her personal chronology: Birth – 13.09.1901 in Fronhofen, Germany; First Profession – 13.07.1922 in Merano, Italy; Missionary Activity: China from 1925 to1949. She died in Milwaukee, Wisconsin, U.S.A. on 13.03.1992 (AGSorDS, personal file B47).

[10] The first part of the journey took place from July 28 to September 7; the second leg began on September 22 and ended before November 1. Sr. Electa informed the Superior General about the progress of the journey. The chronology of the journey is as follows: 6.08.1926 – Im rotem Meer; 13.08.1926 – Karachi; 4.09.1926 – Hong Kong; 14.09.1926 – Fuzhou; 23.10.1926 – Yangkeo; 7.11.1926 – Shaowu. During a stopover in Yangkeo, cholera broke out among our missionaries. One missionary, Br. Rigobert. SDS, died; and Fr. Etherlbert and Sr. Kiliana needed a long convalescence. See H. Winkler, "The most trying trip I ever made", in *The Saviour 's Call,* vol. 5, June, 186-187, 189; July, 214-216; August, 248-249; September, 282-283.

[11] Her personal chronology: Birth – 23.09.1884 in Roben (today Równe near Głubczyce, Poland); First Profession – 14.07.1922 in Berlin; Missionary Activity: China, from 1926 to1953. She died in Merano on 11.05.1976 (AGSorDS, personal file B51).

[12] Her personal chronology: Birth – 17.02.1898 in Lengfeld bei Würzburg, Germany; First Profession – 15.07.1924 in Börwang; Missionary Activity: China from 1926 to1952. She died in Montet, Switzerland, on 25.03.1971 (AGSorDS, personal file B25).

[13] Her personal chronology: Birth – 1.09.1900 in Merkendorf bei Bamberg, Germany; First Profession – 15.07.1925 in Börwang; Missionary Activity: China, from 1926 to1949. She died in Milwaukee, Wisconsin, USA on 7.07.1978 (AGSorDS, personal file B31).

them began their apostolic activity. In November, 1926, they were joined by two more. Two Sisters arrived in Guangze in November, 1925, and they were joined by one more in January, 1927.

Fr. Winkler designated the upper floor of the orphanage to be the community quarters for the Sisters working in Shaowu. It was a rather large building, originally constructed by Dominican missionaries and at that time was already inhabited by the orphan girls and some women, Dominican Tertiaries, who were caring for the girls.[14]

The apostolic activities of the five Sisters in Shaowu included: taking care of the children accepted into the orphanage; operating a pharmacy for the poor that also provided such medical services as dressing wounds and giving care to the sick people in their homes; running the kitchen for the missionaries, the orphans and the auxiliary staff; taking care of the church to make sure that everything inside was clean and decorated with flowers; helping out with the liturgies by playing the harmonium during the services and baking hosts for the priests; and maintaining the sacristy, especially by repairing and washing altar linens.

After learning the local dialect the Sisters began a program of catechesis for the girls at the school, as well as for the women and girls in their homes in Shaowu and at times in the neighbouring villages as long as bands of robbers were not posing a threat.

There are only fragmentary reports from the first five years of the Sisters’ missionary work because the mission in Shaowu was not yet autonomous. Hence all official reports that concerned the mission were sent to Fuzhou.

Before the Sisters’ arrival of the Sisters, the mission took care of about 30 orphans of which the youngest were babies who were being nursed. Those babies were entrusted to wet-nurses who lived outside the orphanage for an agreed fee, while the older children stayed in the orphanage.

---

[14] According to a description written by one of the Sisters in December, 1926, the ground floor of the building had three large rooms, which served as bedrooms for orphans; a playroom; a study room; a dining room; and several smaller rooms that served as closets and pantries for food and such materials as clothing, textiles and toys. The entire top floor was reserved to the Sisters for their exclusive use. See: *Unseren Waisenhaus*, in AGSorDS, file: *China I.*

After the Sisters' arrival, the total number of the children living in the orphanage at any given moment was slowly increasing even when one takes into account the fact that the children suffered many fatalities. Many of the newcomers, mostly girls, placed before sunrise at the gate of the main mission station by persons preferring to be anonymous: instead of abandoning the children the mothers evidently were leaving them for the Sisters. Some of them were seriously ill and, despite strenuous efforts, no one could save them. Emergency medical care for these children also included the sacrament of baptism. Those who died were properly buried in the churchyard.[15]

There are no reports from the years 1925-1930 regarding the ministry to the sick. The Sisters were supported in this work by the older girls from the orphanage or by women employed by the mission, who served as interpreters and accompanied the Sisters on their visits to the home-bound. [16]

Sister Elekta S. was responsible for the sacristy and the church in Shaowu, and being a certified seamstress, she took care of the upkeep of the vestments. Baking and preparing the hosts for all the missionary stations was on her list of responsibilities. She cultivated the flowers that would eventually decorate the altars; when necessary, she plucked them in the meadows that lay outside of town. It was her job to maintain the clothes of the orphans and the missionaries in Shaowu.[17]

---

[15] In 1925, in the orphanage at Shaowu there were 13 orphans. In 1927, their number increased to 37. Meanwhile the newly opened orphanage in Guangze accepted 12 orphans in the same year. In 1930 Sisters already took care of 125 orphans, 121 girls and 4 boys. See: "China", *Salvatorianerinnen-Chronik,* 1/6 (Dec 1926) 122; *Statistik für 1921/2-1927* (Salvatorian General Archives in Rome [AGS], M-2, Coll. 7: 23.2); H. Winkler, *Prospectus Status Missionis* for the year 1930-1931, in Archivio Generale della SC de Propaganda Fide, vol. 1022 (years: 1929-1931), rub. 32/6, p. 149.

[16] (Sorores) "infirmos in privatis domibus visitant, sed semper duae exeunte, aut una Soror cum muliere sinica, ita ut de vitandis periculis cautum sit." See: H. Winkler, *Prima relatio missionis indenpendentis de Shaowu* (1930), in Archivio (...) de Propaganda Fide, vol. 1022, rub. 32/6, p. 129.

[17] Fr. C. Lohmann, a missionary in China from 1940 to 1952, wrote a beautiful memoir. See: C. Lohmann, "Eine Missionsschwester", *Heiland der Welt*, 1977/1, 14-18.

The second house in the Shaowu Mission was established at Guangze in November 1925, when the first two Sisters moved in to the house built by Fr. S. Spirig.[18] In January, 1927, one more Sister joined. The first superior of the small community was Sister Ferdynanda Gauss, who served in that capacity for five years. As in Shaowu so also here, the Sisters immediately took charge of the chapel, located on the ground floor of the school building, cared for the sick, and opened a second orphanage. A year later, after a sufficient mastery of the local dialect, S. Ferdinanda began a systematic catechesis of the women and the girls of the village.

The Sisters' missionary labours were hampered by marauding bandits robbing inhabitants of villages and small towns, and sometimes even threatening big cities like Shaowu and Guangze. At the turn of 1926/7 the missionary work suffered disruption by the entrance into the Shaowu Mission of the national army troops from Guangzhou [Canton]. The work of the Sisters in Guangze suffered when soldiers took up lodging in the school building, in the house of the missionaries, and even in the house of the Sisters.[19]

The climate of Shaowu and Guangze proved to be another interference with the Sisters' regular work since these towns were a breeding ground for malaria. Four of the eight Sisters were frequently coming down with sickness; they suffered from malaria at least a few times a year. Other diseases, such as pneumonia and typhoid, complicated their return to full strength.

Sister Innocentia Stahl got seriously ill in 1929 with malaria and typhoid. After a few weeks of treatment in Shaowu she was transported to a hospital in Fuzhou, but her hopes for improvement turned out to be futile. In January, 1930, the doctor recommended a change of climate so that she could fully recover. To this end, Sister Innocentia left in February, 1930, for Rome.[20]

---

[18] In the first letter from Guangze to Mother General, Sr. Ferdinanda wrote that the Sisters' house had four rooms on the first floor for their exclusive use, while on the ground floor there was a room for the Sister who was in charge of the sick, a kitchen and a storage room. See: *Letter of Sr. Ferdynanda G.* from 18.11.1925, in AGSorDS, *China I.*

[19] See: "Aus Kwangtseh", *Salvatorianerinnen-Chronik*, 1/6 (Dec 1926), 129; *Letter of Sr. Ferdynanda G.* (Guangze) of 12.12.1926 and *Letter of Sr. Innocentia* (Shaowu) of 20.12.1926, in AGSorDS, *China I.*

[20] See *Letter of Sr. Innocentia to Mother General* of 16.01.1930 (AGSorDS, *China I*); H. Winkler, *Letter to Mother General* of 18.01.1930

Sister Elekta Schlusche was elected the new Superior of the Salvatorian Sisters working in China, and Sr. Adolfina Witmann and Sr. Ferdinanda Gauss were appointed her councillors.[21] In the meantime written data from 1930 show that the missionary work was making progress that year despite the fact that the Sisters from the Guangze station had to leave their mission for short periods of time in January, August and December and flee to Shaowu due to the threat of invading robbers. Despite these interruptions, 35 new orphans were admitted that year in Guangze; on 1,733 occasions, medicines were dispensed; and 253 patients received treatment for their wounds and/or other medical needs. The Shaowu Mission reported similar data for their apostolate.[22]

2. In Exile at Fuzhou (1931-1935)

At the beginning of 1931, there were rumours circulating that the Chinese Red Army troops intend to enter the border areas of Fujian province. The mission of Shaowu shared a frontier in the west with the Jiangxi province, where there was a struggle between the National and the Communist troops. And indeed, at the end of May, the first Communist troops took Jiannig, so Father Melchior Geser, SDS, who worked there had no other choice but to escape to Shaowu. When the news of what was happening reached Shaowu, the superior of the mission, Father Heribert Winkler, ordered all Salvatorian missionaries – priests, Brothers and Sisters – to gather in Shaowu, so that together they could leave for Fuzhou.

The Sisters placed the youngest children from the orphanage with some trustworthy families, and decided to take the older girls along. Two boats were hired, one for the Sisters and the girls, and one for the male missionaries. A group of 28 people (7 Sisters, 4 priests and 2 Brothers, 14 girls and 1 catechist) left the mission in the evening on Saturday, June 6, going to the marina on the River Min.

(AGSorDS, *China I*). It is worth noting that one of the missionary priests, Fr. S. Spirig, also suffered from frequent relapses of malaria to such an extent that it ruined his health. He died in November, 1930, during a series of relapses of the disease. See *Letter from Fr. H. Winkler to Fr. P. Pfeiffer* of 24.11.1930, (AGS, “China,” coll. 6: 11.11).

[21] Cf. *Salvatorinerinnen-Chronik,* 2/3 (Nov 1931) 93.

[22] See *Letter of Sr. Viktorina to Mother General* of 31.10.1930 (AGSorDS, *China I*), as well as *Salvatorinerinnen-Chronik*, 2/3 (Nov 1931) 93.

Unfortunately the National Army soldiers stationed in town turned them back and gave them orders to remain in place so as not to cause panic among the people. On Sunday night a large band of robbers posing as Communists – they wore red armbands on the left upper arm – entered the town. As soon as the first sounds of battle were heard, the whole Salvatorian group came to the harbour, but they could not leave because the robbers gave orders to all the boat owners not to leave the harbour in Shaowu without a special permission from their leaders.

After sunrise the whole Salvatorian group was arrested. The Sisters and the girls remained in their boat, and the male missionaries were taken into custody in the city. After three days of negotiations the robbers agreed to release all after the payment of a ransom. In the meantime, a group of robbers tried – without success – to kidnap the girls from the boat but they escaped by going farther away from the shore.

Finally, equipped with the permit delivered by the leader of the robbers, the Salvatorian group left for Fuzhou. After a few hours of travel on the water, they proceeded on foot toward Jianyang [Kienyang] – towards an American Dominican mission station. After four days of an exhausting march they safely arrived there.

They rested a couple of days and, with the hired boats, reached Fuzhou on June 27th. The Dominican Sisters offered hospitality to the Salvatorian Sisters and the girls, and the male missionaries found shelter in the house of the Apostolic Vicar, Bishop Francisco Aguirre, O.P.[23]

The news coming from the mission area of Shaowu indicated that going back would not be possible in the foreseeable future. Not wanting to abuse the hospitality of the Dominican Sisters, Fr. Winkler rented two buildings from the English consulate, located in Fuzhou-Mamoi: one larger one for the Sisters and the girls, and

[23] The history of these three dramatic weeks is fairly well documented. One report, written by Sister Elekta, is preserved in original German and in an English translation (in German, it is to be found in the *Salvatorianerinnen-Chronik* of November, 1931 [2/3], 93-99; in English, *Letter of Sister Elekta S. to the Mother General* of 28.06.1931 [AGSorDS, *China I*], 1-10); a second report was written by Fr. H. Winkler (see *Letter of Fr. H. Winkler to P. Pfeiffer* of 15.06.1931 [AGS, M-2, coll. 6: 11.11], 1-6). It was published in *Missionär*, D/9/1931, 282-285.

one smaller one for the priests and the Brothers. They moved into the new place on August 24, 1931. The Sisters were engaged in further study of the Chinese language and the education of the girls. Two of them expressed a desire to join the Congregation of the Salvatorian Sisters.[24]

At the beginning of 1932, another group of orphans was brought in from Shaowu to Fuzhou. In the autumn of the same year, 17 adult Catholics fleeing the communist forces came to Fuzhou and took refuge in the Salvatorian procurator's quarters.[25] In March 1933, Fr. Winkler bought a plot of land in Fuzhou-Nantai with two houses on it, which, after slight adjustments, could accommodate all the missionary Sisters, Brothers and priests together with the orphans.

Unfortunately, less than two weeks after the move – on the 28th of June – the house inhabited by the Sisters and the girls burned down. Luckily, no one was hurt, although the inhabitants lost all of their personal belongings. All of them had to return to Fuzhou-Mamoi and wait for the house to be rebuilt. They moved back on February 13, 1934.[26]

In 1933 two Sisters travelled back to Europe: Sister Ferdinanda Gauss, who took part in the General Chapter and then worked in her home province in Germany; and Sister Florentia Berners who was retired from the mission.[27]

The Sisters staying in Fuzhou-Nantai took care of the growing number of orphans; they began accepting orphans from the Fuzhou area. They served the sick Catholics who took refuge in Fuzhou from the mission territory of Shaowu.[28] The reports for 1933 and

---

[24] See: *Letter of Sister Elekta S. to Mother General of 23.09.1931 (AGSorDS, China I), Salvatorianerinnen-Chronik*, 2/4 (Apr 1932) 117.

[25] The second group consisted of 20 orphans. See *Letter of H. Winkler to P. Pfeiffer* from 31.01.1932 (AGSorDS, *China I*); *Jahresbericht 1932* (SorDS) in AGSorDS, *China I*), 1-5.

[26] A description of this dramatic event is well documented in letters and official reports. See *Letter of H. Winkler to P. Pfeiffer* of 30.06.1933 (AGS, M-2, coll. 6: 11.11); *Letter of Sister Elekta S. to Mother General* of 01.07.1933 (AGSorDS, *China I*).

[27] See: *Berichcht über 1933* (AGSorDS, *China I*), 3-4.

[28] See: *Letter from Sister Adolfina W. to Mother General* of 13.04.1934 (AGSorDS, *China I*): "Hier können wir in Foochow auch etwas ambulante

1934 indicate that there were 85 girls and 7 boys. Of these, 10 girls and 7 boys were sent to a teacher’s school in Shanghai.[29]

3. Return to Shaowu and Further Growth (1935-1941)

In the second half of 1934, the Shaowu territory experienced the return of peace. The Chinese Red Army left southern China, and the National Army troops fought the marauding gangs of robbers with more success. Some Christians began to return to Shaowu already in late autumn. In December 1934, Fr. Winkler and three other missionaries returned back to Shaowu by the long route through Shanghai to prepare the return of their companions, that is to say, the remaining Brothers, priests, Sisters and orphans.

It took a few months to repair the badly damaged mission buildings. The Sisters and the girls returned in two groups: the first group consisting of 2 Sisters and the 7 oldest girls arrived in Shaowu on March 19, 1935;[30] and the second group made up of 3 Sisters and 7 orphans returned on June 8, 1935.[31] Immediately, 3 of the Sisters resumed work in Shaowu and 2 Sisters put into motion once again their apostolic activity in Guangze, where they took care of orphans and doing the charitable work among the sick.

The children who had been put in the care of the Christian families in 1931, returned to the orphanages in Shaowu and Guangze. The number of applicants asking for medications or seeking medical assistance rose considerably. After a period of Communist rule many people wanted to start Baptism preparation classes. This is the reason why, after returning from the exile, the Sisters considered the catechesis of women and girls, particularly

---

Krankenpflege bei unseren Christen ausüben, es sind doch ziemlich viele Flüchtlinge von unserem Gebiet hier." (*Here in Fuzhou we can also take care of some patients visiting them, because here are quite a lot of refugees from our area.*)

[29] *Prospectus status missionis 1932-1933* (AGS, M-2, Coll. 7: 18.13); *Jahresbericht für 1933-1934* (AGS, M-2, coll. 6: 11.21 & Coll. 7: 18.13).

[30] See *Letter of Sister Elekta Schlusche and Sister Concepta Riegel to Mother General of 23.03.1935* (AGSorDS, China I).

[31] See *Letter of Sister Adolfina W. to Mother General of 25.08.1935* (AGSorDS, China I).

the Baptism and the first Communion preparations, to be their most important apostolate.[32]

The number of Sisters, which had diminished at first, started to slowly increase. The repeated pleas of the Superior of the Sisters, Elekta Slusche, and the Superior of the Mission, Fr. Winkler, as well as his successor, Fr. I. König, received replies. During the years 1937 and 1938, the Mother General of the Salvatorian Sisters, Sr. Liboria, gave permission to Sr. Ferdinanda Gauss to return to the mission and sent with her five new Sisters. And so, two missionary Sisters, Sr. Dagoberta Burchert[33] and Sr. Ferdinanda arrived in Shaowu in February, 1937, along with three Salvatorian priests and Brothers. The long-awaited Sr. Norbertina Lutzenberger, a trained dentist, arrived in September.[34] In December 1938, the last three Sisters arrived in Shaowu, Gilberta Lang,[35] Dora Schupp[36] and Andrea Ness.[37]

---

[32] See *Letter of Sister Adolfina Witmann to Mother General* of 25.08.1935 (AGSorDS, *China I*). "... uns Schwestern obliegt nun die Aufgabe, die Frauen und Mädchen in der hl. Religion zu unterrichten oder wenigstens darauf zu achten, dass die Katechistinnen ihre Pflicht erfüllen.“ (*Upon us, Sisters, reposes the task of teaching women and girls in holy Religion, or at least keeping vigilant so that the catechists meet their obligations*).

[33] Her personal chronology: Birth – 4.12.1904 in Wognyt, East Prussia, Germany; First Profession – 6.01.1926 in Berlin; Missionary Activity: China, from 1937 to1949. She died in Shaowu on 30.08.1943 (AGSorDS, personal file B7).

[34] Her personal chronology: Birth – 30.01.1900 in Mittelstetten, Germany; First Profession –15.07.1928 in Börwang, Germany; Missionary Activity: China, from 1937 to1949. She died in Milwaukee, Wisconsin, USA, on 2.05.1977 (AGSorDS, personal file B35).

[35] Her personal chronology: Birth – 20.01.1899 in Höchstadt an der Aisch, Germany; First Profession – 6.01.1927 in Merano, Italy; Missionary Activity: China, from 1938 to1949. She died in Passau on 23.03.1983 (AGSorDS, personal file B34).

[36] Her personal chronology: Birth – 8.04.1905 in Niederhofen, Germany; First Profession – 6.01.1927 in Merano, Italy; Missionary Activity: China, from 1938 to1952. She died in Rome on 12.12.1995 (AGSorDS, personal file B52A).

[37] Her personal chronology: Birth – 24.04.1897 in Basel, Switzerland; First Profession – 19.03.1938 in Rome; Missionary Activity: China, from1938 to1947. She died in Merano on 5.01.1984 (AGSorDS, personal file B40).

The missionaries came with ability and experience: Sr. Gilberta was a seamstress with many years of experience at the Salvatorian Educational Home in Lochau. Sr. Dora was a nurse with many years of practice at the hospital in Budapest. Sr. Andrea was a nurse and a children's tutor. The new Sisters studied the local language using handbooks for grammar; and a Chinese postulant who spoke German fairly well, and later received the religious name Josephine, taught them pronunciation.[38]

A larger number of Sisters, eleven, made the existing plans to establish Salvatorian Sisters' Communities at the major stations in Heping and Jianning, possible.[39] In February, 1939, the third mission in Heping was founded. At that time Heping was a large village with a market square, 8 hours by foot from Shaowu. It was established by the Salvatiorian Fathers in 1928 and Fr. K. Bühler was its long-time missionary priest.

The missionary Sisters Concepta and Dora were the first to arrive in Heping, and lived in the little house built for them inside the mission compound. Sister Concepta's main task was to accompany the local catechist on her travels throughout the surrounding villages. In addition, she was taking care of the orphans and the elderly in Heping. Sr. Dora cared for the sick by visiting them in their homes; she also decorated the mission church with flowers. It is worth noting that the Sisters had to communicate in the local dialect, which did not resemble very much the language used in Shaowu.[40] Sr. Ferdinand joined the small community in April, 1941. Sister Concepta became the local superior in 1939.

The fourth Salvatorian mission was founded in Jianning in 1941. Two missionaries, Sr. Dora and Sr. Gilberta arrived there at

---

[38] Josephine Tsang was born 12.10.1915 in China. Her First Profession was in Shaowu on 19.03.1944. She engaged in missionary activity in Shaowu from 1938 to1948. She died in Shaowu on 17.02.1948 (AGSorDS, personal file B58).

[39] Already the first superior of Shaowu Mission, Fr. H. Winkler, planned to send Sisters to Jianning [Kienning] in 1930. See *Letter of H. Winkler to Mother General* of 19.06.1928 (AGSorDS, *China I*).

[40] See *Letter of Sister Concepta R. to Mother General* of 5.03.1939 (AGSorDS, *China II*); see also *Kurzbericht über die Chinamission*, 10-11 (written by Sister Dora in 1984).

the beginning of November. The Sisters' apostolate was the work among the sick, as well as the catechesis of women and girls.[41]

During this period, 1935-1941, the following superiors for the missionary Sisters coordinated the Salvatorian Sisters' apostolate in China: Sister Elekta from 1930 to 1937, Sister Ferdinanda from 1937 to 1940, and Sister Norbertina, from 1940 to1949.

According to the report of the Apostolic Prefect, Fr. I. König, dated September, 1941, eleven Sisters took charge of the following ministries:

1. in Shaowu, one Sister supervised the orphanage and gave catechesis to the girls and the women;
2. in Shaowu, one Sister managed the pharmacy and served in the missionary hospital that had space for 52 beds;
3. in Shaowu, two Sisters visited the sick in their homes;
4. in Shaowu, one Sister ran the kitchen for the staff of the station;
5. in Guangze, one Sister supervised the orphanage;
6. in Guangze, one Sister operated a pharmacy and visited the sick in their homes;
7. in Guangze, one Sister ran the kitchen for the staff of the station;
8. in Heping, one Sister operated a pharmacy;
9. in Heping, one Sister visited patients in their homes;
10. in Heping, one Sister supervised the kitchen for the staff of the station.[42]

The war, which raged between Japan and China since 1937, never came near the mission territory of Shaowu. Nevertheless the

[41] Information about this foundation is scarce due to the war. The exchange of correspondence between the mission in China and the superior general in Rome almost ceased - for example, not even one letter survived from the year 1942. See short notes in: "Schwestern-Chronik, Shaowu-China 1941-1946" (AGSorDS, *China II*), 1; *Letters of Norbertyna L. to Mother General* of 25.02.1941 and 19.03.1941 (AGSorDS, *China II*).

[42] *Letter of Fr. I. König to Fr. P. Pfeiffer* of 18.09.1941. In an official report to the Congregation for the Propagation of the Faith, Fr. König said that 153 children were finding a home in three orphanages; drugs were dispensed 50,005 times (after consultation) in 9 mission pharmacies; and 61 people were looked after in 6 homes for the elderly (see *Prospectus status missionis 1941*, in AGS, M-2, coll. 6: 11.21). In mission stations that did not yet have Sisters, priests and Brothers were involved in distributing drugs.

increasing numbers of refugees from Fuzhou and the neighbouring province of Jiangxi, and the ever-increasing food prices, were a constant reminder that the war was going on. In July, 1939, the Japanese bombers appeared several times over Shaowu, but departed without dropping bombs.

Despite this collage of events, Fr. Inigo König ordered the evacuation of the orphanage to a village, Jiang-kia-fang near Shaowu, and the school children were sent on forced vacations.[43] After the outbreak of war in Europe, the correspondence with Europe and America became increasingly difficult, and rare.

4. Forced Exile of the German Sisters (1942-1945)

In December 1941, the Sino-Japanese war became a world war, when Japanese aircraft bombed the American naval base in Honolulu, Hawaii. On the 9th of December, the Chinese National government issued a declaration of war against Germany since Germany was an ally of Japan.[44] After this declaration, the missionary Sisters, Brothers and priests of German origin found themselves in hostile territory.

In February 1942, the missionaries, both male and female, in Guangze learned that the local government was planning to expel them. The Superior of the Sisters, Sr. Norbertina, personally travelled from Shaowu to Guangze – administratively attached at that time to Jiangxi province – to petition for permission to continue the work of the missionaries at this station. In April, the missionaries, both male and female, from other stations were ordered to gather in Shaowu. The Sisters of Jianning and Heping arrived at Shaowu in early May. Two weeks later the good news came that the Sisters had received permission to remain in Guangze and work there; and those gathered in Shaowu could return to their posts.[45] For the next two years, the Sisters could peacefully continue their missionary labour.

---

[43] *Letter from Fr. I. König to Fr. P. Pfeiffer* of 08.12.08.1939 (AGS, M-2, coll. 7: 18.1). Two Sisters, two women and two male missionaries took care of evacuated orphans.

[44] See *Letter of I. König to the Confreres*, 1.02.1942, AGS, M-2, coll. 1.

[45] See *Schwestern-Chronik, Shaowu-China 1941-1946*, p. 2 (AGSorDS, *China II*). Missionaries from other stations except Guangze had to stay in

In the years 1942 and 1943 a large number of wounded Chinese soldiers were evacuated to Shaowu, since the front of the Sino-Japanese War ran through the neighbouring province of Jiangxi. From the province of Chekiang, which was almost entirely occupied by the Japanese forces, came many refugees. The wounded soldiers were lodged in large halls in some very primitive conditions; some patients were brought into the missionary hospital.

The visiting missionaries, both male and female, baptized many and stood by the side of the dying.

The Sisters' work became very difficult once cholera broke out. The disease started to show itself in 1941, but it developed into an epidemic in the years 1942-43, taking a huge toll among the soldiers, refugees, and the local civilians. The local authorities allocated a large, pagan temple outside the city walls as a makeshift hospital for the sick. Sister Dagoberta cared for the sick with a special dedication visiting them in their homes or in the makeshift hospital. Through her ministry, many of them received Baptism before they died. Unfortunately, Sister Dagoberta herself contracted the infection in August, 1943, and died after just 5 days of illness.[46]

In 1944, the first two Chinese women made religious profession, Teresa Pao[47] and Josephine Tsang.[48] Not only was the community increasing in size and strength, but there was a steadily

---

Shaowu to the beginning of August, 1942 (see *Letter of Fr. C. Lohmann to G. Hegele SDS* of 20.05.1946 [SDS Archiv/Munich]). Sisters working in Jianning did not return there, but remained in Shaowu (see *Neuigkeiten aus der Mission*, 18.12.1942, SDS Archive/Munich).

[46] Sister Dagoberta died on 30.08.1943. All the missionaries, both male and female, and a great number of people attended her funeral. See: *Schwestern-Chronik, Shaowu-China 1941-1946* (AGSor., *China II*); "Kurzbericht über Chinamission", (AGSorDS, *China II*), 15.

[47] Her personal chronology: Birth – 11.02.1913 in Shanghai, China; First Profession – 19.03.1944 in Shaowu; Missionary Activity: China, from 1944 to1949; Taiwan, from 1962 to 1995. She died in Ilan-City, Taiwan, on 12.11.1995 (AGSorDS, personal file B43).

[48] Her personal chronology: Birth – 12.10.1915 in China; First Profession – 19.03.1944 in Shaowu; Missionary Activity: China, from 1944 to1948. She died in Shaowu on 17.02.1948 (AGSorDS, personal file B58).

growing group of local "Little Salvatorian Sisters" that supported the work of the congregation."[49]

Despite the many difficulties caused by the ongoing war, therefore, the apostolate was thriving. On the 14th of October in 1944, however, the mission suffered a sudden disruption when the order was given to withdraw all the missionaries – not only the Sisters, but also Brothers and priests – from the sub-prefecture of Shaowu if they were carrying German passports. All missionaries who at that time were working in Shaowu, Heping and Taining were affected by the order.

They were to leave on October 18 for Shanghang, about 550 km away from Shaowu, to the apostolic prefecture Tingchow, which was served by the German Dominicans. An immediate intervention of the Apostolic Prefect, Inigo König, resulted only in postponing the departure from Shaowu until December 17, 1944. Five Sisters left Shaowu, Sr. Dora, Sr. Gilberta, Sr. Elekta, Sr. Concepta and Sr. Ferdinanda. Accompanying them were twelve priests, two Brothers and two seminarians.

After a wearisome journey by bus, they reached their destination on December 24th.[50] Meanwhile four Sisters continued the missionary work at Shaowu, Sr. Norbertina, who was possessing a U.S. passport; Sr. Andrea, a Swiss passport-bearer; and Sr. Josephine and Sr. Teresa, both Chinese women. The sisters who worked in Guangze, Sr. Adolfina, Sr. Kiliana, and Sr. Viktorina, were not requested to leave their mission, so they continued their work peacefully.

---

[49] It was founded 8.12.1936 by Fr. König as an association of diocesan right on the model of similar institutions existing in other apostolate vicariates in China. After completion of a one-year novitiate, candidates would make promises for one year and then renew them every year after that. By their apostolic ministry and example of Christian life, they were supposed to help in the work of conversion. After a few years, if they wanted to, they could ask to join the Congregation of the Salvatorian Sisters. From 1936 to 1945, the association welcomed 20 girls, two of whom in 1944 made their First Profession as Salvatorian Sisters (I. König SDS, *Begleit-Schreiben zu Konstitutionen der Kleinen Schwestern*, 1945, 1-2).

[50] See "Schwestern-Chronik, Shaowu-China 1941-1946" (AGSor., *China II*). For a missionary's colourful description of the journey, see "Verbannung von Shaowu nach Shanghang", 1-7 (AGS, M-2, coll. 2).

Meanwhile in Shanghang, Sister Dora took a job at the hospital on December 26th, and three months later in the hospital pharmacy. The other Sisters helped a group of German Dominican missionary Sisters in their domestic tasks. All the Salvatorian missionaries, both male and female, returned to Shaowu on January 5, 1946.[51]

The official report for the years 1942-1945 provides fascinating data regarding the works of charity that occupied the Salvatorian Sisters and their collaborators, the native "Little Sisters". What they accomplished seems astonishing considering their small number.[52]

5. A New Period of Development (1946-1948)

During the period that extended from 1946 to 1948, the Salvatorian Sisters worked at three mission stations, Shaowu where five Sisters managed the apostolate; Guangze served by three Sisters; and Heping where two Sisters were stationed.[53] The Apostolic Prefect, Fr. Inigo Konig, wrote a letter to the Mother Superior General and informed her of the Sisters' achievements during the year 1946, the first year after their return from exile in Shanghang.

According to this report, the Sisters cared for 60 orphans in two orphanages, provided treatment for 350 patients in the small mission hospital, and made 6300 home visits to the sick. In their

---

[51] See "Schwestern-Chronik, Shaowu-China 1941-1946" (AGSor., *China II*). To read an unusually detailed description of the return journey, see "Reise von Shanghang nach Shaowu," 1-6 (AGS, M-2, coll. 2).

[52] The Sisters cared for 112 orphans in 1942, 80 in 1943, 65 in 1944, and 51 in 1945. In nursing homes they cared for 45 elderly people in 1942, 24 in 1943, 20 in 1944, and 15 in 1945. The Sisters visited the sick in their houses 9467 times in 1942, 9812 times in1943, 8026 times in 1944, and 6348 times in 1945. They administered injections to patients who were ill 6613 times in 1942, 20191 times in1943, 21191 times in 1944, and 6313 times in 1945. Always making sure that they were following proper medical protocol, they distributed medications 85592 times in 1942, 92677 times in1943, 89483 times in 1944, and 88199 times in 1945. All these data are to be found in "Statistik für 1941-1945" (AGS, M-2, coll. 6:11.11).

[53] One notes that in the official report on the state of the Salvatorian Sisters prepared for the participants of the General Chapter in 1947, it is written that the mission station in Jianning was dissolved in 1946 "Generalkapitel", *Salvatorianerinnen-Chronik*, 5/1, 3.

six pharmacy centres for the poor, they examined 400 patients and administered medication 95,000 times. They gave 11,000 injections, and dressed 11,000 wounds. The dentist-Sister extracted 600 decayed teeth. The Sisters expanded their apostolate to include care for twenty elderly people in four homes.

The Sisters were in charge of the upkeep of the missionary priests and Brothers' households in three mission stations. They canned and pickled food for other stations, sewed clothes, washed the altar linens and baked the hosts.

It is no wonder that Fr. Inigo König asked for more missionary Sisters.[54] From the more detailed report of the Sister Superior, we find out that, in addition to the above mentioned apostolic responsibilities, the Sisters in Shaowu, who included eleven professed, two novices and two postulants, prepared 28 people for Baptism by a catechesis that continued for 147 hours spaced during a period of months; and a second group that consisted of 48 people engaged in a catechetical programme that extended during a period of months for a total of 192 hours of catechesis in preparation for Confession and First Communion.

The Sisters made 651 home visits to the Christian families to support them in their faith, and 488 home visits to non-Christian families in order to teach them the truths of the faith. They made 304 home visits to the sick and dying in 99 of the surrounding villages so that they might pray with those who suffered. According to the records of the year 1946/7, the Sisters produced 25 chasubles and baked 40,000 hosts for the seven stations.[55] Similar figures appear in the report for the years 1947 and 1948.[56]

Meanwhile, Sister Andrea, who worked in Shaowu, departed in March, 1947, for Rome for the General Chapter of the Salvatorian Sisters, during which Sister Olympia Heuel was elected the new

[54] See: *Letter of I. König to Mother Superior General* of March 1947 (AGSorDS, *China I*).

[55] See "Mission in China", *Salvatorianerinnen-Chronik*, 4/2 (May 1947) 16.

[56] See "Mission in China", *Salvatorianerinnen-Chronik*, 5/4 (1948) 13-15; "Jahresbericht 1948" (SorDS-Shaowu) (AGSorDS, *China II*); "Jahresbericht 1948" (SorDS-Kwangtseh) (AGSorDS, *China II*).

Superior General.[57] Sister Olympia came the same year to Guangze and Shaowu for a canonical visitation (November 3-25).[58] After dialogues with the Sisters, the apostolic prefect and the Fathers and the Brothers, she decided that the Sisters should pay more attention to the apostolate among women and girls. The manual work at the missionary stations, until then performed by the Sisters, should be handed over to hired workers who would labour under the Sisters' supervision.

Plans were made to build a central orphanage, a middle school for girls, and a modern hospital. The principles of the cooperation between the Sisters and the Fathers and the Brothers, and between the Sisters and the Apostolic Prefecture of Shaowu, were extensively discussed.[59]

Since 1943, the house for the novices had been located in Shaowu, in the new part of the upper floor of the orphanage, which was owned by the Apostolic Prefecture of Shaowu. Mother General, however, planned to open a novitiate for the local candidates in an entirely new place that was owned by the Congregation.

Mother Olympia did not like the current name of the association of the local Sisters: "Little Salvatorian Sisters of the Divine Saviour". She believed the name might suggest there were two different Salvatorian congregations.[60]

---

[57] She came to the chapter as delegate of the American Province of Salvatorian Sisters. She exercised her office for three consecutive terms from 1947 to 1965.

[58] Mother Olympia wrote a circular letter on 2.01.1948 with a detailed description of her trip to China (AGSorDS, *China I*). She came to Shanghai by plane from Rome on October 29th and after staying in Guangze and Shaowu went to Fuzhou and Beijing. She returned by way of the United States on December 20th.

[59] The demands/requests of both parties and the consequent decisions taken reflect the *Missionary Statutes of the Salvatorian Sisters working in China*. (See "Antrag der Missionsleitung an M. Olympia" (AGSor., *China II*); *Statuten der Schwestern vom Göttlichen Heiland in der Mission* (AGSorDS, *China II*). "Bericht über Visitationsreise M. Olympia" (AGSorDS, *China II*).

[60] In response to the criticism concerning the name by which the indigenous Sisters association was known at that time, Fr. König changed the name to "Congregation of the Sisters of the Mother of the Saviour (*Congregatio Sorores Mater Salvatoris* – CMS); he rewrote its statutes and

During her November visit a decision was made to close the mission station in Heping.[61]

In 1948, the number of Sisters increased by five. In March, two local Sisters, Sr. Liborina Kao[62] and Sr. Malia Kao, made their professions.[63] In October three sisters of the American Province came to Shaowu: Sr. Verena Juergensmeier, a teacher with a graduate degree, who was nominated a consultor to the Superior of the mission in China;[64] Sr. Justa Hoffrichter, nominated for the office of the Treasurer;[65] and Sr. Maria Joseph Schmidt, a registered nurse .[66] The newcomers went that same month to a language school in Beijing to study Mandarin for a period of one year. After only a month of schooling, however, they had to make their escape with their teacher to Shanghai fleeing before the advancing Communist armies. There they spent another month; but, not seeing a possibility of a rapid cessation of hostilities in the

asked the Congregation for Religious in Rome for their approval. He received a positive response by telegraph in 1951 (see "Kleine Schwestern" [CMS], AGS, M -2, coll. 2).

[61] Fr. König wrote in a letter on the occasion of the 25th anniversary of the Salvatorian Sisters Mission in China that the mission stations in Heping and Jianning were closed due to a lack of staff and poor housing conditions. (See: *Zirkular von I. König* – 26.07.50 [*25 Jahre SorDS in China*], AGSorDS, *China II*), 3.

[62] Her personal chronology: Birth - 15.05.1918 in Lichuan, Jiangxi Province, China; First Profession – 19.03.1948 in Shaowu; Missionary Activity: China from 1948 to 1949; Taiwan from 1965 to 1994. She died in Taiwan in Ilan-City on 3.04.1994 (AGSorDS, personal file B27).

[63] Her personal chronology: Birth – 7.11.1919 in Guangze [Kwangtseh], China; First Profession – 19.03.1948 in Shaowu; Missionary Activity: China from 1948 to1949; Taiwan, from 1962 to 1996. Currently she lives in Milwaukee, Wisconsin, USA province.

[64] Her personal chronology: Birth – 13.11.1900 in Hövelhof near Paderborn, Germany; First Profession – 10.08.1921 in Milwaukee; Missionary Activity: China, from 1948 to1949. She died in Rome on 20.12.1985 (AGSorDS, personal file B26A).

[65] Her personal chronology: Birth – 14.03.1906 in Elsendorf, Germany; First Profession – 24.09.1926 in Milwaukee; Missionary Activity: China from1948 to1949. She died in Berlin on 11.10.1995 (AGSorDS, personal file B24A).

[66] Her personal chronology: Birth – 20.09.1920 in Milwaukee, Wisconsin, USA; First Profession – 8/13/1944 in Milwaukee; Missionary Activity: China, from 1948 to1949. Currently she lives in Milwaukee, USA province.

civil war then raging in northern China, they returned to Shaowu at the end of December, 1948, along with their teacher – keeping firmly within their hearts the intention of continuing their study of the Chinese language.[67]

6. The Gradual, Forced Reduction in Activity and Eventual Expulsion (1949-1953)

In January 1949 it became clear to all the missionaries – Sisters, Brothers and Fathers – that the territory of the Apostolic Prefecture in Shaowu may soon succumb to the Chinese Red Army. They began to wonder where to evacuate the indigenous vocations that at that time were consisting of the professed Sisters, the Sister novices and candidates, the seminarians and the novices for the priests and Brothers. In January, Sister Verena received a letter from the Superior General, Mother Olympia, in which she proposed that the Sisters from the U.S. return to their homeland and bring with them Sister Teresa and the Chinese candidates.

Indeed, this group left on February 3 via Fuzhou and Hong Kong for the United States. A few days later the Apostolic Prefect, Fr. I. König, and the religious superior, Fr. Matthew Laser SDS, directed a letter to all belonging to the missionary staff. It was in this letter that Fr. Laser transmitted to those who would be reading it a summary of the development of the political situation, the ordinances of the Apostolic Internuncio, and words of encouragement. The contents of the letter included a proposal to everyone to make a declaration whether to leave or to stay.

After a few weeks a plan of evacuation came into focus. All the young missionary Sisters and the Chinese professed sisters, the candidates, the sick missionary priests, all Brothers, seminarians and novices were to leave in four groups. Only eight of the male missionaries and the five oldest Salvatorian Sisters were to stay behind.[68] Three of those groups left in April, including all the

---

[67] See "Mission in China", *Salvatorianerinnen-Chronik,* 5/4 (1948) 13-15, "Mission in China", *Salvatorianerinnen-Chronik,* September, 5/5 (1949) 11-12.

[68] Cf. *Letter of Mother Olympia H. to Sister Verena J. and Sister Justa H.* of 14.01.1949 (AGSorDS, *China II*); *Circular letter of I. König and M. Laser* from February 7, 1949 (AGS, M -2, coll. 7: 19); *Circular letter of Fr. I. König to the Confreres* of 29.04.1949 (AGSorDS, *China II*).

young missionary Sisters, the remaining Chinese Sisters, two novices and the candidates.[69] Unfortunately, the fourth group, Fr. Peter Hüntemann with the novices, had to go back to Shaowu because their boat ran aground and was seriously damaged. Shaowu was "liberated" on May 20, 1949.

The Sisters continued their missionary activity in the years 1949 and 1950. The new Communist administration did nothing more than a close monitoring of their activity. Sister Elekta was the catechist in Shaowu and took care of the church, Sister Ferdinanda nursed the sick at the parish of Our Lady of Fatima, a mission station at the southern gate of the city, and supervised the work in the kitchen. Sister Dora Schupp was the director of the missionary hospital, located at the main station at the eastern gate of the city.

In Guangze, Sister Adolfina Witmann was the catechist and between 1949 and1952 was acting as the superior for all the Sisters. Sister Kiliana Hornung took care of the sick. At the other stations – Heping, Zhukouzhen [Chükow], Taining and Jianning – the native Sisters of Mother of the Saviour, that is to say, eight professed sisters and four candidates. helped as catechists and caretakers for the sick. Sister Dora was especially busy in Shaowu, since a lot of wounded soldiers from the liberation army were seeking help there. In Guangze, Sister Kiliana was accustomed to treating more than a hundred patients a day.[70] The existing reports from 1950 show that the Sisters did not flag in their great dedication in the work.[71]

---

[69] Some candidates did not receive an entry visa to the U.S. because they suffered tuberculosis. Both novices, Anna Yu and Catherine Tang, completed their novitiate in Milwaukee and made First Profession there on 13.08.1950. Margaret Mary Chiang made First Profession on 13.08.1951 in Milwaukee. Catherine and Margaret worked as missionaries in Taiwan from 1962 to 2010. Margaret died in Ilan-City on 27.04.2010; Catherine lives in Milwaukee. See Sr. Margaret Shekleton SDS, *Bending in Season. History of the North American Province of the Sisters of the Divine Savior 1895 to 1985*, Sisters of the Divine Savior, Milwaukee, 365-366.

[70] See *Letter of I. König to Superior General of 06.03.1949* (AGS, M -2, coll. 6: 11.12); *Letters of I. König to Mother Olympia H.* of 3.6.1949 and 26.08.1949 (AGSorDS, *China II*).

[71] In Shaowu there were 25 orphans in the orphanage. In the small missionary hospital there were registered 281 patients. Medical care also involved 175 surgical events in the operating theatre. They visited the sick in

The year 1950 marked the silver jubilee of the missionary apostolate of the Salvatorian Sisters in China. On this occasion, the Apostolic Prefect, Fr. König, published statistics related to the Sisters' work during the years between 1925 and1950.[72]

In December of 1950, the new administration quite unexpectedly forbade the celebration of worship where the faithful would be participating. They suggested that such liturgical celebrations would "interfere" with the agrarian reform. The prohibition was suspended during the Pentecost in 1951, but imposed again on June 10, 1951 and never revoked since.

At the same time a huge number of soldiers and police were sent to towns and villages. To accommodate them, almost all the buildings from the mission station were gradually confiscated and some equipment – tables, chairs, and so forth – were "borrowed". The missionaries and Sisters were summoned for interrogations and were obliged to write detailed reports of their former activities.[73]

Another unanticipated event was Sister Dora's arrest on September 8, 1951. The accusation was levelled at her that she wilfully killed a young patient, a teacher who was a member of the Communist Party, by injection. At that point the missionary hospital was officially closed. Alone in prison, she celebrated the

---

their homes 2016 times. In Guangze, they baptized 175 people. They nourished and cared for 12 orphans in the orphanage. The Sisters took in 15 wounded and sick for whom they provided care for a period of one year and 178 days. They visited 420 patients at home, prepared dressings 7000 times, and baptized 63 people. Based on *Salvatorianerinnen-Chronik,* 1951, Vol. 5, No. 7, "Mission in China," 30-31.

[72] This record is not complete. From 1935 to 1950, the Sisters baptized 4307 adults in danger of death; and from 1931 to 1950, baptized 3473 children. From 1931 to 1950, the Sisters accepted into the orphanage 543 orphans and from 1939 to 1950 took care of 4068 patients in the mission hospital. From 1939 to 1950, they gave injections 105, 977 times; and from 1936 to 1950 prepared dressings 243 374 times. From 1931 the missionary Sisters visited the sick in their homes 75 240 times. See *Circular letter of I. König* (*25 Jahre SorDS in China*), AGSorDS, *China II*.

[73] C. Lohmann, *In Shaowu seit Dezember 1950 Erlebtes* [*Lived in Shaowu from December 1950*] (AGS, M-2, coll. 2).

25th anniversary of her religious profession on the 6th of January, 1952. She was released on May 12, 1952.[74]

The other sisters and missionaries were placed under house arrest since the 19th of October, 1951, in the former lay teachers' house, situated close to the mission compound. A similar fate befell the missionaries, both men and women, in Guangze.[75]

The year 1952 was the most difficult one. On May 5 the Fr. König and Sister Ferdinanda were suddenly arrested. A few days later a meeting of the so-called "People's Court" was convened in Shaowu, which condemned all the missionaries, both male and female, working in Shaowu to "eternal" exile from China. Additionally, Sister Ferdinanda Gauss was sentenced to seven months in prison and Fr. Inigo König to one year.

Sister Dora departed from Shaowu on May 14th. On December 15th Sisters Adolfina and Kiliana left Guangze; and in a separate transport, Sister Ferdinanda, who was released from the prison in Shaowu. Only Sister Elekta continued to stay under house arrest until February 23, 1953, when she received permission to leave Shaowu.[76]

The missionary work in Shaowu has continued until the present day, by the Chinese Sisters of the Mother of the Saviour (CMS).[77]

---

[74] She described her stay in prison twenty years later in *Kurzbericht über die Chinamission* (1984), 20-25 (AGSorDS, *China II*).

[75] See Elekta Schlusche, *Die letzten Tage in unserer, Mission in China* (AGSorDS, *China II*).

[76] See: Elekta S., *Die letzten Tage in unserer*.

[77] Ten young CMS Sisters and 13 candidates continued their missionary work in the territory of the Apostolic Prefecture of Shaowu according to the report of I. König in 1953. In May 1996, Fr. A. Urbanski, SDS, Secretary General for the Salvatorian mission, met two of them (one sister in Shaowu and another in Guangze). See. *Bericht über I. König Präfektur Shaowu (1949-1953),* 1 (AGS, M-2, coll. 2); A. Urbanski, *A report from our trip to the China Mainland*, 2-3 (AGS, *Taiwan*, RC, 1993-1999).

AFRICA TOMORROW

Subscription Rates for 2015

Address: Jordan University College
P.O. Box 1878, Morogoro, Tanzania

Publication: Twice a year since 2011

	Tanzania	**Rest of Africa**	**Overseas**	
Price per Issue	TZS 3,500	US$ 7	US$ 10	Euro 8
Annual Subscription	TZS 6,500	US$ 13	US$ 19	Euro 15
Two-Years Subscription	TZS 12,500	US$ 25	US$ 37	Euro 28
Three-Years Subscription	TZS 18,000	US$ 36	US$ 54	Euro 41

Subscription are payable to

Account Name: **Jordan University College**
USD Account No.: 025 027 752 7900
EURO Account No.: 195 027 752 7900
TZS Account No.: 015 027 752 7901
Bank Name: CRDB Bank Morogoro - Tanzania, Mandela Branch
SWIFT CODE: CORUTZTZXXX

For more information, please contact the Editor:

salvatorianum@juco.ac.tz, info@juco.ac.tz